

PLANNING DIVISION REPORT
DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND COMMUNITY
AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
Of November 28, 2007

RE: I.D. # 07762: Zoning Map Amendment I.D. 3322& 3323, Rezoning 115 W. Doty Street from PUD-SIP to Amended PUD-GDP-SIP

1. Requested Actions: Approval of a request to rezone 115 W. Doty Street from Planned Unit Development, Specific Implementation Plan (PUD-SIP) to Amended Planned Unit Development, General Development Plan, Specific Implementation Plan (PUD-GDP-SIP) to allow construction of a 50-foot radio tower on the roof of the Public Safety Building.
2. Applicable Regulations: Section 28.07 (6) of the Zoning Ordinance provides the requirements and framework for Planned Unit Developments; Section 28.12 (9) provides the process for zoning map amendments.
3. Report Prepared By: Timothy M. Parks, Planner.

GENERAL INFORMATION

1. Applicant & Property: Dane County c/o John Welch, Dane County Public Works Dept.; 1919 Alliant Energy Center Way; Madison.
2. Development Schedule: The applicants wish to commence construction as soon as all regulatory approvals have been granted.
3. Location: An approximately 0.96-acre site located on the south side of W. Doty Street between S. Fairchild and S. Carroll streets, Aldermanic District 4; Madison Metropolitan School District.
4. Existing Conditions: The site is developed with the four-story Dane County Public Safety Building, zoned PUD-SIP.
5. Proposed Land Use: The County wishes to add a 50-foot tall metal lattice radio tower to the roof of the existing building to serve the County's Emergency Operations Center.
6. Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:
North: Baskerville Condominiums; Anchor Bank, zoned C4 (Central Commercial District);
South: Multi-family residential buildings along W. Wilson Street, zoned R6 (General Residence District);

East: City-County Building, zoned C4;

West: Dane County Courthouse, zoned PUD-SIP

7. Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan the subject site and surrounding area as part of the "Downtown Core" downtown mixed-use sub-district, which encourages a variety of land uses in the downtown area, including government and institutional uses.
8. Environmental Corridor Status: The property is not located within a mapped environmental corridor.
9. Public Utilities & Services: The property is served by a full range of urban services.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

This application is subject to the standards for Planned Unit Development Districts.

ANALYSIS, EVALUATION & CONCLUSION

Dane County is requesting approval of a major alteration to the approved PUD-GDP-SIP for the Public Safety Building located at 115 W. Doty Street to allow the addition of a 50-foot tall radio tower for the County's Emergency Operations Center (EOC). In addition to the EOC, the Public Safety Building houses the County Sheriff's Office, County jail and coroner facilities. The facility includes four stories above the grade of W. Doty Street with two basement levels that are partially exposed along the southerly side of the building facing W. Wilson Street. The building also contains a fifth story mechanical penthouse that occupies approximately half of the space above the fourth floor. A raised parking deck extends between the south wall of the building and W. Wilson Street.

Currently, the existing building stands 50 feet, 8 inches in height above W. Doty Street as measured to the top of the fourth floor and 63 feet, 10 inches to the top of the mechanical penthouse. When approved in 1992, the specific implementation plan for the Public Safety Building included conceptual plans for the addition of three full floors above an enlarged mechanical floor, bringing the overall height of the building up to eight stories with an approximate overall height of 118 feet above W. Doty Street.

The proposed EOC radio tower will be located on the roof of the current fifth floor mechanical penthouse adjacent to an elevator equipment room. The tower will be a metal lattice structure anchored by four guy wires located equidistant from one another on the penthouse roof. The top of the tower will stand approximately 119 feet above W. Doty Street along the north wall of the

building, noting though that the grade of W. Doty Street falls slightly from S. Carroll Street west towards S. Hamilton Street, which results in a slightly taller building at the northwest corner than at the northeast. The letter of intent indicates that the height and placement of the tower will not require any special markings or lighting and will be located below the Capitol View Preservation limits as well as the heights of nearby buildings. Dane County indicates that the proposed EOC radio tower will improve radio capacity and signal coverage, provide cellular phone amplification within the Public Safety Building and will reduce radio interference.

The County included some exhibits with the proposed tower superimposed on photos of the Public Safety Building to give an indication of how visible the tower will be from surrounding streets. These photos suggest that the rather slim profile of the tower will have a minimal visual impact on the horizon in the area surrounding the subject site.

At the request of staff, the County has researched alternatives to placing the EOC tower on the roof of the Public Safety Building. The alternatives explored included the placement of the EOC radio equipment on the roof of the City-County Building located across S. Carroll Street from the Public Safety Building or on the roof of the new Dane County Courthouse located next door at the corner of W. Doty Street and S. Hamilton Street. Both of these alternatives would require the remote control of the EOC radio tower, which the County indicates would have a detrimental on the operation of the EOC. Among the factors cited, remote control of the tower would be more complex and costly, lack redundancy in the event of failure and in the case of both the City-County Building and County Courthouse, require high profile towers on those buildings in order for the radio system to function as required. In the case of the County Courthouse, the County indicates that a high profile tower would be required on that building to allow the EOC signal to be sufficiently separated from other horizontal radio signals. Such a tower would require FAA markings and lighting and would exceed the Capitol View Preservation limits.

The County also looked at placing two 25-foot towers on the fourth floor roof of the Public Safety Building as an alternative to the single 50-foot tower proposed. The letter of intent indicates that this option has a number of shortcomings, including the lack of redundancy, cost, engineering challenges and the interference nearby taller buildings would have on the strength of the EOC signal. The applicant also indicates that the two shorter towers would need to be placed closer to the edges of the building in order for the towers to be sufficiently separated from one another and that this proximity to the parapet would have a greater aesthetic impact on the downtown skyline and building than the single, taller tower located near the center of the roof.

The Urban Design Commission reviewed the project on October 17, 2007 and recommended final approval of this major alteration (see attached report). During their review, members of the UDC expressed a general dissatisfaction with the design of the tower but acquiesced that the tower was likely an interim solution until such time as the Public Safety Building is vertically

expended as conceptually shown on the current specific implementation plan for the facility. The County acknowledged that they will attempt to integrate the EOC radio tower into the design of an expanded Public Safety Building should that project ever proceed.

The Planning Division shares many of the concerns expressed by the Urban Design Commission over the proposed EOC radio antenna. However, staff recognizes the County's need for the tower as an integral part of County-wide communications in the event of an emergency and acknowledges the advantages to having the tower located on the same building as the facility it serves. In addition, while the proposed tower increases visual clutter, staff feels it has been designed to be less visually obtrusive than other public safety-related antennas located on nearby buildings, including the high-profile monopole tower located on the roof of the City-County Building.

The Planning Division encourages Dane County to carefully study the integration of the EOC radio tower into the design of a possible future expansion of the Public Safety Building so that such facilities can be more integrated into the building's architecture and site planning.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission forward Zoning Map Amendment 3322 & 3323, rezoning 115 W. Doty Street from Planned Unit Development, Specific Implementation Plan (PUD-SIP) to Amended Planned Unit Development, General Development Plan, Specific Implementation Plan (PUD-GDP-SIP), to the Common Council with a recommendation of **approval**, subject to input at the public hearing and the following conditions:

1. Comments from reviewing agencies.
2. That the zoning text for the planned unit development be amended per Planning Division approval to identify radio towers and antennas as permitted accessory uses.

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: October 17, 2007
TITLE: 115 West Doty Street – Public Building, Communications Tower. 4 th Ald. Dist. (07752)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: October 17, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Bonnie Cosgrove, Richard Slayton, Bruce Woods, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Jay Ferm, John Harrington and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 17, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a communications tower on a public building located at 115 West Doty Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were John Welch, Dane County Public Works Engineering, and Robert Holloway. The project provides for the installation of a radio communications tower atop of the Public Safety Building for use by the Dane County Emergency Management, Emergency Operations Center which provides command and control functions of local and county government during a response to major emergencies or disasters. According to the letter of intent, a metal lattice, guy-wired tower is proposed that will extend 50-feet above the elevator shaft of the Public Safety Building approximately 70-85 feet above the adjacent ground floor level. The tower is necessitated with the location of the control center located within the safety building, which lies between the adjacent taller Dane County Courthouse and City-County Building. The tower will be 8-feet above the height of the Dane County Courthouse and 6-feet above the adjacent City-County Building. Robert Holloway from The Capital Neighborhoods spoke in favor of the project, noting that the impact is not likely to impose problems with people in the neighborhood, with other buildings in the neighborhood, therefore in support.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Concern with precedent with creating a demand for more communication towers in the downtown area.
- Tower elements are add-on to project, should see as part of the original approval of the “public building;” this could be integrated such as spires or other architectural elements.
- Guy wires are a bothersome issue; consider alternatives.
- The Public Safety Building is not done yet. It was intended to provide for future vertical expansion. When building does go higher issue should be dealt with in a more architectural manner. The placement of courthouse next to it helps create the current problem.

ACTION:

On a motion by Woods, seconded by Host-Jablonski, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-3) with Harrington, Barnett and P. Wagner voting no. The motion noted that this consideration is a stopgap measure for a building located in a bowl; any future expansion of building communication towers should be integrated as part of the architecture of the vertical expansion.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 2, 4, 4, 4 and 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 115 West Doty Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	4	-	-	-	4
	-	-	-	5	-	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	4	-	-	5	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-
	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	2
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4

General Comments:

- Unsightly addition to the downtown.
- Really, there ought to be integration of spire elements with the architecture, especially on public buildings. This one looks like a dumb old ham radio antenna.
- Given the limitations of the existing building, this is acceptable. Any future projects should anticipate community needs, not deal with them after the fact.
- Poor solution for our one true urban condition.
- The tower is necessary but the anchoring engineering of these towers need much more creative thought.



Department of Public Works
City Engineering Division

608 266 4751

Larry D. Nelson, P.E.
City Engineer

City-County Building, Room 115
210 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard
Madison, Wisconsin 53703
608 264 9275 FAX
1 866 704 2315 Textnet

Deputy City Engineer
Robert F. Phillips, P.E.

Principal Engineers
Michael R. Dalley, P.E.
Christina M. Bachmann, P.E.
John S. Fahrney, P.E.
Gregory T. Fries, P.E.

Facilities & Sustainability
Jeanne E. Hoffman, Manager
James C. Whitney, A.I.A.

Operations Manager
Kathleen M. Cryan

Hydrogeologist
Joseph L. DeMorett, P.G.

GIS Manager
David A. Davis, R.L.S.

Financial Officer
Steven B. Danner-Rivers

DATE: November 19, 2007
TO: Plan Commission
FROM: Larry D. Nelson, P.E., City Engineer
SUBJECT: *for* 115 West Doty Street Rezoning

The City Engineering Division has reviewed the subject development and has the following comments.

MAJOR OR NON-STANDARD REVIEW COMMENTS (Comments which are special to the project and/or may require additional work beyond a standard, more routine project.)

1. N/A

GENERAL OR STANDARD REVIEW COMMENTS

In addition, we offer the following General or Standard Review Comments: NO COMMENTS





Traffic Engineering and Parking Divisions

David C. Dryer, P.E., City Traffic Engineer and Parking Manager

Suite 100
215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard
P.O. Box 2986
Madison, Wisconsin 53701-2986
PH 608 266 4761
TTY 866-704-2315
FAX 608 267 1158

November 20, 2007

TO: Plan Commission

FROM: David C. Dryer, P.E., City Traffic Engineer and Parking Manager

SUBJECT: **115 West Doty Street – Rezoning – PUD (GDP-SIP) to Amended PUD (GDP-SIP)
– Erect 50 ft Tall Antenna on Top Public Safety Building**

The City Traffic Engineering Division has reviewed the subject development and has the following comments.

MAJOR OR NON-STANDARD REVIEW COMMENTS (Comments which are special to the project and/or may require additional work beyond a standard, more routine project.)

1. None

PEDESTRIAN AND BICYCLE TRANSPORTATION REVIEW COMMENTS

2. None

GENERAL OR STANDARD REVIEW COMMENTS

In addition, we offer the following General or Standard Review Comments:

3. None

Please contact John Leach, City Traffic Engineering at 267-8755 if you have questions regarding the above items:

Contact Person: John Walsh
Fax: 267-1533
Email: welsh@co.dane.wi.us

DCD: DJM: dm



CITY OF MADISON FIRE DEPARTMENT

Fire Prevention Division

325 W. Johnson St., Madison, WI 53703-2295
Phone: 608-266-4484 ♦ FAX: 608-267-1153

DATE: November 27, 2007
TO: Plan Commission
FROM: Edwin J. Ruckriegel, Fire Marshal
SUBJECT: **115 W. Doty Street**

The City of Madison Fire Department (MFD) has reviewed the subject development and has the following comments:

MAJOR OR NON-STANDARD REVIEW COMMENTS (Comments which are special to the project and/or may require additional work beyond a standard, more routine project.)

None

GENERAL OR STANDARD REVIEW COMMENTS

In addition, we offer the following General or Standard Review Comments:

None for tower installation.

Please contact Scott Strassburg, New Construction Inspector at 608-261-9843 if you have questions regarding the above items.

cc: Bill Sullivan