
Regarding: **666 Wisconsin Avenue – Mansion Hill Historic District –
Review and Approval of the rehabilitation of 1946 Edgewater
Hotel building
(Legistar #20029)**

Date: September 23, 2010
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon

On May 18, 2010, the Common Council conditionally approved a rezoning to PUD-GDP-SIP and a conditional use. The conditions of the approval must be satisfied prior to final approval of the planned unit development and conditional use, recording of the planned unit development, and the issuance of permits for construction. The three conditions of approval that relate to the Landmarks Commission are included below and will be discussed as separate issues:

Condition 1

That the renovation of the exterior of the original 1946 hotel tower be conducted in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation (of historic buildings) to the extent possible as approved by the Landmarks Commission, with the exception of applying those standards to the front entry overhang, the proposed entrance at the southeastern corner of the building, which shall be constructed as originally designed, and the exception of the one-story clubhouse addition.

Condition 1 General Information

Landmarks Commissioners shall refer to the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation below:

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in a such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Condition 1 Staff Comments

The Applicant provided a cover letter that describes each Secretary of the Interior Standard for Rehabilitation as it relates to the proposed exterior work at the 1946 Edgewater Hotel. In addition, the submission included descriptive sheets entitled THE REHABILITATION APPROACH (dated September 20, 2010). Staff has reviewed the rehabilitation treatments described in the submission and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission.

Condition 2

The design details for the rehabilitation of the exterior of the 1940s hotel tower, including but not limited to, window, door, and material specifications, and brick repair, must be submitted for review and approval by the Landmarks Commission.

Condition 2 Staff Comments

The Applicant provided design details, cut sheets and specifications in the submission and addressed the rehabilitation of these elements as they relate to the Secretary of the Interior Standards. Staff has reviewed the submission and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission.

Condition 3

The design details and construction drawings for the new top floor, Rigadoon Room, and front entrance element for the 1940s tower must be submitted for review and approval by the Landmarks Commission.

Condition 3 Staff Comments

The Applicant provided design drawings for the listed elements. Staff has reviewed the drawings and recommends approval; however, it should be noted that Staff is concerned about the appearance of the roof surface of the Rigadoon Room brow element. The top surface will be visible from the exterior steps and from the lower plaza space. The proposed materials for this roof system are not specified in the submission information.