

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

December 17, 2018

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 5 E Wilson, Madison Club

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an alteration to a landmark site

Legistar File ID # [54015](#)

Prepared By: William Fruhling, Acting Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: December 10, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: The Madison Club

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for an alteration to a designated landmark site to install a canopy along the side elevation and replace the fabric on an existing canopy.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The landmark site is located at 5 East Wilson Street.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) NA
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is proposing to install a canopy running the full length of the walkway along the southwest side of the building. A canopy previously covered about half this length (to the side entrance) before it was destroyed by a storm approximately 15 years ago. The proposed canopy would not extend beyond the front façade nor will it have removable side panels to fully enclose it as the prior canopy did. The portion of the canopy from the front façade to the side entrance will utilize the previous canopy's existing anchors in the building, so new holes are not expected to be drilled into the building's brick or stone. However, it is expected that holes will need to be drilled for the portion of the canopy extending from the side entrance to the service door.

The fabric of the existing canopy on the northeast (Hilton) side of the building will be replaced to match the design of the proposed new canopy.

41.18(1)(a) instructs the Landmarks Commission to review the alteration request using the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. N/A
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved and no distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be removed.
3. N/A
4. N/A
5. All distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. N/A
7. N/A
8. N/A
9. The addition of the canopy will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. However, the supporting structure will be installed using anchor bolts in the building and posts attached to the top of the stone cap on a short wall along the walkway. The applicant expects that the wall anchors for the prior canopy will be reused for that portion of the new canopy.

10. If the canopy is removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the alteration request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. Alterations to designated landmark buildings and sites should be carefully evaluated to ensure appropriate treatment of the landmark and the retention of architectural, cultural or historic significance. In this case the proposed alteration is minimally attached to the landmark structure and is easily removed, so will not frustrate the public interest in this regard.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a new canopy and the recovering of an existing canopy are met and recommend that the Landmarks Commission approve this request subject to the following condition:

- 1) No new holes shall be drilled in the brick or masonry of any building façade, and that any new holes be drilled in mortar joints.