

## AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

<b>REPORT OF:</b> URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	<b>PRESENTED:</b> September 3, 2008
<b>TITLE:</b> 822-844 John Nolen Drive – Comprehensive Design Review of Signage for a New Hotel and Restaurant in Urban Design District No. 1, Continuance from August 13, 2008. 14 <sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist. (11332)	<b>REFERRED:</b> <b>REREFERRED:</b> <b>REPORTED BACK:</b>
<b>AUTHOR:</b> Alan J. Martin, Secretary	<b>ADOPTED:</b> <b>POF:</b>
<b>DATED:</b> September 3, 2008	<b>ID NUMBER:</b>

---

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Ronald Luskin, Jay Ferm, Marsha Rummel, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington and Richard Wagner.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of September 3, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a Comprehensive Design Review of signage as a continuance for the consideration of a single component of an overall sign plan that was previously approved located at 822-844 John Nolen Drive. Appearing on behalf of the project was Christopher Thiel, representing SAA. Thiel returned to the Commission for final approval of signage on upper portions of the west façade; he presented several alternatives to deal with the “aloft, W Hotel” configuration as represented in proposed Options 7, 8 and 9. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Option 9 is readable as a repeat of the porte cochere signage atop the building.
- Option 8 is cleaner, works well with building.
- Option 8 still looks like a billboard, like Option 7, looks more like a sign.

### **ACTION:**

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-2) with Ferm and Host-Jablonski voting no. The motion for approval of Option 8 with the remainder of the signage package as previously approved under the provision for comprehensive design review of signage.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6, 7 and 7.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 822-844 John Nolen Drive**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7

General Comments:

- Approvable.
- Too much like a billboard.