



Project Name & Address: 1908 Arlington Place

Application Type(s): Certificates of Appropriateness for new construction, addition, and exterior alterations

Legistar File ID # [75616](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: February 1, 2023

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Arlan Kay

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new garage structure, porch addition, and complete exterior alterations.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is located in the University Heights local historic district.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 1. Alterations shall be in keeping with the original design and character of the building.
 2. The removal of historic features on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.

3. The introduction of conjectural architectural features without historic precedent on the building is prohibited.
- (5) Windows and Doors
- (a) Openings
 3. The new openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.
 - (c) Windows
 7. New windows that are compatible with the historic character of the building may be reinstated in openings that had previously been filled in.
 - (d) Pedestrian Doors
 1. Historic entrance doors or those dating from the period of significance may be replaced with a door that blends with the character of the structure when the original is beyond repair.
 2. Doors shall not have a textured fake wood grain.
 3. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view, wood or aluminum, and shall be compatible with the entrance door and the overall design of the building.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS

- (1) General
- (a) General
 1. New additions on the front of the principal structure are prohibited, except for restoring or reconstructing missing historic features that can be documented.
 2. A new addition shall be designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
 3. The addition shall be visually separated from the principal building.
 4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition shall be similar to those of the historic building.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 1. A new addition shall be constructed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.
 2. New additions that destroy significant historic materials or character-defining features are prohibited.
- (4) Roofs
- (a) General
 1. The form and pitch of the addition roof shall be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.
 - (b) Materials
 1. Visible roof materials shall be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
- (a) Porch Elements
 1. The style of porch posts, balusters and rails shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic porch but, in most cases, not duplicate the historic features.
 2. Spaces beneath porches and stairs shall be enclosed with a framed lattice of crisscross design, narrow vertical boards, masonry, or other openwork design.
 3. All wood on exterior porches shall be painted or opaquely stained.

41.27 STANDARDS FOR NEW STRUCTURES

- (1) General
- (a) Primary Structures

The design for a new structure in a historic district shall be visually compatible with other historic resources within two hundred (200) feet in the following ways:

1. Building Placement. When determining visual compatibility for building placement, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as lot coverage, setbacks, building orientation, and historic relationships between the building and site.
 2. Street Setback. When determining visual compatibility for street setbacks, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the average setback of historic resources on the same block face within two hundred (200) feet, and the setback of adjacent structures.
 3. Visual Size. When determining visual compatibility for visual size, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as massing, building height in feet and stories, the gross area of the front elevation (i.e., all walls facing the street), street presence, and the dominant proportion of width to height in the façade.
 4. Building Form. When determining visual compatibility for building form, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as building type and use, roof shape, symmetry or asymmetry, and its dominant vertical or horizontal expression.
 5. Architectural Expression. When determining visual compatibility for architectural expression, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the building's modulation, articulation, building planes, proportion of building elements, and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.
- (b) Accessory Structures
1. Comply with requirements for new primary structures with other historic accessory structures serving as comparables.
 2. Minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way, or be minimally visible from the front of the property for corner lots.
 3. Clearly be secondary to the primary structure.
- (3) Exterior Walls
- (a) General
1. Materials used for new structures shall be similar in design, scale and architectural appearance to materials that date to the period of significance on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as a historic building.
- (4) Roofs
- (a) Form
1. Roof form and pitch shall be similar to the form and pitch of the roofs on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.
- (b) Materials
2. Any roofing material shall be permitted on flat or slightly pitched roofs not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
- (e) Rooftop Features
1. Rooftop decks or terraces and green roofs or other roof landscaping, railings, or furnishings shall be installed so that they are inconspicuous and minimally visible on the site and from the street.
- (5) Windows and Doors
- (a) General
1. Door and window styles should both match the style of the new structure and be compatible with those on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.
- (f) Garage Doors
1. Garage doors shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities prevalent within the historic district.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to reintroduce openings on the street-façade of the structure and create a small porch on that side. As is sometimes the case in University Heights, the primary façade of the house faces an interior lot line and the side of the house faces towards the street. What is the historic front yard of the house (which is the Zoning side yard) is proposed to be regraded and a flowerbed expanded. To the rear of the property, a new garage is proposed. Due to significant grade change on the site, the rooftop of the garage is proposed to have a rooftop deck that would be of a similar elevation to the “front” porch on the primary façade and accessible from the historic front yard.

The existing historic structure is a transitional style featuring Queen Anne form and Arts & Crafts detailing. It was constructed in 1899 and designed by noted local architect Louis Claude. The building is covered in stucco with painted wood detailing.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS

- (1) General
 - (a) The alterations on the existing building involve the reintroduction of openings on the street façade.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 1. The window and door openings will feature materials that are largely in keeping with the original design and character of the building.
 2. There are no historic features to be removed on the structure.
 3. The applicant has provided photographic documentation showing that there were previously openings in these locations, so the new openings are not conjectural.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (a) Openings
 3. The window and door openings are largely compatible with the overall design of the building. However, there is no precedent for a door with a single-sidelight on the building or on other historic resources in the vicinity.
 - (c) Windows
 7. The applicant has provided the necessary documentation for their previously being openings in these locations on the street façade.
 - (d) Pedestrian Doors
 1. The new door needs to be in character with the structure. Staff would recommend the applicant submit specs on the proposed new door for administrative approval.
 2. If the new door is not wood, it needs to not have textured fake wood grain.
 3. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view, wood or aluminum, and shall be compatible with the entrance door and the overall design of the building. Staff would recommend the applicant submit specs on the proposed new storm door for administrative approval.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS

- (1) General
 - (a) General
 1. The addition of a porch on the street façade is on what is historically and actually the side of the building, for all that it faces what Zoning defines as the front of the property.
 2. The new porch is of a similar character to the larger historic front porch.
 3. The wood porch is visually separated from the stucco façade.

4. The alignment and rhythm of the covered porch is in keeping with the historic building.
- (b) Materials and Features
 1. The new side porch has simple details that link it to the historic building and will use similar materials, but will read as a new addition. No historic materials will be destroyed to add the porch.
 2. The addition of the porch will not destroy any character-defining features.
- (4) Roofs
 - (a) General
 1. The roof of the porch is proposed to have a low pitch and form similar to that of the historic front porch.
 - (b) Materials
 1. Staff would recommend administrative approval of the specs for the roofing materials.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
 - (a) Porch Elements
 1. The porch details strongly reference the historic porch, but will read as new.
 2. The space beneath the new porch should have either simple screening or replicate the style of screening as found on the front porch.
 3. All wood on the porch will be painted.

41.27 STANDARDS FOR NEW STRUCTURES

- (1) General
 - (a) Primary Structures

The design of the new accessory structure must also meet the standards for principal structures:

 1. Building Placement. The new garage will be located on the rear of the lot, which is the typical location for such structures in the district.
 2. Street Setback. The garage is sited within the appropriate street setback for accessory structures.
 3. Visual Size. The garage is single-story and will clearing read as accessory to the principal structure.
 4. Building Form. Flat roof garages have precedent in the district and its overall form is reminiscent of the building footprint for the principal structure.
 5. Architectural Expression. The new structure incorporates the subtle Arts & Crafts detailing and form of the principal structure while still reading as a new structure.
 - (b) Accessory Structures
 1. The building appears to meet the principal building standards.
 2. The new garage will be minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 3. The garage will clearly be secondary to the principal structure.
- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (a) General
 1. The building is proposed to be clad in stucco with simple metal railings for the rooftop deck. The building uses a similar architectural vocabulary, but will read as a new structure.
- (4) Roofs
 - (a) Form
 1. Other garages in the vicinity have flat roofs.
 - (b) Materials
 2. Any roofing material shall be permitted on flat or slightly pitched roofs not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 - (e) Rooftop Features

1. The placement of the accessory structure into the hillside will allow the rooftop deck to read as a stand-alone deck from some angles or a minimally ornamented rooftop from others. In its location, it will be minimally visible from the street.
- (5) Windows and Doors
- (a) General
 1. Staff would recommend administrative approval of the specs for the vehicle and pedestrian door for the garage. The style of windows appears to be compatible with the historic resource.
 - (f) Garage Doors
 1. Staff recommends administrative approval of the final garage door specs.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following condition:

1. Provide updated plans that remove the sidelight for new side entrance to the principal structure.
2. Provide final window, roofing, and door specifications to staff for administrative approval.