

Regarding: 613 Williamson Street – Designated Landmark – Third Lake Ridge Historic District – Alteration/replacement of three windows in Machinery Row. 6th Ald. District
Contact: James McFadden, McFadden & Company (Legistar #29676)

Date: April 15, 2013
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon, Preservation Planner

General Information:

The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the alteration of three windows on the eastern side of the Williamson Street elevation. The existing masonry openings will remain largely unchanged. Brick panels below three existing windows will be removed to allow the windows to be enlarged and match the size and configuration of the adjacent windows on the façade. Windows have previously been replaced.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance sections:

33.19(5)(b) Regulation of Construction, Reconstruction and Exterior Alteration.

4. Upon filing of any application with the Landmarks Commission, the Landmarks Commission shall determine:
 - a. Whether, in the case of a designated landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would detrimentally change, destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which said work is to be done; and

33.19(8) Maintenance of Landmarks, Landmark Sites and Historic Districts

1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

33.19(11)(f) Guideline Criteria for New Development in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.

1. Any new structures shall be evaluated according to both of the criteria listed in Sec. 33.19(11)(d); that is, compatibility of gross volume and height.
2. The rhythm of solids and voids in the street facade(s) of any new structure shall be compatible with the buildings within its visually related area.
3. The materials used in the street facade(s) of any new structure shall be compatible with those used in the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
4. The design of the roof of any new structure shall be compatible with those of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
5. The rhythm of building masses and spaces created by the construction of a new structure shall be compatible with the existing rhythm of masses and spaces for those sites within its visually related area.

33.19(11)(d) Guideline Criteria for New Development in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Manufacturing Use.

1. The gross volume of any new structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
2. The height of any new structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.

33.19(11)(g) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.

1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Staff Evaluation and Recommendations:

The staff evaluation of each criterion follows:

33.19(5)(b) Regulation of Construction, Reconstruction and Exterior Alteration.

- 4.a. In the case of this designated landmark, the proposed work would detrimentally change and destroy the exterior architectural feature/original window size however, the proposed alteration is reversible and the original configuration can be restored in the future.

33.19(8)1. Maintenance of Landmarks, Landmark Sites and Historic Districts

1. Not applicable
2. The proposed alteration of the street facade of this structure retains the original historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. The proposed alteration of the street facade of this structure does not retain the original or existing historical materials as brick panels below each window must be removed; however, the proposed alteration is reversible and the original configuration can be restored.
4. Not applicable

33.19(11)(g) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.

1. Not applicable
2. The proposed alteration of the street façade of this structure retains the original historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. The proposed alteration of the street facade of this structure does not retain the original or existing historical materials as brick panels below each window must be removed; however, the proposed alteration is reversible and the original configuration can be restored.
4. Not applicable

Because the proposed alteration can be reversed, the resultant appearance of the three windows will match the adjacent windows on the elevation, and the windows have previously been replaced, staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alterations are met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall use construction methods and practices that allow the proposed alteration to be reversible.
2. The Applicant shall use construction methods and practices that allow historic fabric to be retained on site. For example, the existing window sills shall be retained on site in perpetuity.
3. The arched top transom windows shall have vertical muntin to match adjacent windows.