



Project Name & Address: 1315 Rutledge Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction and an addition in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Legistar File ID # [63193](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: January 5, 2021

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Meri Tepper, Associated Housewrights

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new garage structure and an addition to the principal structure.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
- (a) Gross Volume.
 - (b) Height.
 - (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
 - (d) Materials used in the street facades.
 - (e) The design of the roof.
 - (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses.
 - (g) Directional expression.
 - (h) Materials, patterns and textures.
 - (i) Landscape treatment.
- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
 - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new detached garage structure and an addition to the principal structure. The principal structure dates to 1892 and is a Queen Anne style building. The lot configuration is unusual in that the principal structure is located towards the back of a deep parcel. The attached garage proposal allows for the property to provide covered parking to serve a new and ongoing use in the rear corner of the property. This addition will have minimal impacts to the character of the character-defining features of the principal structure and maintain the historic integrity of the property in the context of the historic district. In order to accommodate the attached garage addition, the applicant will remove an existing small shed on the northeast corner of the parcel

Additionally, the applicant is proposing to expand an existing sunporch on the southeast corner of the structure to be a larger sunroom. New steps will be constructed to provide egress from the sunroom to the rear yard. Also on the rear of the structure, the applicant proposes to remove an existing nonhistoric rear window as it would be located under the breezeway that would run from the rear entrance to the garage. Finally, the application includes the request to repair deteriorated portions of the front porch with profiles to match the existing.

Both additions will feature clapboard siding and period appropriate pedestrian doors. The proposed vehicle door is of a style typically found in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District. The windows on the sunporch are large one-over-one windows that are in keeping with the character of other rear sunporch additions in the district.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Both of the additions are single story and are in keeping with the height of additions on structures in the district. They will not be taller than the principal structure.
 - 2. By locating the garage addition on the rear corner of the building, it allows for the preservation of the prominent front yard, which is a unique feature of the property and is uncommon in the district.
 - 3. By locating the additions on the back of the principal structure, the proposal would maintain the rhythm of masses and spaces of the historic structure and allow the building to be visually compatible with other historic resources in the district.
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) The repairs to the front porch will replicate the existing character and only replace historic materials where they have failed.
 - (d) The garage addition will feature a gable-front roof, which is a form consistent with other garages in the district and one of the variety of roof forms found on the principal structure. The sunroom will feature a low-pitched roof, but maintain the cornice feature found elsewhere on the structure. Finally, the new breezeway on the rear of the building will feature a hipped roof, which is also a form of roof found on the principal structure.
 - (e) N/A

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.