



**Project Name & Address:** 946 Spaight Street  
**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations  
**Legistar File ID #** [76445](#)  
**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** May 30, 2023

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Henry Doane  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of a patio wall.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject property is a designated landmark in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

#### 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
  - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
  - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

#### Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

## **Analysis and Conclusion**

Staff has been working with the applicant since the April 4, 2023, Landmarks Commission meeting to find a design and materials that would meet the standards and align with the intent of the work the applicant wished to complete. The proposed limestone is similar to the material found on the existing foundation of the landmarked structure and the applicant has provided examples in the district that use a similar type of stone for this type of application in the district. The proposed design will be largely in line with the height of the foundation and extend just a little above the front stoop. Staff believes that the updated design and materials meets the standards of approval.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

### **Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**

1. No proposed changes is land use for this property. The change is to remove the conjectural feature installed on the front and wrap the existing front stoop with a material that uses a similar architectural vocabulary of the foundation course on the landmark structure will allowing for a more finished front porch.
2. No historic materials were removed as part of this project. The nonhistoric purple stone wall that was installed in November 2022 will need to be removed and the new lower limestone wall will be visually unobtrusive to the site and structure.
3. The removal of the new purple rock wall will address the false sense of historical development and return the look of the property to a more historic appearance. The work will read as a product of its time but is minimal enough to not be construed as a conjectural feature.
4. The previous conditions of the front stoop had not acquired historic significance in its own right.
5. The distinctive materials of this site are the simple limestone and red brick of the structure. The proposed alteration will replicate the stone of the foundation course to wrap around the concrete stoop.
6. No historic features were removed as part of this work.
7. No chemical or physical treatments were used on historic materials.
8. No archaeological resources were impacted as part of this work.
9. The new design is compatible with the historic character of the property and it maintains the historic features and spatial relationships of the historic property and structure.
10. This new construction is able to be removed in the future and its removal will not impact the essential form or integrity of the historic property.

## **Recommendation**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the removal of the new purple stone wall and installation of the limestone cladding for the front stoop as proposed.