# ADDENDUM PLANNING DIVISION REPORT DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND COMMUNITY AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT Of April 30, 2008

## RE: I.D. #09340: Zoning Map Amendment I.D. 3341-3342 To Rezone 451 W. Wilson Street and 315 S. Bassett Street from R6 (General Residence District) to PUD-GDP-SIP

On April 7, 2008, the Plan Commission referred a request to rezone 451 W. Wilson Street and 315 S. Bassett Street from R6 to PUD-GDP-SIP to allow demolition of two apartment buildings and construction of a 40-unit apartment building. In referring the project, the Commission asked that an elevation or other contextual information be provided that shows the proposed building in relation to the adjacent Dowling Apartments and for information on how the on-site parking for the project would be managed. Members of the Commission also suggested that the project receive final approval from the Urban Design Commission before coming back to the Plan Commission.

Since that meeting, the applicants have revised their building design to address earlier comments made by the Planning Division and the Urban Design Commission. Among the changes made by the developers include simplification of the parapet heights along the front and rear elevations, extension of two of the bay elements along the S. Bassett Street façade down to grade, removal of the EIFS siding in favor of metal siding, additional brick along the side elevations and a new emphasis on the S. Bassett Street entrance. Staff believes the design changes represent a considerable improvement versus the earlier plans, with a more simplified and less massive design that provides a better relation to S. Bassett Street.

In addition, the Urban Design Commission recommended final approval of the planned unit development at its April 23, 2008 meeting. The UDC report containing their comments will be provided before the Plan Commission meeting.

In response to the Plan Commission's comments at the previous meeting, the applicants have provided three photos, which are included in the Commission materials, showing the relationship between the proposed apartment building and the adjacent Dowling Apartments. The photos are taken of a scale model of the project. The applicants have indicated that they will bring the model to the May 5 Plan Commission meeting. Regarding the question about how parking will be managed within the proposed development, the applicants indicate that they plan to have assigned parking, with one parking space included in the rent for each apartment. If a tenant does not want the parking, their rent will be reduced accordingly.

In closing, the Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission recommend approval of the proposed planned unit development for 451 W. Wilson Street and 315 S. Bassett Street to the Common Council subject to input at the public hearing, comments from reviewing agencies and

ID #09340: 451 W. Wilson Street & 315 S. Bassett Street ADDENDUM-April 30, 2008 Page 2

the following revised Planning Division conditions, which reflect the modifications made by the applicants:

- 1. That the zoning text be revised per Planning Division approval as follows:
  - a.) that the list of uses be revised to note multi-family residential uses as shown on the approved plans and accessory uses directly associated with those permitted uses:
  - b.) signage for the commercial buildings shall be limited to the maximum permitted in the R6 district for the residential building, as approved by the Urban Design Commission and Zoning Administrator (the provision for temporary construction signage is acceptable pending approval by the Zoning Administrator);
  - c.) that a section be added to the zoning text acknowledging the presence of existing and future high levels of noise and vibration resulting from trains operating on the adjacent and nearby railroad rights of way, including from possible future commuter rail services. This provision shall also be added to the leases for all 40 units proposed, with a copy of the lease to be provided for the file.
- 2. That the applicants receive approval of an encroachment/privilege in streets agreement from the City for the terraced landscaping area and all of the balconies to be located within the right of way of S. Bassett Street prior to final approval and recording of the planned unit development.
- 3. That the applicant receive the approval of the City Forester for all trees to be planted in the S. Bassett Street terrace.
- 4. That the applicants submit a Certified Survey Map for approval by the City that combines the two existing parcels into one lot reflecting the proposed redevelopment of the site with one building.

Addendum Prepared By: Timothy M. Parks, Planner

April 22, 2008

Mr. Brad Murphy
Director of Planning
Department of Planning and Development
City of Madison
215 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd.
Madison, WI 53701



RE: LETTER OF SUPPORT -- LAKE PARK APARTMENT HOMES

Dear Mr. Murphy:

I am writing this letter to you to express my support for the Lake Park Apartment Homes project proposed by McGrath Associates for the corner of W. Wilson and S. Bassett Streets. I live one block east of the project at 351 W. Wilson Street where I have owned a condominium for 25 years. As a 37-year resident of central Madison and a 25-year resident of the downtown, I am well aware of both the charms and issues of living, working, and recreating downtown. I have long been a strong supporter for higher density development in the central city and opposed to urban sprawl. I have had the opportunity to review the plans for this project. In my opinion, Lake Park Apartment Homes will be an attractive building, appropriate to the site, and a welcome addition to the neighborhood. Perhaps if this project was proposed for a different site, such as the middle of a residential block of single family homes, I would find the scale inappropriate, but I believe the project as presented is appropriate for the proposed site.

I live in a building directly adjacent to Nolan Shore Condominiums, a large scale project recently developed by McGrath Associates. McGrath Associates always responded promptly to any issues which affected the building where I live during the construction of Nolan Shore. I was impressed with their desire to be a good neighbor both during the design phase of the building and during the construction of the project.

In summery, I believe that Lake Park Apartment Homes is an appropriate project for my street and my neighborhood, a project which will enhance the downtown and the type of project which the City of Madison should support.

Sincerely,

Philip Wand

**Doty School Condominiums** 

351 W. Wilson Street Madison, WI 53703



#### AGENDA #7

#### City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: April 23, 2008

TITLE:

451 West Wilson Street & 315 South Bassett Street - PUD-GDP-SIP for a 40-Unit Apartment Building. 4th Ald. Dist.

(07751)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

**REPORTED BACK:** 

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: April 23, 2008

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Bonnie Cosgrove, Richard Wagner and Lou Host-Jablonski.

#### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of April 23, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD-GDP-SIP located at 451 West Wilson Street and 315 South Bassett Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Jonathan Cooper, representing the Bassett District Lake Park Apartments Steering Committee; Catherine Hixon, Jim Eisenmann, Lance McGrath, Bruce Simonson, representing McGrath Associates; Christopher Thiel, representing SAA; and Rosemary Lee. Appearing in opposition were Steve Janeway, Christine M. Lot, Rosalie LaRocque, and Jan Sweet, representing Cities Without Cars. The modified plans as presented featured the following:

- As an alternative to the consideration of a green roof, the design of the roof will be modified with an undersized drain to provide for a delay in its discharge allowing more of an opportunity to infiltrate within an open area at the rear of the building. The upper roofline has been modified to eliminate platform elements on the upper façade's parapet.
- Use of EIFS has been eliminated in favor of utilization of corrugated panel, concealed fasteners.
- The overall mass of the building has been brought down in response to Planning Division comments, with features incorporated to activate and accentuate the Bassett entry, along with the addition of projecting bays back to the ground and revised landscape treatment that also relieves concerns about a corner balcony, previously noted by the Commission.
- A review of building materials emphasized the use of king-size brick, cast stone, medium bronze metal siding, along with metal fascia and trim along.
- A review of the landscape plan by Thiel emphasized modifications to provide for large scale plantings under balconies along Bassett, including benches parallel to Bassett Street along with a redesign of the trellis at the rear of the building featuring a metal cable treatment and revised plantings.

Following the presentation testimony was as follows:

• Jan Sweet spoke in opposition and circulated a petition against the project. He noted need for the project to be altered to reduce parking and introduce car share or community car, the necessity to have



community facilities incorporated into the building and the incompatibility of the building's architecture with existing buildings in the neighborhood. He emphasized his submission of the petition into the record.

- Jonathan Cooper spoke in support but noted both neighborhood support and opposition to the project relative to concerns with the building's size and mass. He also provided a report of a recent neighborhood meeting following the Plan Commission's recent referral of the project.
- Christine M. Lot spoke in opposition, noting the large size of the building in comparison with the adjacent Dowling building and its lack of consistency with existing development in the area with the project's character appearing too industrial and not appropriately scaled.
- Catherine Hixson spoke in favor noting the extent of large development already in the area.

In response to a request to address green issues, McGrath noted the following:

- The cost of providing a community car within the project is approximately \$24,000 including an additional \$15,000 for the car, as well as the provision of a stall on the premise to provide for its storage. At these costs, in order to be affordable, want to get into cost-sharing to justify cost.
- Relevant to a green roof, will try to provide for its potential structurally. Currently undersizing the roof drain to delay discharge.
- No room to move building in any direction to obtain more greenspace on the site.

Following McGrath's remarks, the Commission noted the following:

- Support project, concur with Landmarks approval.
- Project has come a long way, massing works well, history of area reflects change and scale of buildings to be larger.

#### **ACTION:**

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-0). The motion for final approval required that the structural system for the building be adequate to handle a future green roof system with the membrane of the roof to be white reflective, with a change to the cable trellis as provided by Schreiber/Anderson & Associates, Inc., and a recommendation that the applicant provide space for a community car within the lower level parking structure.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 7, 7, 7.5, 8 and 8.



#### URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 451 West Wilson Street & 315 South Bassett Street

o continue de la cont	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	7	7	-	<b>-</b>		6	6
	<b></b>		<b>hea</b>	<b></b>	<b></b>	•	•••	7
	New York	***	-	***	•••	Page 1	treet.	8
	100	6	6		584	**	6	6
	_		-	_	oma		-	7.5
	6	7	7	5.5	***	6	7	7
	7	8	7	_	_	7	8	8
						The state of the s		
***************************************								

#### General Comments:

- Yes, it is large. Yes, the Dowling will lose light. But it is quality infill and the design is greatly improved.
- Well designed building, of approvable bulk and design. The architectural improvements make a big difference.
- Welcomed improvements!
- Well done. Bravo.
- Great improvements in architecture and landscape.

### Parks, Timothy

From: Sent:

Krishna Pradhan [kpradhan@wisc.edu] Thursday, May 01, 2008 11:27 AM

To:

Parks, Timothy

Cc:

Verveer, Mike

Subject:

Lake Park Apartment Homes at Bassett and Wilson

Dear Mr. Timothy M. Parks,

From the time I came to know about the project, my neighbors and I have opposed it because of its size. It may not be so big in some open space. but it is too big in this block. I am sure you know that it is a dead end block with a very narrow street. The proposed building plan virtually covers one side of the whole block. It is basically too wide, too long, and too tall for the area. I will be at the incoming meeting to express my view. However, I am writing this note to make a request: Would you or your designate please come to the site, and examine the over all impact of the plan before the meeting on May 5th? This will be very meaningful to my neighbors and me. I thank you for your consideration in this matter.

Sincerely,

Krishna Pradhan 302 S. Bassett Street Madison WI 53703

neighborhood Questions: 256-4301.

Name Margaret Van Dulk
Address 445 W. WILSON ST. APT.B

Address 445 W WILSON ST. APT.B

Address 445 W WILSON ST. APT.B

Phone WST10-Stoy

Name Krishna Pradhan & Bishna Pradh

Address 302 S. Bassett St.

Phone Madison, W1 53703

Name Antonio Ade

Address 925 Drake St.

Name Brent What
Address 519 L. Nilson ST
Phone

Phone

Name BA Moun Address 512 w. Wilson St. Phone 250-5119

Name Strak

Address Straw wism St

Phone 335-8270

Name J. Hicks Address 512 W. Wilson St. Phone 692-1199

Name G. Rosollija Address 218 S. Bassett St. Apt 105 Phone 917-669-9577

Name Gregg Mulry Address 512 W Wilson, Unit 201 Phone 217-2160

Name Brad Moore
Address 3/4 5. Bassett 5/.#/
Phone 68.239.7233

Name Lorina M Buchner Address 218 & Basnett St oper 202 Phone 257-6550

Name
Address
Phone

Name
Address
Phone

Chaple

Address
Phone

Madrison

Address

Ad

Name Helm Buchl Address 218 3 Banad H. Phone 816-0699

Name Scott Herrick Address 539 West Wilson St. Phone 715-523-9679

Name Country Wiest
Address 539 West Wison St.
Phone 608-330-3258

Name Vikram Grover
Address 218 south Bakkett. St
Phone 203-918-9672

Name Matt Shith Address 427 W. Wilson \*1 Phone 630 \$ \$42-3421

Name\_AN SWEET

Address 218 5. BASSETT ST. #305

Phone MANIGON WE

53703

Bonnie Farber ! Si Bedford St. #301 MADISON WI S3702

Name Masato Tourita

Address 5/2 W. Wilsou St. #205

Phone 808 (287) 1/225

Name Lino Amerim

Name Lino Amerim
Address For W. W. Ison St #305
Phone

Name Mikhell Milligan Address 312 S Bassett St Phone 608-260-959 9559

Name Christive Jamins X.
Address — Man St.
Phone —

Name Rever Kory
Address + Phone (232 with 1600 51

Name 1806 Probst
Address 510 W. Main Ap\$ 368
Phone MANA 608-628-6315

Name Josiah Thompate Address 512 W Wilson Apt loz Phone 72715 9004

Name Sharon Silzel Address 622 Howard PI-B 53703 Phone 97027066665

Name Zdo Lipinshi Address 133 N. Frankiz & #3 Phone 608-770-4070

Name Viall Kearns Address + Phone 7781 Elmood Ave 608-484-0781

Name Bedy Schumacher - Mumaulum Address 63 Grazg Love Madison, WI 57705 Phone (608) 476-7161

Name Paul Litterio Address 112 w. James St. Columbus, W. 53925 Phone (608) 7720254

Name Usiquelle Address 1209 Sherman Ance, Madison Phone

Name Grey News Ale, Madion Phone

Name Strotific Otto
Address + Phone
7757 E. Wasu # E

Name I an Joydan Mayes Address San W. Doty FI 18 Phone 608-213-0210

Name Angulka Address S23 w. withon st. Phone 651 - Sw - 7713.

Name David SPITVIMS
Address SIZ W. WILSONST
Phone 604-309-107

Name Africhi Hogegawa Address 512 W. Wilson Sr. #306 Phone 698-8205

Name Langstocth
Address + Phone 218 5. Bassett st. H308

Name Frances Dachelet Address 301 5. Bedford St. Phone 334-5583

Name Matthew Rigila Address 1523 spaight it. Phone 920/475/5750

Name Address Phone

Name Address Phone

Name
Address + Phone

Name Brandon Albrunt
Address 572 U Wilson St
Phone 715-872.2885

Name TAMMY TENHAGEN

Address 420 w wilsons

Phone 608-886-5082

Name Karin I bele Address 507 W Wilson Phone 60% 354 4776

Name Moses Wolfenstein
Address 532 Vest Wilsonst. #3
Phone (646/245-18)4

Name Charles Minnich
Address + Phone 527 W.V. 1500 St.
(608) 290-8646

Name After PErce.

Address 577 v. w 1690

Phone —

Name Shawn Mitchell
Address 527 w. Wilsonst.
Phone

Name Il Holeman Address III 5 Bassett St Phone -

Name Cassandra Schwette Address 710 college ct. Phone

Name Diane Benz Address + Phone So7 w. wilson St At 506

Name Ryna Jarquin Wilson #107 Madison W1 53703.
Address 507 W. Wilson #107 Madison W1 53703. Phone

Name Ton Christic Address 134 Division 293 0238 Phone

6 LENN MITROFF TVail Modeson 53718 1516 Lynchborg TVail Modeson 53718 226-0427 Name Address

Phone

Name Address Phone

Name Address + Phone