



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Monday, February 23, 2009

4:45 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
Room LL-130 (Madison Municipal Building)

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Present: 4 -

Erica Fox Gehrig; Daniel J. Stephans; Michael J. Rosenblum and Christina Slattery

Excused: 3 -

Brenda K. Konkel; Stuart Levitan and Robin M. Taylor

APPROVAL OF February 9, 2009 LANDMARKS MINUTES

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Slattery, to Approve the February 9, 2009 Minutes. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mary Mohs, 512 Wisconsin Avenue, spoke against a potential proposal to expand the Edgewater Hotel. She warned that the proposal will ruin the Mansion Hill Historic District. She asked the Commission to denounce the project.

Eugene Devitt, 28 E Gilman Street, also spoke against a potential Edgewater Hotel expansion. Mr. Devitt showed the Commission some existing views and site plans of the existing hotel. He noted that there was very little commercial development in the neighborhood, and that this type of redevelopment would be out of character. He stated that the neighborhood is not interested in an expansion of commercial uses.

Fred Mohs, 512 Wisconsin Avenue, also spoke against a potential Edgewater Hotel expansion. He described a 1963 agreement that allowed a hotel addition that was negotiated to retain the view to the lake from Wisconsin Avenue. Mr. Mohs reiterated that the parking situation in the neighborhood was already a problem when the current hotel had large events. A larger hotel would only exacerbate the parking problem. Mr. Mohs emphasized that the developer will be seeking city assistance for this project, including TIF, waterfront setback relief and additional vacated right-of-way. He asked that the Commission reject this proposal.

John Sheean, 25 Langdon, also spoke against a potential Edgewater Hotel expansion. He noted that it was a commercial endeavor in a residential neighborhood, and that the streets and parking were not meant to handle this kind of development. A large hotel entertainment enterprise doesn't seem to fit in with the neighborhood.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. [13334](#) 207 North Spooner Street, University Heights Historic District - presentation on potential variance request to reconstruct the roof structure to provide additional living space

Contact: Peter Barden, Schorr Construction Inc.

Jodi and Peter Bloch, 207 N. Spooner Street registered in support of the project. Mr. Bloch briefly recapped the information from the January 26, 2009 informational presentation given to the Commission. Mr. Bloch then talked through a handout that he had sent to the Commission, noting his rebuttal to several items in the staff report. Mr. Bloch noted his willingness to change the siding material on the dormers to a cedar shake, if necessary to gain the Commission's approval. Mr. Bloch displayed some information from two previous projects in University Heights that were allowed to raise the height of the roof. One was at 1915 Kendall Avenue, which was noted in the staff report, and the other at 1725 Chadbourne Ave. He asked staff to clarify the height and roof differential of the Chadbourne project. Staff noted that on the 1725 Chadbourne Project, approved in 2001, the height was raised approximately 3-feet, and that the roof pitch change went from a 8:12 pitch to a 10:12 pitch.

Mr. Peter Barden, 5117 Minocqua Crescent registered in support. Mr. Barden added that the design keeps the hip style shape of the roof, and that the height was still lower than the surrounding properties.

Mr. Rosenblum noted that the proposal clearly violates two of the criteria in the University Heights Historic District.

Ms Gehrig encouraged the owners to discuss their ideas with the neighborhood association, about whether or not the current Historic District criteria are still what the neighborhood desires, and if not, the neighborhood association and property owners could consider a revision of the criteria for the District.

Ms Slattery noted that the proposal has a lot of really great design and detailing, but that the issue of scale was of major concern.

Mr. Stephans, noted that the proposal significantly alters the character of the house, but that the owners should discuss their ideas with the larger neighborhood to see if there is a consensus to change the criteria.

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Slattery, to Deny the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness citing the violation of the Height and Roof Shape provisions of the University Heights Historic District. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

2. [13621](#) 1805 Van Hise Avenue, University Heights Historic District - consideration of issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition to the back porch and the enclosure of the lower basement area to create additional living space.

Contact: Eric Donovan, TDS Construction

Mr. Eric Donovan, 302 W Main Street, Mt Horeb, WI registered in support of the project. Mr. Donovan briefly described the project and noted that the owner wished to match all materials to keep the historic integrity of the house.

Betty and Andy MacEwan, 1805 Van Hise Avenue, registered in support.

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Slattery, to Approve a Certificate

of Appropriateness for the project. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

3. [12526](#) 1144-1148 Jenifer Street, Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Consideration of issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness for the relocation of an existing house from 430 South Thornton Avenue to a vacant lot at 1148 Jenifer Street, along with minor modifications to the relocated house, and the minor addition of a new second floor deck to the existing house at 1148 Jenifer Street.

Contact: Mark Schmidt, Knapp Schmidt Architects

Mark Schmidt, W4114 Dakota Lane, Wautoma, WI, registered in support. He briefly described the potential relocation and proposed changes to the house. He noted that they could ensure that all of the conditions as described in the staff report would be met.

Navin Jarugumilli, 18 Shepard Terrace, registered in support.

Ms Gehrig asked staff if the Commission needed to approve the project in one or two motions, due to the fact that the house had to be moved, as well as small changes to both the relocated house, as well as minor changes to the other existing house on the lot were being proposed. Staff replied that since this was a PUD application, they could look at the project as a whole, but could add conditions/restrictions as needed.

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Slattery, to Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project with conditions which included:

- 1. All new and existing porch steps on the relocated house are to be built with risers.**
- 2. Framed lattices to be installed under the steps and porches.**
- 3. All new materials used on changes to the back and side of the relocated house to match existing.**

The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PRELIMINARY CONSIDERATION OF LANDMARK NOMINATIONS

4. [13713](#) 448 West Washington Avenue - Holstein Friesian Association Building
Proposed landmark nomination.
Owners: Robert Keller, Keller Real Estate Group
Applicant: Elizabeth Miller, Madison Trust for Historic Preservation
- Robert H Keller, 448 West Washington Avenue registered in opposition. He asked the Commission why this building should be designated a landmark when there are many other examples of Art deco buildings in Madison. Mr. Keller noted that he had no plans to change the building, but liked the idea of keeping some flexibility, that would be lost if it was designated a landmark.
- David Keller, 448 West Washington Avenue registered in opposition. Her noted that he had not seen a copy of the nomination form, and would like some time to review it before the decision is made to move forward. Mr. Keller asked for a delay in the preliminary discussion.
- Jason Tish, Madison Trust for Historic Preservation, registered in support. He explained that the building was identified as a potential landmark in the City's Preservation Plan, and that The Trust had sent letters to the owners about their intention, and had not heard of opposition, so they went forward with the nomination.

Rosemary Lee, 111 W. Wilson, registered in opposition.

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Slattery, to accept the Landmarks Nomination in order to schedule a public hearing on the matter for no earlier than the second Landmarks Commission meeting in April to allow the building owner extra time to review the nomination. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

5. [13715](#)

151/153 West Wilson Street - Sayles Three-flat Building

Proposed landmark nomination.

Owners: Apex Investment Group, LLC, Bruce Bosben

Applicant: Elizabeth Miller, Madison Trust for Historic Preservation

Bruce Bosben, 1741 Commercial Ave, registered in opposition. He noted his opposition to the nomination saying that he believes that it was a political move rather than a true effort to save the building. He noted an error in the nomination form that said that the new railings were "turned", he said that they are squared railings purchased at Menards. Mr. Bosben also noted that he brought a presentation, and two architects who have examples of much better 3-flat and Queen Anne style buildings throughout Madison. He asked that the Commission if it was possible to deny the nomination this evening.

Ms Gehrig noted that tonight's discussion was only to determine the completeness of the nomination documents. No recommendation on the nomination will be made this evening.

Mr. Bosben stated that they still have the old columns in storage, but a safety hazard compelled Apex Management to change the railings and columns, noting that the cove moldings were barely attached to the old non-code compliant railings.

Tom Cox, Durrant Architecture, registered in opposition. He said that the landmarks application had overused the term "Queen Anne" in describing the building. He noted that Queen Anne buildings usually have more of a "Gingerbread House" look to them.

Jerry Obon, 661 Kahen Ct, Hartland WI, registered in opposition.

Jason Tish, Madison Trust for Historic Preservation, registered in support. He reiterated that the Madison Trust for Historic Preservation uses the 1998 Madison Downtown Preservation Plan when determining potential Landmark Nominations. This building was identified in that Plan.

Mr. Stephans asked for clarification about how this Preservation Plan came to be. Mr. Tish said that consultants hired by the City of Madison wrote the plan. The consultants included Tim Hagland, Elizabeth Miller, along with Kitty Rankin, the City's former Preservation Planner. The plan included a list of potential Landmarks, which is how the Madison Trust starts its nomination process. This building is eligible as a three-flat building and has transitional elements from both Queen Anne and Colonial Revival styles. Staff noted that the plan is available online: (address provide only in the minutes)

<http://www.cityofmadison.com/neighborhoods/downtownplan/pdf/histpres.pdf>

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Slattery, to accept the Landmarks nomination in order to schedule a public hearing on the matter for no earlier than the second Landmarks Commission meeting in April to allow the building owner extra time to review the nomination. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

6. [13717](#) 1450 Monroe Street - University of Wisconsin Field House
Proposed landmark nomination.
Owners: University of Wisconsin Board of Regents
Contact: Gary Brown Director, Campus Planning & Landscape Architecture, Facilities Planning & Management
Applicant: Christina Endres, Madison Trust for Historic Preservation
Gary Brown, 610 Walnut Street, Madison, registered in support. He noted that the building has been on the National Register since 1998, and that the nomination of this building was perfectly acceptable to the University.

Christina Enders, 926 Spaight Street, Madison, registered in support.

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Gehrig, to accept the Landmarks nomination in order to schedule a Public Hearing for the first available Commission meeting, most likely the first meeting in April. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

OTHER BUSINESS

7. [08717](#) Buildings proposed for demolition

Mr. Stephans noted that the State of Wisconsin was in the middle of considering the demolition of the Wisconsin Hospital Building, part of the Mendota Mental Health Complex on the Northside of Madison. The contract for demolition is at the Governor's Office. The Governor has received a lot of public input about the important historical significance of the building, and has not yet acted on the contract. There was no other report or discussion from staff.
8. [07804](#) Secretary's Report

No report or discussion.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Slattery, to Adjourn at 6:15 p.m. The motion passed by voice vote/other.