

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION **PRESENTED:** October 7, 2009

TITLE: 115 & 117 South Bassett Street - **REFERRED:**
PUD(GDP-SIP) for the Conversion of a **REREFERRED:**
Single-Family Home into a Three-Unit and **REPORTED BACK:**
a Three-Unit into a Four-Unit Building
plus a new five-unit house. 4th Ald. Dist.
(14911)

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: October 7, 2009

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Ron Luskin, Richard Wagner and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 7, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 115 and 117 South Bassett Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Matthew Aro, Rosemary Lee, Josh Johnson and Brandon Cook. Johnson and Aro summarized the issues with the original redevelopment of the lot undertaken by their client, Brandon Cook prior to their hire as architects on the project. Johnson and Aro noted that the scope of the project based on their involvement has now changed to provide for the expansion of the building located at 115 South Bassett Street into a 3-unit maintaining the bulk and mass of the existing structure with an addition to the house's rear, along with the conversion of the building at 117 South Bassett from a 2-unit into a 4-unit with both buildings featuring revised architecture and design elements. Johnson and Aro further noted a departure from a previously proposed coach house building at the rear of the combined sites to provide for development of a more modern architecture as part of a 6-unit residential structure. Formal consideration of the modified project was deferred to the request of the neighborhood association, which desired Urban Design Commission feedback on the modified proposal prior to its review. Aro and Johnson provided an overview of the details for the redesign of the existing structures in combination with the development of the modern style 6-unit to its rear. The building materials in the 6-unit would consist of fiber cement siding with the use of EIFS on porch and balcony areas. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- With everything that is going on on the site, OK to go with style on the building to the rear but need to break the ground between the parking area and the front of the building with vining on buildings.
- Concern with obscuring of view with solid panels on porches of the 6-unit. Need to be more open.
- Need to resolve line at the ground plane with the 6-unit.
- The existing building at 117, the roofline still doesn't work.
- Use Upright Hawthorne in the outdoor plaza.
- Like Brandon Cook getting architects, step up, kudos.
- Provide for information on dealing with on-site stormwater management.

- Provide an accessible parking stall.
- The muted beiges on the 6-unit don't arise to the level of architecture.
- The backside of the rear elevation of the building at 117 South Bassett still not there.
- Not a lot of room for landscaping but need landscaping that works better with the architecture. Prairie plantings not good with the absence of lots of sun. The use of no mow fescue is OK, consider the use of Muscle Wood/American Hophorn Bean instead of Hawthorne, or use taller Ginkgo.
- Use a structure vine/grid to provide for more unique plantings that work with the architecture of the six-unit.
- Consider use of clump variety bamboo, not spreading.
- Address parking signage and assignment parking issue in a tasteful way.
- Study the use of color on the new building in context with that proposed on the renovated structures.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 7, 7.5 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 115 & 117 South Bassett Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	5	6	5	5	-	5	6	6
	6	7	-	-	-	7	7	7
	-	7	-	-	-	6	7	-
	6	8	6	-	-	-	8	8
	7	8	7	7	-	8	8	7.5

General Comments:

- Landscaping opportunities must be exploited, contemporary approach to match new building is anticipated.
- Bold, creative, thoughtful solution to a tough problem. Thanks for stepping up. Study using color on new building. Existing (117) roof design still needs considerable work.
- Innovative and striking building. Plant a minimalist landscape against it.
- Wonderful – great ideas. Keep ‘em coming.
- Modernist carriage house! A vast improvement over previous efforts.