

24 February 2011

Amy Scanlon - Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development
Bill Fruhling- Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development
Dan Stephans – Chair, Madison Landmarks Commission

In advance of the February 28 meeting of the Landmarks Commission, please see comments below on agenda items from the *Madison Trust for Historic Preservation* and *National Trust for Historic Preservation*.

Item 1 – 209 N. Prospect Ave.

We concur with the staff report. The proposed new construction on this parcel meets the design guidelines for the University Heights Historic District in terms of size, scale, height, massing, and materials. The contemporary design is boldly divergent from the stylistic trends in the district, but fits well in terms of these other aspects. The general policy of the MTHP when it comes to infill construction in historic districts is to encourage high-quality designs that reflect the ideals of their time rather than designs that attempt to emulate existing designs and muddling the interpretation of the area's development pattern. This design accomplishes that. It represents the simplicity, compactness, and rigorous geometry common to 21st-century residential Modernism.

The common thread that unites the residences in the University Heights District is the quality of design and materials. Houses have been designed and built to last well past 100 years with reasonable maintenance and repair. Although it's not in the Landmarks Commission's purview to require it, we would encourage the applicants to strive for the highest quality materials as is feasible for this project so that it will survive for generations as an early 21st-century contribution to the University Heights Historic District.

Item 2 – 14 S. Franklin St.

No Concerns. Concur with Staff Report.

Item 3 – Landmarks Commission Procedures

--

Item 4 – Landmarks Ordinance Revisions

The MTHP requests that the Landmarks Commission include, in your recommendations for revisions to the Landmarks Ordinance, a requirement for HABS Level I or II documentation in cases where the Commission allows demolition of a Landmark property or property in a local or national Historic District. In cases of irreparable damage by fire or natural disaster, documentation would obviously be limited to the surviving integrity of the property. But in the rare case where a

Dedicated to Preserving Madison's Historic Places

MADISON TRUST



for Historic Preservation

NATIONAL
TRUST
FOR
HISTORIC
PRESERVATION®

landmark site is granted a demolition permit, HABS documentation would at least record that piece of our built environment.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'J. Tish', with a long, sweeping underline that extends to the right.

Jason Tish
Executive Director
Madison Trust for Historic Preservation

Dedicated to Preserving Madison's Historic Places

P.O. Box 296 Madison, Wisconsin 53701-0296

608-441-8864

www.madisonpreservation.org