



Report to the Plan Commission

December 5, 2011

Legistar I.D. #24668
6601 Odana Road
Demolition Permit

Report Prepared By:
Kevin Firchow, AICP
Planning Division

Requested Action: Approval of a demolition permit to demolish an existing automobile dealership for the purpose of constructing a new automobile dealership.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Section 28.12 (12) provides the guidelines and regulations for the approval of demolition permits.

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission consider this proposal, testimony at the public hearing, and the applicable approval standards. Should the Commission find that the standards are met, the request to demolish an auto dealership for the purpose of constructing a new auto dealership at 6601 Odana Road should be approved subject to the conditions recommended by reviewing agencies, below. Should the Plan Commission find that the standards are not met, this item could be referred to allow the applicant to work with staff to revise the plans.

Background Information

Applicant: Amanda Steinle; CenterPoint Integrate Solutions, LLC; 1240 Bergen Parkway Suite A-250; Evergreen CO 80439

Contact: Travis Schreiber; Vierbicher and Associates; 999 Fourier Drive, Suite 201; Madison, WI

Property Owner: Boucher Properties, 4141 South 108th Street; Greenfield, WI 53228

Proposal: The applicant proposes to demolish an existing automobile dealership for the purpose of constructing a new automobile dealership. A development schedule has not been specified.

Parcel Location: The subject property is a 4.85 acre parcel fronting on Odana Road, located east of its intersection with Grand Canyon Drive. The site backs onto the West Beltline Highway. The property is within Aldermanic District 19 and the Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions: The site includes a vacant one-story car dealership building, sited roughly at the center of the site. Further information related to the condition of the building and the demolition approval standards are included within the report.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

North: Market Square Commercial Development; zoned C3L (Commercial Service and Distribution District);

East: Auto Dealership, zoned C3L;

South: Beltline Highway with commercial development beyond; and

West: Hotel, with other retail development beyond, zoned C3L.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan recommends general commercial uses for the subject site and much of the surrounding area. The Southwest Neighborhood Plan does not provide

specific redevelopment recommendations for the subject property but generally recommends that when areas such as the Odana Road commercial corridor redevelop, the principles of traditional neighborhood design should be incorporated to bring buildings closer to the street and provide pedestrian and bicycle amenities.

Environmental Corridor Status: This property is not located within a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Zoning Summary: The property is zoned C3L (Commercial Service and Distribution District) Zoning comments were not provided in time to be included in this report.

Project Description, Evaluation, & Conclusion

The applicant, CarMax, requests approval to demolish an existing automobile dealership for the purpose of constructing a new dealership. This proposal is subject to the demolition standards of 28.12 (12) of the Zoning Ordinance.

Existing Conditions

The subject site is located between Odana Road and the West Beltline Highway, just east of Odana Road's intersection with Grand Canyon Drive.

The site now includes a vacant auto dealership, featuring a one-story, 27,000 square foot structure previously occupied by Gordie Boucher Lincoln Mitsubishi. The current structure is setback roughly 90 feet from Odana Road. Interior and exterior photos of the building are provided. These can be viewed online at http://www.cityofmadison.com/planning/projects/reports/6601or_photos.pdf

While no information is provided indicating the building is not structurally sound or capable of being rehabilitated, the applicant indicates the layout of the existing building and site does not meet their operational requirements.

The City's Preservation Planner has not raised any objections to the proposed demolition.

Proposed Future Use

The proposed CarMax dealership includes a 20,600 square foot building, located roughly at the center of the site. A 125-stall customer and employee parking lot is located between the building and the street. An internal six (6) foot-wide sidewalk connects the Odana Road sidewalk to the building, which is setback 220 feet from the front property line. The front parking area is screened from the street by a heavily landscaped yard, measuring roughly 21 feet in width. The lot includes 14 canopy trees with a variety of smaller plantings interspersed. Staff recommend that the trees are planted with a minimum caliper of 2 ½ inches and have a minimum canopy height of 6 feet at the time of planting. A 40-foot wide landscape buffer is required along the Beltline Highway frontage and the proposed buffer is 10 feet wider than what is there today. A series of deciduous shrubs would be provided in that area, adjacent to the parking lot.

The letter of intent notes that part of the applicant's operation strategy is to separate the for-sale vehicle display area from other parking. The for-sale vehicles would be parked along the eastern and southern sides of the property as shown on the attached plans. Street access to the display area is limited through a mechanical gate. A three-foot tall metal highway-style guard rail is proposed to surround the display area. This guard rail is screened by landscaping and an ornamental fence along the Odana Road frontage. Staff note that this is an unusual feature and encourages the applicant to eliminate the feature or find a different way to secure the sales area.

The proposed one-story building is 26 feet in height. There are two taller peaked roofs over the main building entrances. The north (Odana Road) and east facades are predominantly glass along the lowest 10 feet of the building, with the balance of the structure clad in earth-toned split-face block.

Evaluation

The Plan Commission will be reviewing this proposal against the demolition standards of the Zoning Ordinance. Approving the project requires a finding that the demolition and proposed future use are compatible with both the intent and purpose of the C3L (Commercial Service and Distribution) zoning district and the purpose of the demolition standards of Section 28.12).

Regarding the first part of that standard, staff believe a finding can be made that an automobile dealership is compatible with the underlying zoning. The proposed use is permitted under the property's C3L (Commercial Service and Distribution District) zoning. This district allows a wide range of retail, service, wholesale, warehouse, and distribution activities.

Consideration, however, should be given to the Demolition and Removal section's statement of purpose. That section states:

It is hereby declared a matter of public policy that the good maintenance and rehabilitation of existing buildings, the preservation of safe and sanitary housing available at reasonable prices, and the careful consideration and planning of changes in the urban landscape are a public necessity and are required in the interest of the health, prosperity, safety, and welfare of the people. The purpose of this section is to aid in the implementation of adopted City plans, protect neighborhood character, preserve historic buildings, encourage the reuse and/or relocation of existing buildings, discourage buildings falling into a state of severe disrepair from lack of maintenance by the owner, encourage compliance with building and minimum housing codes, and allow the property owner to have a decision on approval or disapproval of the proposed use of the property before he or she takes the irrevocable step of demolishing or moving his or her existing building or buildings.

When making a finding on whether a proposal is compatible with the above-referenced purpose statement, the Plan Commission can consider and may give decisive weight to any relevant facts including the impacts the proposal would have on the normal and orderly development and improvement of surrounding properties. The approval standards also state that the proposed use should be consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and adopted neighborhood plans.

The proposed site plan includes a deep front building setback with a large parking area to the front. While the surrounding context is fairly auto-oriented, the proposed 220 foot setback is deeper than that found on most surrounding properties. The adjacent automobile dealership is setback approximately 50 feet from Odana Road, with one bay of parking located between the building and Odana Road. The Market Square Shopping Center, located directly across the street, is setback between 130 and 180

feet, with parking between the building and street. The only building to exceed the proposed setback is a large format multi-tenant commercial building roughly 1,500 west of this site. That property, located at the intersection of Odana Road and Platte Drive, is setback nearly 450 feet from the street, though smaller buildings are located along much of the Odana Road frontage.

While adopted plans support auto-oriented development at this location, the proposed setback exceeds, in some cases significantly, that of the surrounding auto-oriented uses. The Comprehensive Plan recommends this district for “general commercial” development. That recommendation includes automobile-oriented uses and “heavy” commercial uses with appearance or operational characteristics not generally compatible with residential or small-scale commercial activities. The plan includes some general design policies discouraging conventional suburban-style development and encouraging pedestrian-oriented designs. (p. 2-54, Goal and Objective 64). The Southwest Neighborhood Plan, adopted in 2008, does not provide detailed redevelopment recommendations for the subject property but generally recommends that when areas such as the Odana Road commercial corridor redevelop, the principles of traditional neighborhood design should be incorporated to bring buildings closer to the street and provide pedestrian and bicycle amenities. (p. 91 – Land Use Principles for the Northern Portion of the Southwest Study Area)

Considering the surrounding context, staff have encouraged the applicant to consider site plan alternatives that reduce the building setback and the amount of parking located between the building and the street. Planning Division staff raised initial concerns on the proposed layout with the applicant’s representative during the week of November 7 and again prior to the finalization of this report. Staff understands the proposed plans represent the applicant’s preferred approach. Staff had hoped to discuss potential site plan alternative(s) prior to the Plan Commission meeting, though understand the applicant wanted to review the staff report prior to commenting further. Previously, the applicant indicated that they would address the site plan concerns at the December 5 Plan Commission meeting. At the time of report writing staff is not aware whether CarMax would be willing to support an alternate design or whether any revisions would available prior to the December 5 meeting.

Conclusion

Staff do not object to the continued use of this site as an automobile dealership. While auto-oriented uses are consistent with adopted plans, staff has some concerns regarding the proposed site plan as the reconfigured site provides over 100 additional feet of surface parking between the building and Odana Road compared to the existing dealership. The general design policies and recommendations in adopted plans generally support reduced building setbacks. The Plan Commission will need to determine whether the development, as proposed, meets the applicable demolition approval standards.

Recommendation and Proposed Conditions of Approval

Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Kevin Firchow, 267-1150)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission consider this proposal, testimony at the public hearing, and the applicable approval standards. Should the Commission find that the standards are met, the request to demolish an auto dealership for the purpose of constructing a new auto dealership at 6601 Odana Road should be approved subject to the conditions recommended by reviewing agencies, below. Should the Plan Commission find that the standards are not met, this item could be referred to allow the applicant to work with staff to revise the plans.

1. That the canopy trees proposed along Odana Road are planted with a minimum caliper of 2 ½ inches and have minimum canopy height of 6 feet at the time of planting.
2. INFORMATIONAL NOTE: Signage is not approved by the Plan Commission. Signage must be reviewed for compliance with Chapter 31 Sign Codes of the Madison General Ordinances. Signage permits are issued by the Zoning Section of the Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development.

City Engineering Division (Contact Janet Dailey, 261-9688)

3. Provide additional details and calculations for the proposed storm sewer and stormwater management system. Storm sewer design must be stamped by a professional engineer.
4. The approved address for the new sales building is 6601 Odana Road and car wash building is 6609 Odana Road.
5. Provide recorded copies of the appropriate lease and/or deed, whichever is the intent, to Engineering Mapping for proper billing updates to Stormwater Utility site impervious areas.
6. The applicant shall close all abandoned driveways by replacing the curb in front of the driveways and restoring the terrace with grass. (POLICY)
7. All work in the public right-of-way shall be performed by a City licensed contractor. (MGO 16.23(9)(c)5) and MGO 23.01)
8. All street tree locations and tree species within the right of way shall be reviewed and approved by City Forestry. Please submit a tree planting plan (in PDF format) to Dean Kahl, of the City Parks Department - dkahl@cityofmadison.com or 266-4816. Approval and permitting of any tree removal or replacement shall be obtained from the City Forester and/or the Board of Public Works prior to the approval of the site plan. (POLICY)
9. All damage to the pavement on Odana Road, adjacent to this development shall be restored in accordance with the City of Madison's Pavement Patching Criteria. For additional information please see the following link: <http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/patchingCriteria.cfm> (POLICY)
10. The plan set shall be revised to show a proposed private internal drainage system on the site. This information shall include the depths and locations of structures and the type of pipe to be used. POLICY AND MGO 10.29
11. The applicant shall demonstrate compliance with Section 37.07 and 37.08 of the Madison General Ordinances regarding permissible soil loss rates. The erosion control plan shall include Universal Soil Loss Equation (USLE) computations for the construction period. Measures shall be implemented in order to maintain a soil loss rate below 7.5-tons per acre per year.
12. Prior to approval, this project shall comply with Chapter 37 of the Madison General Ordinances regarding stormwater management. Specifically, this development is required to a) Control 40% TSS (20 micron particle) off of new paved surfaces; b) Provide oil & grease control from the first 1/2" of runoff from parking areas; and c) Complete an erosion control plan and complete weekly

self-inspection of the erosion control practices and post these inspections to the City of Madison website – as required by Chapter 37 of the Madison General Ordinances. Stormwater management plans shall be submitted and approved by City Engineering prior to signoff.

13. The applicant shall submit, prior to plan sign-off, a digital CAD file (single file) to the Engineering Program Specialist in the Engineering Division (Lori Zenchenko). The digital CAD file shall be to scale and represent final construction. The single CAD file submittal can be either AutoCAD (dwg) Version 2001 or older, MicroStation (dgn) Version J or older, or Universal (dxf) format and contain only the following data, each on a separate layer name/level number: a) Building Footprints; b) Internal Walkway Areas; c) Internal Site Parking Areas; d) Other Miscellaneous Impervious Areas (i.e. gravel, crushed stone, bituminous/asphalt, concrete, etc.); e) Right-of-Way lines (public and private); f) All Underlying Lot lines or parcel lines if unplatted; g) Lot numbers or the words “unplatted”; h) Lot/Plat dimensions; i) Street names; and All other levels (contours, elevations, etc) are not to be included with this file submittal.

NOTE: Email file transmissions preferred addressing@cityofmadison.com. Include the site address in the subject line of this transmittal. Any changes or additions to the location of the building, sidewalks, parking/pavement during construction will require a new CAD file. (POLICY and MGO 37.09(2) & 37.05(4))

14. The applicant shall submit, prior to plan sign-off, digital PDF files to the Engineering Division (Jeff Benedict or Tim Troester). The digital copies shall be to scale, and shall have a scale bar on the plan set. (POLICY and MGO 37.09(2)) PDF submittals shall contain the following information: a) Building footprints; b) Internal walkway areas; c) Internal site parking areas; d) Lot lines and right-of-way lines; e) Street names; f) Stormwater Management Facilities; and g) Detail drawings associated with Stormwater Management Facilities (including if applicable planting plans).
15. The Applicant shall submit prior to plan sign-off, electronic copies of any Stormwater Management Files including: a) SLAMM DAT files; b) RECARGA files; c) TR-55/HYDROCAD/etc; and d) Sediment loading calculations. If calculations are done by hand or are not available electronically the hand copies or printed output shall be scanned to a PDF file and provided. (POLICY and MGO 37.09(2))
16. The applicant's utility contractor shall obtain a connection permit and excavation permit prior to commencing the storm sewer construction. MGO 37.05(7) This permit application is available on line at <http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/permits.cfm>.
17. All outstanding Madison Metropolitan Sewerage District (MMSD) and City of Madison sanitary sewer connection charges are due and payable prior Engineering sign-off, unless otherwise collected with a Developer's / Subdivision Contract. Contact Janet Dailey (608-261-9688) to obtain the final MMSD billing a minimum of two (2) working days prior to requesting City Engineering signoff. (MGO 16.23(9)(d)(4))

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact Bryan Walker, 267-8754)

18. The applicant shall be responsible for securing all proper permits and approvals from any municipality or government unit having jurisdiction with the project. In particular, the applicant shall contact David Kreitzmann, Wisconsin Department of Transportation (608-516-6497), with site plans sets for review and approval. The applicant shall return a set of site plans or letter with WDOT-approved copies to the City of Madison Traffic Engineering Division prior to final sign-off on site plans.
19. The parking stalls for the sales display area will need to conform to MGO 10.08 parking design standards. Currently, the plan shows drive aisle widths in the display area as being too narrow according to the ordinance. If necessary, stacked parking may be used in the display area only in order to accommodate the necessary inventory of vehicles as long as the parking stalls are designed in accordance with MGO 10.08.
20. The parking stalls for the sales display area will need to conform to MGO 10.08 parking design standards. Currently, the plan shows drive aisle widths in the display area as being too narrow according to the ordinance. If necessary, stacked parking may be used in the display area only in order to accommodate the necessary inventory of vehicles as long as the parking stalls are designed in accordance with MGO 10.08.
21. The car wash shall be used by employees only and not by the public, and be noted on the plans when submitted for approval.
22. When the applicant submits final plans of one contiguous plan for approval, the applicant shall show the following: items in the terrace as existing (e.g., signs and street light poles), type of surfaces, existing property lines, addresses, showing all easements, all pavement markings, building placement, and stalls, adjacent driveway approaches to lots on either side and across the street, signage, percent of slope, vehicle routes, dimensions of radii, aisles, driveways, stalls including the two (2) feet overhang, and a scaled drawing at 1" = 20'.
23. The developer shall post a deposit and reimburse the City for all costs associated with any modifications to Traffic Signals, Street Lighting, Signing and Pavement Marking, and conduit and handholes, including labor, engineering and materials for both temporary and permanent installations.
24. Public signing and marking related to the development may be required by the City Traffic Engineer for which the developer shall be financially responsible.

Zoning Administrator (Contact Pat Anderson, 266-5978)

Comments were not received in time to be included in this report.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, 261-9658)

25. The Madison Fire Department does not object to this proposal provided the project complies with all applicable fire codes and ordinances.
26. Provide fire apparatus access as required by IFC 503 2009 edition, MGO 34.503.

Water Utility (Contact Dennis Cawley, 261-9243)

27. The Madison Water Utility shall be notified to remove the water meter prior to demolition. This property is not in a Wellhead Protection District. All wells located on this property shall be abandoned if no valid well operation permit has been obtained from the Madison Water Utility.

Metro Transit (Contact Tim Sobota, 261-4289)

This agency did not submit a response for this request.