From:Ethington, Ruth on behalf of PlanningTo:Scanlon, Amy; Heiser-Ertel, LaurenSubject:FW: Confederate Monument at Forest HillDate:Tuesday, July 24, 2018 8:50:23 AM

From: Virginia Scholtz [mailto:

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 8:04 AM

To: Planning <planning@cityofmadison.com> Subject: Confederate Monument at Forest Hill

Dear Committee

I have marched for equal right and other social justice causes. I work for voter rights and believe in our democracy and in the worth and dignity of each person in our world.

The young men buried 150 years ago were possibly staunch idealists on the wrong side of history –

Or they may have been stuck in the arguments of their elders as so many of our military personnel have been over the centuries.

Experiencing the battle fields at Gettysburg and the stark rows of white markers at Arlington National Cemetery

has made me see that the lesson of remembering our war dead is to understand the real cost of war: the loss of family and loved ones on either side.

Even though I oppose war in most any situation, I believe the lost loved ones always deserve honor and respect.

I would keep the Confederate monument in place.

Forest Hill Cemetery is a U.S. National Cemetery. It serves us all. the Confederate dead are part of the history of the county and of our state. The respectful interment of these dead is part of our national heritage so eloquently anointed at Gettysburg.

Thanks for considering my opinion on this matter.

Virginia

Virginia Scholtz

Madison, WI 53704

From:	Scanlon, Amy
To:	Heiser-Ertel, Lauren
Subject:	FW: Contact City of Madison Planning
Date:	Monday, July 23, 2018 6:54:53 PM

From: noreply@cityofmadison.com <noreply@cityofmadison.com>
Sent: Monday, July 23, 2018 6:34 PM
To: Scanlon, Amy <AScanlon@cityofmadison.com>
Cc: Ethington, Ruth <REthington@cityofmadison.com>
Subject: Contact City of Madison Planning

The following contact request was received:

Name: John Brashi
Address:
, Madison Wi
Madison, WI 53704
Phone:
Email:
Subject: Historic Preservation Planning

Message:

Please do not remove the Forest Hill Civil War Confederate monument. It is not about racism but such an important part of American history that should not be forgotten. Martin Luther King was "very" outspoken against gay marriages (racism). Should we change the name of Martin Luther King Drive? I think so. From:Scanlon, AmyTo:Heiser-Ertel, LaurenSubject:FW: Are your stones big enough?Date:Tuesday, July 24, 2018 10:38:59 AMAttachments:image001.png

From: Stu Levitan < > >
Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 10:23 AM
To: Scanlon, Amy <AScanlon@cityofmadison.com>
Cc: David Blaska < >
Subject: Fw: Are your stones big enough?

Amy Please file this with the correspondence in Legistar. thanks Stu

On Tuesday, July 24, 2018 10:15 AM, David Blaska < > wrote:

How did they get to you, Stu? How were you mau-maued? Race card delivered to your door? Not invited to the faculty cocktail party? When did you decide to be a liberal first and an historian second?

https://davidblaska.com/2018/07/23/moral-preening-called-out-confederate-rest-stone-livesfor-another-day/

If you truck away this grave marker (for that is what it is; some of it paid for by their survivors) what other tombstone is safe? I am offended by the huge cenotaph marking Charles Van Hise nearby. https://davidblaska.com/2017/08/22/if-the-uw-seeks-to-root-out-long-ago-racism-try-

https://davidblaska.com/2017/08/22/if-the-uw-seeks-to-root-out-long-ago-racism-try exhuming-your-progressive-professors/

Is this what you want for your legacy, Stu? For my blogge.



David Blaska

Madison, WI 53711

Visit me at **Stately Blaska Manor** at <u>www.davidblaska.com</u> **Support the Island Church** <u>www.theislandchurch.org</u>

From:	Scanlon, Amy
To:	Heiser-Ertel, Lauren
Subject:	FW: Confederate Rest monument statusmilitary history volunteer
Date:	Wednesday, July 25, 2018 11:32:38 AM

On Wednesday, July 25, 2018 10:36 AM, Monica Brist <

> wrote:

Hello. I am a resident of Madison, living in the Nakoma neighborhood. I have watched with great dismay the embarrassing and sad way our city failed to really address from both a historic and political/policy perspective a good resolution to the controversy over the confederate rest monument at Forest Hill. I have noted with relief and gratitude that the landmarks commission seems to be a voice of reason and has dealt in a thoughtful and deliberative fashion about this issue. It is neither simple nor impossible to sort out. I am writing with suggestions and a volunteer recommendation.

Our family has a history with the Confederate rest and an interest in maintaining its historic significance while addressing the need to provide a more appropriate perspective for visitors. Members of the Brist family served in Wisconsin's Iron Brigade for the Union in the Civil War, When our son, Ben Brist, was in high school, his Eagle Scout project consisted of doing research on the graves at confederate rest, cleaning/restoring the headstones and creating a brochure for the City Parks department for use at Forest Hill that described the history of the burial ground. The City Parks department had that brochure and used it for some time at the cemetery. If you need a copy I am sure I can find it.

Our son went on to graduate from the United States Military Academy at West Point, with a double major in military history and russian language. His major thesis received special recognition by the West Point History Department. Ben is a 2nd Lieutenant and has just finished Ranger School at Ft Benning Gerogia and is awaiting his orders to report to the 82nd Airborne at Ft Bragg, North Carolina. He remains a permanent resident of Madison.

Ben was in Ranger school while most of this controversy was raging about the cemetery. He believes that it would be both possible and appropriate to create a new marker that is respectful to those buried there, The UW did a fine job creating historical information about Camp Randall. A brouchure could again be developed as well. If it would be helpful, he would like to volunteer his time to help with such an effort.

If this would be of interest and help to the Commission, please let me know and I will give you Ben's contact information. You are welcome to share this information with other members of the Commission as you think may be appropriate,

Thank you,

Monica Burkert-Brist

From:	Scanlon, Amy
То:	Heiser-Ertel, Lauren
Subject:	FW: Contact City of Madison Planning
Date:	Wednesday, July 25, 2018 12:53:08 PM

From: noreply@cityofmadison.com <noreply@cityofmadison.com>
Sent: Wednesday, July 25, 2018 12:16 PM
To: Scanlon, Amy <AScanlon@cityofmadison.com>
Cc: Ethington, Ruth <REthington@cityofmadison.com>
Subject: Contact City of Madison Planning

The following contact request was received:

Name: Coleen Burns Company/Organization: None Address: Madison, WI 53719

Email: Subject: Historic Preservation Planning

Message:

Phone:

I oppose the removal of the Confederate monument listing the names of those buried in "Confederate Rest." They died in Wisconsin while under our care/imprisonment. This should not be forgotten. The woman who cared for these graves, as far as I know, did so privately and without public support of enslavement of peoples, the Confederate government, or the denigration of any government/race/culture. Many US veterans are buried outside the borders of our country. I want them to be remembered. It may be appropriate to add a plaque with bacground history on the United Daughters of the Confederacy and to explain that the decision to retain the monument is not an endorsement of this organization or their views.

From:	Scanlon, Amy
То:	Heiser-Ertel, Lauren
Subject:	FW: Confederate landmarks
Date:	Wednesday, July 25, 2018 3:35:25 PM

Our family donated my great great grandfather's Civil War diaries to Virginia Tech's Civil War Studies Dept. I have thought a lot about those poor Confederate soldiers buried in Forest Hill Cemetery. They died from disease, from wounds, or both, far from homes and families who loved them. Reading my great great grandfather's diaries, I think his Union experiences could also be Confederate soldiers' experiences: rain, mud, uniforms that did not fit, shoes that did not fit, ammunition that did not work, food that was not very good if they had it at all, marching, exhaustion, sometimes a letter from home, illness, and yes, the fighting and the trail of death and destruction left behind. Did any soldier want to live that nightmare? Did the Confederate boys (and yes, they were just boys) fight because they wanted to or because they were poor boys who couldn't buy their way out of it? (Yes, that happened in the Civil War). Did they miss their loved ones and wish to see them and have the awful war behind them? Of course they did.

Now because of a few people who are very vocal and not very interested in our REAL history, the Landmarks Commission is on the verge of eliminating even a semblance of recognition for these young men who died so far from home? I think it's a disgrace and I hope that the Commission will vote to retain the markers and now bow to pressure.

I hope that this email can be shared with the Commission when they gather on Monday.

Thank you. Noël Ferguson Mt. Hope, WI July 25, 2018

The Madison Landmarks Commission 126 S. Hamilton St. Madison, WI 53703

I would like very much for the entire commission to read my letter. I understand that the recommendation to remove the cemetery Confederate Memorial will be considered by your group. I did contact my Alderperson (Palm) with my thoughts, and he never responded to me.

I realize that Madison is very Liberal...but trying to erase our Nation's history is ridiculous. This particular monument is a reminder of slavery, and that is a very important point...that it should never happen again.

These young, dead Confederate soldier's each had his own thoughts about slavery; but they probably went to war because their buddies were going, or were shamed into going by a father. Think of all the young soldiers who volunteered for Nam, and had no clue what that war was about.

Please let the monument stay as a reminder to us...how cruel we as a nation can be at times.

Thank you in advance,

Margee Margie Burris

Madison, WI 53704

CITY OF MADISON

JUL 2 7 2018

Planning & Community & Economic Development

1

From:John DanielsonTo:PLLCApplicationsSubject:confederate rest cenotaphDate:Sunday, July 29, 2018 7:10:54 PMAttachments:confederate rest cenotaph.pdf

TO: Landmarks Commission FROM: John Danielson

Madison,	WI	53711	-
phone:			
email:			

Attached is a pdf document pertaining to the Confederate Rest cenotaph.

Would it be possible for you to forward it to the members of the Landmarks Commission?

Could you also let me know when and where the Commission will next meet to decide the fate of the cenotaph?

Are members of the public permitted to attend the meeting, address the Commission, and pass out handouts at the meeting? Thank you for the information. FROM: John Danielson

Madison, WI 53711 phone:

Regarding the fate of the cenotaph at Confederate Rest in Madison's Forest Hill Cemetery, here is a proposal for a plaque that perhaps could be placed at the spot where another plaque was removed. Whether or not any part of the proposal is used, the best way to rise above our racist past is to first acknowledge it, and not eliminate historic pieces that merely help tell the story. Any offensive feeling some may have of the cenotaph is outweighed by the greater positive impact it will have on visitors to the site. Allowing the cenotaph to remain will better teach the lessons that should be learned.

Some of the wording is based on a plaque at the University of Mississippi.

CONFEDERATE REST

THE CONFEDERATE SOLDIERS WHO LIE BURIED HERE WERE MEMBERS OF THE 1ST ALABAMA INF. REG., CONFEDERATE STATES OF AMERICA. THEY WERE CAPTURED IN THE SPRING OF 1862 IN THE CIVIL WAR BATTLE OF ISLAND NO. 10 IN THE MISSISSIPPI RIVER SOUTH OF CAIRO, ILLINOIS. THEIR TASK WAS TO HALT RIVER TRAFFIC CARRYING MEN AND SUPPLIES TO NORTHERN FORCES FURTHER SOUTH.

AFTER WEEKS OF FIGHTING UNDER EXTREMELY DIFFICULT CONDITIONS, THEY WERE FORCED TO SURRENDER. CONSTANT FIRE FROM RIVER GUNBOATS AND LAND FORCES MADE THEIR POSITION UNTENABLE. AFTER SURRENDER, THEY WERE MOVED TO CAMP RANDALL AND WHEN THEY ARRIVED MANY WERE SUFFERING FROM WOUNDS, MALNUTRITION AND VARIOUS DISEASES.

WITHIN A FEW WEEKS 140 GRAVES WERE FILLED, THE LAST RESTING PLACES FOR THESE SOLDIERS, FAR FROM THEIR HOMES IN ALABAMA, TENNESSEE, MISSISSIPPI, LOUISIANA AND ARKANSAS.

HERE ALSO, IS THE GRAVE OF ALICE WHITING WATERMAN, A GRACIOUS SOUTHERN LADY WHO DEVOTED MORE THAN 30 YEARS OF HER LIFE TO CARING FOR THE GRAVES OF "HER BOYS."

THE CENOTAPH WAS INSTALLED IN 1906 BY AN ASSOCIATION THAT PROMOTES A DISCREDITED IDEOLOGY KNOWN AS THE "LOST CAUSE," WHICH CLAIMED THAT THE CONFEDERACY HAD BEEN ESTABLISHED TO DEFEND STATES' RIGHTS AND THAT SLAVERY WAS NOT THE PRINCIPAL CAUSE OF THE CIVIL WAR. ALTHOUGH IT MEMORIALIZES THE CONFEDERATE SOLDIERS BURIED HERE, IT MUST ALSO REMIND US THAT THE DEFEAT OF THE CONFEDERACY ACTUALLY MEANT FREEDOM FOR MILLIONS OF PEOPLE.

THE HISTORIC CENOTAPH IS A REMINDER OF THE NATION'S DIVISIVE PAST. TODAY, MADISON DRAWS FROM THAT PAST A CONTINUING COMMITMENT TO PROVIDE A WELCOMING, INCLUSIVE, AND SUPPORTIVE ENVIROMENT, WITH EQUAL OPPORTUNITIES, TO ALL.

August 1, 2018

Amy Scanlon Preservation Planner Madison Dept. of Planning, Community & Economic Development 126 S. Hamilton Street Madison, WI 53703

CITY OF MADISON

AUG 6 2018

Planning & Community & Economic Development

Greetings Amy Scanlon,

I am writing to express my opinion regarding the larger stone marker at the Confederate Rest section of Forest Hill Cemetery.⁸ I was born in Madison and raised in McFarland. I spent my first 23 years living in Dane County, including 4 years spent at UW-Madison while working in two municipal positions for the City of Madison. I care deeply about Madison and its surrounding communities, and most of my family still resides in Dane County. I hope you will read my letter with an open mind.

I am confused about how this marker is causing (or ever caused) any harm. Its presence does not glorify the Confederacy, or slavery, or white supremacy. It doesn't glorify anything, actually; not even the soldiers whose names are engraved on its face. It does not advance the cause of the United Daughters of the Confederacy, which is itself a marginal, anachronistic organization with some links to controversial speakers. The marker does not link the Madison community in any way to the Confederacy; at least no more than a marker in Vietnam for American soldiers who died there could be interpreted as a sign of local government support for the global strategy of containing communism.

Admittedly, there are no immediate, tangible benefits to leaving the marker in place. But the marker conveys an important piece of Wisconsin's history. Its text informs the reader that a small group of southern soldiers died and were buried in Madison. It also says that these soldiers were loved. Like their northern counterparts, they were fathers, sons, brothers, and neighbors. They fought in a brutal war, for a barbaric cause, and they died in a strange land, far from their families who loved them. I am hopeful that a young person who reads those words might reflect on the horrible costs of war, and what causes are worth the risk of dying thousands of miles from your loved ones in a frigid prisoner of war camp.

I also urge you to consider what the marker's removal will say about the City of Madison. Is Madison a city that is so eager to display its progressive credentials that it is willing to move heavy machinery through a war graveyard to remove a marker that lists the names of dead soldiers? Do we find the marker's words so dangerous, and our enemies so lacking in basic humanity, that we must turn this grave marker into another political football?

We won the war; the Confederacy is long dead. There's no risk of slavery returning, and this marker is as innocuous as any other grave marker in Madison's cemeteries. Please don't disturb this war graveyard any further. Please send a message that Madison has the grace and the compassion to allow its enemies to rest in peace, even if they fought for a cause we find repugnant.

Sincerely,

Ryan Mylrea

⁸ The larger monument lists the names of the southern soldiers buried at Confederate Rest, and includes the text: "Erected in loving memory by United Daughters of the Confederacy to Alice Whiting Waterman and her boys."

CC:

Landmarks Commission

Marsha A. Rummel Richard B. Amesen Stuart Levitan David W.J. McLean Katherine Kaliszewski Lon Hill Anna Andrzejewski

Preservation Planner

Amy Scanlon

Director of Planning

Heather Stouder

Common Council

Barbara Harrington-McKinney	Ledell Zellers	Amanda Hall
Michael E. Verveer	Shiva Bidar-Sielaff	Marsha A. Rummel
Steve King	Zach Wood	Paul E. Skidmore
Maurice S. Cheeks	Arvina Martin	Larry Palm
Sara Eskrich	Sheri Carter	David Ahrens
Samba Baldeh	Rebecca Kemble	Mark Clear
Matthew J. Phair		

<u>Mayor</u>

Paul Soglin

CITY OF MADISON

AllG 1 4 2018

Madison Tandmarher Community.

Hi Folke,

In case you missed it, En enclosing a picture of what vandalism in Forest Hill Cemetery looks like. I line on Virginia Terr. and consider the cemetery as and of Madison's Jewels - as much as our Chain- of lakes. It a "must visit" place for our out-of-town quests ie Confederate Rest and Camp Rondall itself. What a neat piece of history we have in our city and backyard, The minguided attempts by our city Council to remove the marker from Confederate Reat must be turned back and I believe you are the people to do it. PLEASE!! It diminishes our humanity to do otherwise. Jet the dead rest in peace. The antics of our city council remind me of the things ISIS did in vandalizing ancient artifacts and religious symbols in their imaginary caliphate. We must be and do better. Cordially, antone 7. Kucere

Madron, Wis. 53726 8-9-18

MADISON | FOREST HILL CEMETERY



Temple Beth El Rabbi Jonathan Biatch, left, and Terrie Goren, executive director of Temple Beth El, examine a damaged headstone in Forest Hill Cemetery on Wednesday. Three dozen grave headstones were vandalized Tuesday overnight.

36 headstones vandalized

Heiser-Ertel, Lauren

From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Attachments:	Leonard H Cizewski < Sunday, August 19, 2018 6:58 PM PLLCApplications Cheryl Gmail 1821 HOME Robinson; Marshall Gmail Begel Written statement for the August 27 meeting Landmarks Commission.pdf
Follow Up Flag:	Follow up
Flag Status:	Flagged

Attached is my written statement in PDF format for the August 27 Landmarks Commission meeting.

I am also planning to attend and speak.

Thank you.

Leonard H. Cizewski

My cell:

City of Madison Forest Hill Cemetery Confederate Cenotaph FAQ

Information and photos presented here are meant to address some of the Landmarks Commission's previous questions and may help with further discussion.

How are the individual Confederate POW graves marked?

Each Confederate soldier buried at Forest Hill has a headstone with his name and unit.

During the Civil War, the Confederate POWs were buried in individual graves and the exact location of each grave was registered with Forest Hill Cemetery.

After the Civil War, a wooden marker was placed on each grave. In the early 20th century, these were replaced with headstones by the National Cemetery Administration (NCA).





The names of the individual soldiers also are listed in records at the Forest Hill Cemetery office on-site.

What can be done to more clearly mark each Confederate grave?

Many of the Confederate headstones are heavily worn.

"NCA (National Cemetery Administration) may replace any Confederate headstones deemed unserviceable, i.e. broken or unreadable. Wood National Cemetery, Milwaukee, WI...staff can offer technical expertise in how best to maintain historic headstones to the City of Madison upon their request", according to Terri Crawford, Senator Ron Johnson's Wisconsin Constituent Services Director.

Madison Parks is working with Wood National Cemetery to make this happen.

How is Forest Hill's Confederate soldier burial area marked?

The graves are in an area bounded by a short wall on which "CSS 1862" is written.



The cenotaph is visible in the left center of the above photo.



Each Confederate soldier buried at Forest Hill is listed on the cenotaph. These are the same names that appear on individual headstones. On the base is inscribed, "Erected in loving memory by United Daughters of the Confederacy to Mrs. Alice Waterman and 'her boys'."



How did the cenotaph come to be placed at Forest Hill?

The cenotaph was placed in Forest Hill Cemetery by the United Daughters of the Confederacy in the early 20th century, well after each grave had been marked with a wooden marker and just before individual headstones replaced them.

The UDC was not simply a veterans memorial organization. This organization erected monuments as part of a movement that promoted the restoration of white supremacist state governments in the states of the former Confederacy, the disenfranchisement of African-Americans, the revocation of the civil rights of African-Americans, the imposition of segregation, and Ku Klux Klan terrorism including lynching.

What is the Union soldiers' burial area like?

The Union soldier burial area has a plaque and bench. The U.S. Veterans' Administration installed the plaque, and the Ladies of the Grand Army of the Republic installed the bench





The Union soldiers' headstones are generally in better condition than the Confederates'. The NCA is charged with maintaining both the Union and Confederate graves.



Compiled by Leonard Cizewski and Cheryl Robinson; August 2018

Heiser-Ertel, Lauren

From: Sent: To: Subject:	Peter Cannon < Tuesday, August 21, 2018 7:59 PM PLLCApplications; Ledell Gmail; Zellers, Confederate Monument	
Follow Up Flag: Flag Status:	Follow up Flagged	

I have a brief thought on the Confederate Monument at Forest Hill Cemetery.

I noticed in photos of the monument that the part that mentions the Daughters of the Confederacy is separate from the names of the confederate soldiers buried there. At least for me, and I think many others who would like to see the monument removed, the objectionable thing about the monument is the acceptance the monument represents of the "lost cause" myth that the Daughters of the Confederacy did so much to sell to the country.

Why not separate the top of the monument that lists the names of the soldiers from the propaganda on the bottom. Remount the top, remount it and leave it there. Remove the bottom part. Signage that explains the changes would be great.

If you have already thought of this, I apologize for taking your time. I appreciate your efforts.

Peter Cannon

Madison, WI 53703

Heiser-Ertel, Lauren

Subject:

FW: Confederate Rest - HMI Board position

From: Stu Levitan [mailto: Sent: Monday, August 27, 2018 12:02 AM To: Mark Gajewski < >; Fruhling, William <<u>WFruhling@cityofmadison.com</u>> Subject: Re: Confederate Rest - HMI Board position

Mark

Thanks - I'm glad the board agrees with me on need for interpretive sign. We'll need your support in persuading the council to reverse its position on that.

Just to clarify - is the board's position the first paragraph, or the entire text? Speaking for myself, I believe there is a material difference between individual grave markers such as the ones you cite in your second graf and a large monument commemorating a group of soldiers who (a) waged treasonous war on the United States (b) to support slavery. They're entitled to have their graves treated with respect, and their record preserved; they're not entitled to a large stone monument, itself not historic to their

burial but a manifestation, over 40 years later, of "Lost Cause" activism. Also, how will replacing the celebratory monument with an interpretive sign "deprive(s) future generations of the opportunity to reflect on the past and avoid their mistakes in future"? Seems to me that will enhance

reflection and understanding.

I have forwarded this to Bill Fruhling for the correspondence file. I would appreciate your sharing it with your board, as well.

Thanks, Stu

On Sunday, August 26, 2018 10:32 PM, ' second secon

The Board has asked me to let you know our position on Confederate Rest. Thanks.

Stuart Levitan Chair Madison Landmarks Commission

Re: Confederate Rest

The Board of Historic Madison urges the Landmarks Commission to approve retaining the cenotaph containing the names of Confederate prisoners of war who died at Camp Randall in April and May, 1862, and urges the Landmarks Commission to approve erecting an informational sign, similar to the one at the nearby Soldiers' Lot, to explain how these prisoners came to be buried in Forest Hill Cemetery.

If the cenotaph is removed, should we also remove the headstone in Forest Hill Cemetery marking the grave of James Morrison, a Capitol commissioner who brought his slaves to Wisconsin, or that of John Yates Smith, who advocated flogging refractory slaves, or Harvey Nelson, who murdered two of his African American neighbors, or any of the numerous men who belonged to the Ku Klux Klan while attending the University of Wisconsin? Removing markers does not change who these men were or what they did, but deprives future generations of the opportunity to reflect on the past and avoid their mistakes in future.

Respectfully,

Mark Gajewski President Historic Madison, Inc.