

AGENDA # 6

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: April 23, 2008
TITLE: 1723 Waldorf Boulevard – PUD(SIP), Sixty-Unit Condominium Development. 1 st Ald. Dist. (03554)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: April 23, 2008	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Marsha Rummel, Bonnie Cosgrove, John Harrington, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of April 23, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(SIP) located at 1723 Waldorf Boulevard. Appearing on behalf of the project was J. Randy Bruce, representing Terry Temple/Barrow Ridge. Prior to the presentation staff noted to the Commission that the project had already received prior approval by the Urban Design Commission, Plan Commission and Common Council in May/June of 2006. The PUD(SIP) as originally approved was not recorded in a timely manner; thus lapsed requiring reapproval under the provisions of the Zoning Code. The only changes at this time are an increase in the number of units from a total of 60 dwelling units to a potential 74-79 apartment units. The overall site design and landscape treatment is almost identical, as well as the overall architecture of the building. Staff further noted that the main issue at hand is the proposed utilization of vinyl siding as originally approved versus the use of a more durable material such as cement board siding commonly approved as a standard by the Commission with similar development at this time. Following a review of the project's details by Bruce, the Commission noted its agreement with staff's position relevant to the use of vinyl versus a cement board type of material. The Commission felt that more units providing more income should be able to support better building materials. Bruce noted that window wrap and trim boards will be a painted product to offset the use of vinyl. Issue with the toxicity of vinyl was discussed, as well as its eventual ban. The Commission further noted that an argument for more durable materials on more substantial buildings is an objective of the Commission. As an alternative how you trim it (the buildings); does help the aesthetic issue with the use of vinyl.

ACTION:

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-0). The motion for final approval was without the use of vinyl to be substituted with the use of a cement board siding or alternative wood composite material.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6, 6, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1723 Waldorf Boulevard

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	6	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	6	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7

General Comments:

- Good project, good design, which deserves a durable exterior.
- Good looking building. Don't use vinyl siding.
- Nice design.