PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

May 13, 2013



PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Address:	1325 Spaight Street
Application Type:	Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in historic district
Legistar File ID #	<u>30094</u>
Prepared By:	Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Summary

Applicant/Property Owner: Peter Bradley

Requested Action/Proposal Summary: The applicant requests that the Landmarks Commission grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alteration to the residence located at 1325 Spaight Street in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District. The request removes a portion of the rear addition and constructs an extension of the addition in a different location to unify the overall appearance. The request also creates a new doorway in an existing window at the second floor to gain access to a roof deck. The proposed design will match the existing materials and details.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Section 33.19 of the Madison General Ordinances (see below)

Review Required By: Landmarks Commission

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge (local) historic district.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

<u>33.19(11)(i)</u> Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

- 1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.19(11)(g).
- 2. Alteration of the surface material, pattern and texture in the facade(s) of any existing structures shall be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
- 3. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain or be compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
- 4. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain the existing historical landscape plan or shall develop a new plan which is compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
- 5. Alteration of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

33.19(11)(g) <u>Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for</u> <u>Commercial Use</u>.

- 1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
- 2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.

- 3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- 4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

A brief discussion of 33.19(11)(i) follows:

- 1. Section 33.19(11)(g) discussion is below.
- 2. The surface material, pattern and texture in the facade of the new addition and altered area will match the original and existing historical finishes.
- 3. The proposed alteration of the existing structure is compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
- 4. The proposed alteration of the existing structure does not change the existing historical landscape plan, leaving the area compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
- 5. The street façade is not changing.

A brief discussion of 33.19(11)(g) follows:

- 1. The proposed alteration of the rear addition slightly modifies the height of the existing roof; however, the proposed roof is not taller than the adjacent rear addition. The existing structure remains visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
- 2. The street façade is not changing.
- 3. The street façade is not changing.
- 4. The main roof is not being altered by this proposal. A small portion of the rear addition roof is being altered which will change the appearance; however, staff believes the appearance is being improved by this alteration.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alterations are met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

- 1. The proportion of the rear window labeled 3224 in the drawings does not match the existing proportion of adjacent windows. Staff requests that the Applicant select an appropriately proportioned window for this location.
- 2. The Applicant shall confirm that corner boards will be used on the exterior alteration since they are not shown in the submitted drawings.
- 3. The Applicant shall clarify the proposed material and finish for the porch elements. Staff prefers that cedar materials be left natural and that pressure treated materials, if used, be painted within 12 months of installation.
- 4. Lattice panels or similar shall be installed between the porch deck and grade.