

AGENDA # 7

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION **PRESENTED:** October 21, 2009

TITLE: 129 West Gorham Street – PUD(GDP) for a Five-Story, 46-Unit Apartment Building.
4th Ald. Dist. (16319) **REFERRED:**
REREFERRED:
REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary **ADOPTED:** **POF:**

DATED: October 21, 2009 **ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, John Harrington, Richard Wagner, Mark Smith, Ron Luskin and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 21, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a PUD(GDP) located at 129 West Gorham Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were J. Randy Bruce, Tom Sather and Henry Gempeler, all representing Silverstone Partners. The project provides for the development on an existing surface parking lot which is a portion of the Holy Redeemer Church site which is located within the Mansion Hill Historic District. The plans provide for the development of five-story, 46-unit apartment building which is intended to be compatible with its relationship to the Holy Redeemer Church, as well as the requirements of the Mansion Hill Historic District. Staff noted that the project will require a certificate of appropriateness relative to its location within the historic district. Bruce provided an overview of the plans which was followed by the following comments by the Commission:

- Bruce's approach is right on with relationship to church; look at porches on Gorham as with the existing adjacent apartment building.
- The EIFS above on the upper story not appropriate, should be the same treatment as the lower elevation, in addition to making the upper elevation color the same as the lower.
- The contrast of the center of the side elevation should be the same as that proposed on the upper stories.
- The juncture with historic building a problem; need context.
- Need to understand function of the building working with the church; buildings are jammed onto each other, look at a program space between.
- Good start with the site plan and massing right on with the elevations handsome and the use of EIFS unfortunate.
- The functionality between the church and the site not critical, appears as a non-landmark issue.
- The off-set at the corner of the building with the church is reasonable.
- Use metal instead of EIFS or as a fallback use brick.
- Treat west and south elevation as with much care as with the east and west elevations.
- Important on Gorham Street to have a uniform material treatment with a different treatment on the side.
- Need to provide 75-100 bicycle parking stalls in addition to providing for moped parking.
- Look at a different plant species in trays and use steel edging, not vinyl.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 7, 7, 7.5 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 129 West Gorham Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	6	-	-	-	-	-	6
	7	8	-	-	-	5	8	8
	6	7	-	-	-	-	-	7
	8	7	-	-	-	7	8	7.5
								info
								6
	6	7	-	-	-	6.5	8	7

General Comments:

- Need 75-100 bike parking stalls.
- Excellent start.
- No EIFS on Gorham St. Like stepback and green roof. Nice start.
- Address the east and south elevations with same care and detail of north and west.
- Uncomfortable concept in urban/historic context. Study detail in relation to historic structures.