
Regarding: **2001 Van Hise Avenue –Certificate of Appropriateness for addition (over 100 square feet) to single family residence in the University Heights Historic District (Legistar #19471)**

Date: August 16, 2010
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon

General Information:

The applicant is proposing to construct an addition at 2001 Van Hise Avenue. The 2-story residence was built in 1916 by Eugene H. Marks in the vernacular prairie style.

According to the owner:

- The design of the proposed addition will expand and improve the interior spaces to allow modern functions and needs.
- The exterior materials will match/closely resemble the existing building materials.
- Existing windows will be salvaged and reused where appropriate. New windows will match adjacent window type and proportion.
- The ridge of the roof will be no taller than the existing ridge.
- The proposed roof hood over the rear door will match the details of the existing front entry hood.
- The relocation of the rear door will provide a safer exit on the shared driveway.
- The rear corner along the driveway will be squared off with the proposed addition. The 8'-0" x 28'-10" portion of the addition will be set back from this new corner by 5'-0".

Landmarks Ordinance:

The following sections of the Landmarks Ordinance are applicable to the project:

Sec. 33.19(12)(d) Criteria for the Review of Additions, Exterior Alterations and Repairs in R2 and R4A Zoning Districts.

1. Height. All additions shall be no higher than the existing building; however, if the existing building is already a nonconforming one, no addition shall be made thereto except in accordance with Section 28.05(3)(c) of the Madison General Ordinances. Roof additions resulting in an increased building volume are prohibited unless they meet the standards in Section 33.01(12)(d)7. and are permitted under Chapter 28 of the Madison General Ordinances, or approved as a variance pursuant to Sections 28.08(2)(e) and 28.12(8)(d) or approved as a conditional use or as part of a planned residential development in accordance with Section 28.085(e).

3. Repairs. Materials used in exterior repairs shall duplicate the original building materials in texture and appearance, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the existing building materials where the existing building materials differ from the original. Repairs using materials that exactly duplicate the original in composition are encouraged. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
6. Additions Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. Additions visible from the street, including additions to the top of buildings or structures, and alterations to street facades shall be compatible with the existing building in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials used in such alterations and additions shall duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details used therein shall duplicate in design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the existing building or of other buildings in University Heights of similar materials, age and architectural style, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the texture and appearance of materials and the design of architectural details used in the existing building where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
7. Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. Additions and exterior alterations that are not visible from any streets contiguous to the lot lines upon which the building or structure is located will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if their design is compatible with the scale of the existing building and, further, if the materials used are compatible with the existing materials in texture, color and architectural details. Additions and alterations shall harmonize with the architectural design of the building rather than contrast with it. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
8. Roof Shape. The roof shape of the front of a building or structure shall not be altered except to restore it to the original documentable appearance or to add a dormer or dormers in a location and shape compatible with the architectural design of the building and similar in location and shape to original dormers on buildings of the same vintage and style within the district. Alterations of the roof shape of the sides or back of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with the architectural design of the existing building. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
9. Roof Material.
 - a. If the existing roof of a building or structure is tile, slate or other material that is original to the building or structure and/or contributes to its historic character all repairs thereto shall be made using the same materials. In addition, in all cases any such roof must be repaired rather than replaced, unless the documented cost of repair exceeds the documented cost of re-roofing with a substitute material that approximates the appearance of the

original roofing material as closely as possible, in which case re-roofing with a material that approximates the appearance of the original roofing material as closely as possible will be approved by the Landmarks Commission.

- b. If the existing roofing material is asphalt shingles, sawn wood shingles or a nonhistoric material such as fiberglass, all repairs shall match in appearance the existing roof material; however, if any such roof is covered or replaced, re-roofing must be done using rectangular sawn wood shingles or rectangular shingles that are similar in width, thickness and apparent length to sawn wood shingles, for example, 3-in-1 tab asphalt shingles. Modern style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, dutch lap, french method and interlock shingles, that are incompatible with the historic character of the district are prohibited.
- c. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the ground. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)

Staff Comments:

Does the project meet the following guideline criteria?

(For the complete text of the criteria, please see Madison General Ordinances Sec. 33.01(12)(d), available on the web at www.cityofmadison.com)

Yes	<u> X </u>	No	<u> </u>	1.	Height.
Yes	<u> n/a </u>	No	<u> </u>	2.	Second exit platforms and fire escapes.
Yes	<u> X </u>	No	<u> </u>	3.	Repairs.
Yes	<u> n/a </u>	No	<u> </u>	4.	Restoration.
Yes	<u> n/a </u>	No	<u> </u>	5.	Re-siding.
Yes	<u> X </u>	No	<u> </u>	6.	Additions visible from the street and alterations to street façades.
Yes	<u> X </u>	No	<u> </u>	7.	Additions and exterior alterations not visible from the street.
Yes	<u> X </u>	No	<u> </u>	8.	Roof shape.
Yes	<u> X </u>	No	<u> </u>	9.	Roof material.
Yes	<u> n/a </u>	No	<u> </u>	10.	Parking lots.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed addition can be met and therefore, recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following condition:

- The applicants shall work with staff on the construction details of the installation and repair of the stucco and brick.