

AGENDA # 8

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: January 7, 2009
TITLE: 425 West Washington Avenue – PUD(GDP-SIP) to Construct a Mixed-Use Development. 4 th Ald. Dist. (13147)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: January 7, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Chair; Mark Smith, Dawn Weber, Richard Wagner, Richard Slayton, Jay Ferm, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett and John Harrington.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of January 7, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a mixed-use development located at 425 West Washington Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project were Erik Minton, John Bonsett-Veal, David Ferch, representing Butler Plaza, and Rosemary Lee. Ferch provided a brief description of prior history of a failed development on the property a number of years ago for a 9-story residential/commercial health club building on the site. He noted that the current proposal provides for the development of a 4-story, with a stepback 5th story structure scaled down to address neighborhood concerns and consistency with the adopted neighborhood development plan. He further noted the adopted plan supports 2-4 story development. Ferch then provided a detailed review of the building elevations emphasizing the development of the first floor for commercial office purposes, the second floor for the health club and pool, with the upper stories dedicated for residential use including the development of a rooftop terrace. The project's developer Erik Minton then spoke as to the neighborhood process and evolution of the building's features. Bonsett-Veal, the property's owner and partner in development spoke to the development opportunities the project provides. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Need a better landscape plan as a departure from the “garden center approach.”
- Eliminate red granite and the use of vinyl edging; consider the use of river washed stone.
- Provide a hedge screen for bike parking away from the front door.
- The landscape materials are inferior as proposed.
- Good project but stuck on the garage door in front.
- Like building in general but the gym façade looks like an apartment. Make architecture reflect what's inside.
- Consider reducing the width of garage door drive aisle.
- Fiber cement siding on penthouse not the answer, go to a metal panel.
- Pull 5th story to the street and west over the garage entry, make the rest of the 5th level open space.
- Make the penthouse the same material as the rest of the building.
- Like project, need to provide daily use residential bike parking stalls on the outside of the building.

- The 5th story is OK, will support if Ald. Verveer supports.
- The health club portion of the building should look like a health club.
- Find right way to pass vertical elements through to the upper floors to make appearance of the commercial/health club levels.
- Resolve garage door issue graphically and push back.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 425 West Washington Avenue

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	6	2	-	-	5	7	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	5	5	3	-	-	4	5	-
	6	7	4	-	-	-	6	6

General Comments:

- Address garage entry. Setback 5th floor OK. Architecture should reflect mix of uses. Good start.
- Good project. Needs more bike parking for residents who bike every day. Bottom level bike area is only suitable for long-term storage.
- Good direction; landscape needs great improvement to reflect the quality of the architecture.
- I'm OK with 5th floor/penthouse. Landscape needs development. Will it really be red and green like Christmas? Good redevelopment idea.
- Planting plan must be in the style of the architecture.