



Project Name & Address: 946 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Legistar File ID # [63195](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: December 1, 2020

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Philip Ashby, MADhouse Architect LLC

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the roof, adding stucco to front porch, replacement of all windows, reworking of the front entrance, replacement of front stairs and railing, removal of rear balcony and replacement with 1st & 2nd story decks, and installation of new rear entry.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
 - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the roof, add stucco to front porch, replace all nonhistoric windows, rework the front entrance, replace front stairs and railing, remove rear balcony and replace with 1st & 2nd story decks, and install new rear entry.

The enclosed front porch is currently clad with clapboard and the proposal is to clad this area in stucco to match the exterior cladding of the rest of the structure. There will be new shingles for the roof and repointing of the chimney, repair and repainting of existing stucco, replacement of the wood baffles at the side of the entryway with materials in-kind, replacement of the front steps with materials in-kind, replacement of the existing aluminum front railing with a more simplified design, and repair of the existing front door.

The more significant changes come on the sides where the applicant proposes to alter some of the window locations, modify some basement windows to become egress windows, and replace an existing side door. These changes are substantially stepped back from the front façade. On the rear of the building, the applicant proposes to alter some window openings and replace the existing doors with period appropriate doors. The rear balcony will be removed and replaced with a larger rear deck with second-floor balcony.

There are minimal changes to the street façade of the building, with the most significant being the introduction of stucco on the previously enclosed front porch. This area will still read as an enclosed porch due to the remaining columns that frame the space. The other alterations are in keeping with the character of the building, with the larger changes taking place at the rear of the structure.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:

1. The new rear balcony will not be taller than the existing structure and is the same height as the existing balcony.
 2. No changes to the landscape treatment.
 3. The alterations to the window openings on the sides and the rear maintain an established pattern of the rhythm of masses and spaces, but otherwise there is no significant change to the overall building masses.
- (b) No changes to the rhythm of solids and voids on the street façade.
- (c) The enclosed front porch is not a historic alteration and the introduction of stucco does not remove historic materials. All of the windows that are proposed for replacement are nonhistoric and will be replaced with a product that replicates the existing.
- (d) No changes to the roof form. The currently proposed shingle type has exaggerated shadow lines, which would be out of character. Staff recommends the Oakridge line of shingles if the applicant wishes to keep with an Owens Corning product.
- (e) No changes to window and door sizes on the street façade.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Owens Corning Oakridge shingles for the roofing material