Scanlon, Amy

From: Rummel, Marsha
Sent: Sunday, July 11, 2010 3:45 PM
To: Scanlon, Amy; Fruhling, William
Cc: [redacted]
Subject: Comments for 7/19 Landmarks Commission

Dear Landmarks Commissioners-

I will try to stop by LC but a D6 item at Bd of Estimates for the Madison Public Market may conflict with my efforts to be at two places at the same time...

I support Legistar **18680** 517-523 East Main Street - First Settlement Historic District - Demolition of former City of Madison Water Utility commercial building and construction of a new 21-unit apartment building. Thanks for referring last month so I could have a meeting for the neighborhood to discuss the proposed development. The meeting was held last Thursday with Lance McGrath and First Settlement residents and property owners. There were about 15 people in attendance and no one objected to the demolition of the Water Utility building. There was overall support of the height, massing and scale of the proposed new apartment building. The developer proposes a building design that relates to the nearby Harvester building on 301 S Blount and those in attendance supported the approach. Residents agreed that the parcel is an important transitional location between the residential neighborhood and the industrial character of rail corridor across Blair St and supported paying architectural homage to the Harvester building. The outstanding issues are not specifically Landmarks concerns and relate to architectural details, storm water management and landscaping. I believe the proposal should get a Certificate of Appropriateness and permission to demo existing building.

I note in item **7. 17150** Buildings proposed for demolition - 2010 the request to demo 1384 Williamson St. I can't tell when that will be before you but I want to conduct a neighborhood review before the public hearing. My initial conversation with Ms Scanlon resulted in this email exchange:

Me: ".... I oppose the demolition permit for the adjacent house next to Ace Hardware on Willy St. I would be willing to discuss and consider partial demo of the newer wing of the house, leaving the older piece intact for storage or retail or even residential. I met with Tom a few weeks ago along with Lindsey Lee and Peter Wolf of the MNA Preservation and Development Committee. Tom heard our plea to save part of the house and he seemed willing to consider how that may be a win-win: more storage/outdoor sales area for his business, increased visibility from the street and using the house in some way which would satisfy the Marquette neighborhood association's interest in preservation of our unique housing stock. Can you let me know the status of meetings with the applicant?..."

Amy Scanlon: " I am glad to hear that Mr. Sheppard had been meeting with you and the neighborhood on the Williamson Street Ace Hardware demolition. Our files on the house were very incomplete, and the only note we had was from Ms. Rankin stating that she did really have an issue with its demolition. However, I agree that it is important to take a closer look at the house before any demolition proceeds. I am interested in hearing more about the proposal for a partial demolition, but I do believe that the porch section may be original, since it is a common design feature from other houses of this time period and vernacular style. I would have to look in the basement at the framing and foundation to be sure. The applicant has met once with Rebecca Cnare and Kevin Firchow before my arrival, and Rebecca mentioned that they have encouraged the applicant to meet with staff again once they had met with you and the neighborhood, and their plans had become more finalized. ...."

My contact with Tom Sheppard was not a formal meeting but a spontaneous visit so I want to make sure the neighborhood has the opportunity to review all the options before the applicant moves ahead with plans. I am not an expert but when I toured the house, the height of the ceiling of the side wing struck me as from a later era as did the existence of two front doors. It would be great if you and some of the commissioners could walk through the building and look at the foundation and framing to inform the discussion.

Thanks all-

Marsha