AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	**PRESENTED:** September 5, 2012
TITLE: 638 Hercules Court – PUD(SIP), Two Apartment Buildings. 3rd Ald. Dist. (27551)	**REFERRED:**
	REREFERRED:
	REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	**ADOPTED:** **POF:**
DATED: September 5, 2012	**ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Marsha Rummel, Melissa Huggins, Dawn O'Kroley, Tom DeChant, John Harrington and Cliff Goodhart.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 5, 2012, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a PUD(SIP) located at 638 Hercules Court. Appearing on behalf of the project were Brian Stoddard, and Brian Munson, representing Veridian Homes. Munson presented the northern transition out of the center of the development, 95 units in a variety of buildings that respond to the surrounding trees and duplex units across the street. They address the street edge and moved the parking to the center of the development. Stoddard discussed the architecture of the two, 3-story buildings with underground parking. The exception is the building along Hercules Way; in trying to show some sensitivity to the drop in grades the duplex units nearby they have dropped it to a 2-story building element. A large landscaped area is proposed in between the parking to break up the pavement. As the buildings front the street, they have individual unit entries. The site slopes significantly so the ends of the building will not have direct connections to the units. Building materials proposed include asphalt shingle, aluminum fascia/soffit, vinyl siding on the upper band with composite corners and composite trim around the windows. A lighter siding at some break points between other architectural elements is also being looked at. MagicPak units are being looked at for the air conditioning units and air vents, which they will attempt to locate perpendicular to the parallel face at the building façade.

Discussion by the Commission was as follows:

- It would be nice if you had context photos next time, it aids in the discussion on flat roof and building materials.
- The use of "not" vinyl would be nice; look at an alternative material.
  - Munson noted that a lot of the other development out here in Grandview have pitched roofs.
  - What's across the street is the Oak Park Place campus, ranging from 2-stories with pitched roofs and flat roofs. We wanted to try to mix and match for an eclectic nature. The other aspect as it transitions out is duplexes and single families with different roof types.
- Grandview should be more of an urban style. I think we would prefer to see a flat roof in a more urban style and form. It would have some nods to what's across the street but it should stand on its own.

- As a condition of approval for the project you'll need to identify those specimens to be maintained (tree inventory). Staff noted the need to identify all trees to be preserved at a minimum of 6" in diameter with Harrington noting his desire to identify trees in excess of 18" in diameter.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall rating for this project is 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 638 Hercules Trail

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	6	-	-	-	6	5	6
	6	5	-	-	-	-	-	-

General Comments:

- Flat or pitched roof could work, but if pitched, needs to be effectively scaled.

AGENDA # 7

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	**PRESENTED:** October 17, 2012
TITLE: 638 Hercules Trail – PUD(SIP), Two Apartment Buildings. 3rd Ald. Dist. (27551)	**REFERRED:**
	REREFERRED:
	REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	**ADOPTED:** **POF:**
DATED: October 17, 2012	**ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Marsha Rummel, Richard Slayton, Dawn O'Kroley, John Harrington, Henry Lufler, Cliff Goodhart and Tom DeChant.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 17, 2012, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(SIP) located at 638 Hercules Trail. Appearing on behalf of the project was Brian Stoddard. Stoddard provided context for the development site. Buildings will be three-stories stepping down to two-stories as the grade drops from south to north. Parking is internalized with underground parking in both buildings. Materials will include vinyl siding, composite corners and trim, and brick with color to break the horizontal building mass. A pathway leads to a couple of seating areas towards the wooded area. A 42" ornamental fence is proposed.

Comments from the Commission were as follows:

- Look into creating a walk-through path to the woods.
- Look at the ability to bring water into the woods and filter it through.
- Recommend you use some kind of ground cover other than grass in the islands (not stone).
- The Sugar Maples and Savannah don't go together, they're going to compete with the grasses; use Oaks.
- I'd encourage you to play with that wooded edge (utilizing Oaks) so it's not such a straight line.
- Add trees to islands and question the lack of plantings on the interior edge of the buildings.
- Rethink the walks and make them a little bit more responsive to the way people could walk toward the building; make it more park-like. Where walks intersects look at some kind of planting to define that intersection.
- I would suggest treating the landscaping differently on the corners.
- Your massing has some good comfort on breaking up the scale of things. A flat roof would be more appropriate for this scale development but as designed is OK.
- Have you considered running a masonry wall continuing the brick rather than the ornamental fence wrapped a few feet into the drive?
- I have a hard time with vinyl siding.

- The environmental aspects of vinyl siding are of great concern too.
- If it's a high quality vinyl, heavy gauge in small fields, that's probably the most acceptable application.
- If you keep it far away and up high it's not as offensive to being able to walk up to it and touch it an know it's plastic. Anything that emulates a natural material but isn't, is generally a lower quality choice; bring in a sample.
    - We have had a discussion with our architectural review committee and they are comfortable with it.
- Vinyl siding is OK in small fields, needs to be of heavy gauge quality, keep up high plastic with wood grain.
- Question the siting of Building "B" closeness to Halley Way, if in fact you're looking at wrapping the more mature trees around you, you may need to tuck that building back a little bit more.

ACTION:

On a motion by Lufler, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL.** The motion was passed on a vote of (7-0) and required address of the above stated comments.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 6.5 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 638 Hercules Trail

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	5	-	-	5	6	5
	5	5	5	-	-	6	5	5
	7	6	6	-	-	6	8	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6.5

General Comments:

- Need stronger stormwater plan and bike trail.
- Application of vinyl siding and details will be important for final approval.