

CITY OF MADISON, WISCONSIN

REPORT OF: President's Work Group on Improvements to Budget Process

TITLE: Final Report and Recommendations

AUTHOR: Ald. Tim Bruer, Common Council President & Chair

DATED: July 11, 2008

The President's Work Group on Improvements to the Budget Process was created in response to the adoption of Resolution, Legislative File No. 08238 by the Common Council on February 26, 2008 (see attached resolution).

Members of the President's Work Group on Improvements to the Budget Process included:

CCOC Appointments: Ald. Brenda Konkel, District 2 and Ald. Michael Schumacher, District 18

Board of Estimates Appointments: Ald. Zach Brandon, District 7 and Ald. Satya Rhodes-Conway, District 12

Common Council President, Ald. Tim Bruer, District 14

President's Designee – President Pro Tem, Ald. Mark Clear, District 19

Alternates: Ald. Mike Verveer, District 4 and Ald. Judy Compton, District 16

The work group met three times: May 16, 2008, May 27, 2008 and June 4, 2008. Guy Van Rensselaer (Organizational Development Specialist/City Organization Development & Training) facilitated the meetings (see attached meeting handouts/notes).

The following is the list of improvements to the budget process that were identified by the work group:

Identified Improvements to the Budget Process

1. Room structure (BOE meetings)
2. Provide Department information to Council prior to introduction
3. Create an earlier budget introduction date
4. Move amendment due dates up by one day (not on Friday's)
5. Create incentives to reward working within the process
6. Better explanation of process (closer to budget time)
7. Get everyone/increase attendance at BOE meetings
8. Public engagement with budget
9. Don't schedule budget 3 nights in a row

Recommendations were categorized into two groups; a set of short-term solutions that can be implemented in time for this year's (2009) budget cycle, and longer-term objectives for next year and beyond.

Recommendations to improve the 2009 Budget Process

1. Room structure (Board of Estimates meetings on the budget)

- Reserve space equivalent to Room 201
- Chairs for each alder
- Improve use of microphones/amplification system
- Encourage every alder who attend
- Stress that all alders are equal participants at the meetings
- Operate Board of Estimates meetings as a meeting of the Common Council Committee of the Whole

Responsible for implementation: *Comptroller's Office and Council Leadership*

2. Provide Department information to Council prior to introduction

- Provide Council members with agency requests earlier in the budget process (full requests if available)
- Revenue estimates

Responsible for implementation: *Comptroller's Office and Mayor's Office*

3. Move amendment due dates up by one day (not Fridays)

- Introduce amendments one day earlier
- Return amendments one day earlier
- At BOE and Council

Responsible for implementation: *Comptroller's Office and CCOC*

4. Get everyone/increase attendance at BOE meetings

- Food
- Remind department's about BOE meeting dates
- Communication from Council President
- Schedule later

Responsible for implementation: *Council President and CCOC*

Recommendations to improve the Future Budget Processes

1. Increase public involvement with the budget process
2. Investigate the feasibility of moving up introduction dates in order to give Council members more time to study the budget.

Attachments:

Resolution, Legislative File No. 08238 – Adopted by Common Council 2/26/08
Budget Process Improvement Handout – developed from 5/27/08 and 6/4/08 Meetings
Substitute Resolution, Legislative File No. 11091 – Adopted by Common Council 7/15/08



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Master

File Number: 08238

File ID: 08238

File Type: Resolution

Status: Passed

Version: 2

Reference:

Controlling Body: COMMON
COUNCIL
ORGANIZATIONAL
COMMITTEE

File Created Date : 11/20/2007

File Name: Recommendations for improvements to the budget process.

Final Action: 02/26/2008

Title: SUBSTITUTE - Requesting a report with recommendations from a Common Council President's Workgroup regarding improvements to the budget process.

Notes: Intro from the floor.

Sponsors: Brenda K. Konkel

Enactment Date: 02/29/2008

Attachments: 08238 substitute language (Ald. Konkel) ,08238 version 1

Enactment Number: RES-08-00201

Author: Ald. Brenda K. Konkel

Hearing Date:

Entered by: dfields@cityofmadison.com

Published Date:

History of Legislative File

Ver- sion:	Acting Body:	Date:	Action:	Sent To:	Due Date:	Return Date:	Result:
1	COMMON COUNCIL	11/20/2007	Refer	COMMON COUNCIL ORGANIZATIONA L COMMITTEE		02/05/2008	Pass
	Action Text:	This Resolution was Refer to the COMMON COUNCIL ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITTEE					
	Notes:	Additional Referral(s): Board of Estimates					
1	COMMON COUNCIL ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITTEE	11/20/2007	Refer	BOARD OF ESTIMATES		11/26/2007	
	Action Text:	This Resolution was Refer to the BOARD OF ESTIMATES					
	Notes:						
1	BOARD OF ESTIMATES	11/26/2007	Return to Lead with the Following Recommendation(s)	COMMON COUNCIL ORGANIZATIONA L COMMITTEE		02/05/2008	Pass
	Action Text:	A motion was made by Verveer, seconded by Brandon, to Return to Lead with the Following Recommendation(s) -- Add "and Board of Estimates" wherever CCOC appears and delete the BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED clause -- to the COMMON COUNCIL ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITTEE. The motion passed by voice vote/other.					
	Notes:	Add "and Board of Estimates" wherever CCOC appears and delete the BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED clause.					

1 COMMON COUNCIL 12/04/2007 Rerefer COMMON 01/08/2008 02/05/2008 Pass
ORGANIZATIONAL COUNCIL
COMMITTEE ORGANIZATION
L COMMITTEE

Action Text: This resolution was rereferred to the COMMON COUNCIL ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITTEE on 1/8/2008.

Notes:

1 COMMON COUNCIL 01/08/2008 Rerefer COMMON 02/05/2008 02/05/2008 Pass
ORGANIZATIONAL COUNCIL
COMMITTEE ORGANIZATION
L COMMITTEE

Action Text: Ald. Brenda Konkel stated that the wrong resolution was in the packet. Lisa Veldran noted that a substitute was mistakenly created and that the recommended changes from the Board of Estimates appear in the History of the Legislative File: Add, "and Board of Estimates" wherever CCOC appears and delete the BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED clause.

Ald. Brenda Konkel will review the Board of Estimates amendment. She would like to add language to create a Council President work group to review the budget process and develop some recommendations.

A motion was made by Ald. Tim Bruer, seconded by Ald. Judy Compton, to rerefer to the COMMON COUNCIL ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITTEE, due back on February 5, 2008. The motion passed by voice vote.

Notes:

2 COMMON COUNCIL 02/05/2008 RECOMMEND TO Pass
ORGANIZATIONAL COUNCIL TO
COMMITTEE ADOPT - REPORT
OF OFFICER

Action Text: Ald. Brenda Konkel noted that the Board of Estimates substitute language added "and Board of Estimates" wherever CCOC appeared and deleted the entire "BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED" clause. Ald. Brenda Konkel presented substitute language for the resolution. She noted the following proposed changes to the resolution:

1. Creating a President's Work Group. She was not clear on what alders wanted to serve so created a group with a wider membership cross-section: 2 members of the CCOC, 2 members of the BOE, CC President (or designee) and 2 alternates.
2. Maintain the BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED language.
3. Report due back date to May 15, 2008 (vs. March 1, 2008).

Ald. Brenda Konkel moved, seconded by Ald. Judy Compton, to adopt the substitute resolution. Motion was approved.

Notes:

2 COMMON COUNCIL 02/26/2008 Adopt With Editorial Pass
Correction

Action Text: A motion was made by Ald. Verveer, seconded by Ald. Bruer, to Adopt With Editorial Correction as follows: change report back date from 'March 15, 2008' to 'May 15, 2008.' The motion passed by voice vote/other.

Notes:

Text of Legislative File 08238

Title

SUBSTITUTE - Requesting a report with recommendations from a Common Council President's Workgroup regarding improvements to the budget process.

Fiscal Note

Adoption of this resolution will have no fiscal impact beyond the commitment of available staff resources to support preparation of the required report.

Body

WHEREAS, the annual budget process has changed significantly over the past few years, including taking three evenings to complete; and

WHEREAS, the Common Council has taken a more active interest in the budget and has submitted more budget amendments than in past years; and

WHEREAS, the volume of amendments has caused meetings to run late into the night; and

WHEREAS, since the budget is one of the more important things that the Common Council does throughout the year, and decisions should not be made in the dark of night;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that a Common Council President's Workgroup, made up of 2 members of the Common Council Organizational Committee, 2 members of the Board of Estimates, the Common Council President or his appointee and up to two alternates should make recommendations to the Common Council on how to improve the budget process.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that recommendations to improve the process may include, but are not limited to, the following items:

- a) Holding the department briefings on the budget before the full Common Council instead of before the Board of Estimates.
- b) Holding the budget amendment process over a few weeks as opposed to a few days, possibly making amendments immediately after the night a department presents its portion of the budget.
- c) Moving the amendment deadline up so that the public and alders have more time to consider the amendments.
- d) Creating a process for amendments that are presented at the end of the budget process.
- e) Limiting budget meetings to no longer than eight hours at a time.
- f) Recommendations about the set-up of the room in which the budget meetings are held.
- g) Recommendations about rotating the order in which the departments present and then are considered.
- h) Recommendations about the public input process and a process for making amendments following the public input process.

BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED that this report is due back to the Common Council by May 15 ~~March 1~~, 2008.

Budget Process Improvement

*Developed from 5/27/08 & 6/4/08 meetings

What we want to achieve:

- a robust discussion about policy without extended sessions
- increase the Common Council's input during creation of the budget
- create a formal structure to ensure Council input
- a more informed Council
- a structure that allows engagement of the Council earlier in the budget process
- an educated and engaged Council
- a process that allows and invites input from the Council within a realistic timeframe
- a process that allows and invites public engagement

A simple scale is used to evaluate each potential improvement by each criteria (filter).

Yes – (+1)

Maybe, unknown at this time – (0)

No – (-1)

Potential improvements to the budget process	Improves time efficiency	Improves management process without inhibiting political process	More transparent process	User friendly	Total
Room structure (BOE meetings)	1	1	1	1	4
Limit hours of individual meetings	0	-1	1	1	1
Order items differently	-1	-1	-1	1	-2
Conduct day time meetings	-1	-1	-1	0	-3
Better explanation of process (closer to budget time)	1	1	0	0	2
Get everyone/increase attendance at BOE meetings	1	1	0	0	2
Public comment period separated from debate	1	-1	-1	0	-1
Means (amendments) to react to public comment	-1	-1	-1	0	-3
Public engagement with budget	0	0	1	1	2
Don't schedule budget 3 nights in a row	0	1	0	1	2
Create an earlier introduction date	0	1	1	1	3
Provide Department information to Council prior to introduction	1	1	1	1	4
Increase Council participation in					

development of Executive budget	0	0	-5	1	.5
Move amendment due dates up by one day (not Fridays)	1	1	0	1	3
Council involvement in CIRC process	.5	-1	1	0	.5
Create incentives to reward working within the process	1	0	1	1	3
Allow Council members to make amendments at BOE	.5	0	0	0	.5
Require BOE members to make amendments at BOE	1	-1	-1	-1	-2

Improvements with the highest scores (meet criteria)

Room structure (BOE meetings)	+4
Provide Department information to Council prior to introduction	+4
Create an earlier introduction date	+3
Move amendment due dates up by one day (not Friday's)	+3
Create incentives to reward working within the process	+3
Better explanation of process (closer to budget time)	+2
Get everyone/increase attendance at BOE meetings	+2
Public engagement with budget	+2
Don't schedule budget 3 nights in a row	+2

<i>Improvements that should be made for this budget year</i>	<i>Improvements that should be made for future years</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Room structure (BOE meetings) Provide Department information to Council prior to introduction Move amendment due dates up by one day (not Fridays) Better explanation of process (closer to budget time) Get everyone/increase attendance at BOE meetings Public engagement with budget Don't schedule budget 3 nights in a row 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Create an earlier introduction date Create incentives to reward working within the process Public engagement with budget

<i>Improvements that would provide the most benefit this year</i>	<i>Improvements that would provide the most benefit in future years</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Room structure (BOE meetings) Provide Department information to Council prior to introduction Move amendment due dates up by one day (not Fridays) Get everyone/increase attendance at BOE meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Create an earlier introduction date Create incentives to reward working within the process

Specification/Definition/Clarification of each improvement

Room structure (BOE meetings)

- Equivalent to Room 201
- Chairs for each alder
- Microphones (for room also)
- Every alder who wants to attend should
- All alders are equal
- Committee of the whole

Who will lead this improvement? Comptroller's Office and Council Leadership

Provide Department information to Council prior to introduction

- Agency request (full if available)
- Revenue estimates

Who will lead this improvement? Comptroller's Office and Mayor's Office

Move amendment due dates up by one day (not Fridays)

- Introduced one day earlier
- Returned one day earlier
- At BOE and Council

Who will lead this improvement? Comptroller's Office and CCOC

Get everyone/increase attendance at BOE meetings

- Food
- Remind department's about BOE meeting dates
- Communication from Council President
- Schedule later

Who will lead this improvement? Council President and CCOC



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Master

File Number: 11091

File ID: 11091

File Type: Resolution

Status: Passed

Version: 3

Reference:

Controlling Body: BOARD OF ESTIMATES

File Created Date : 06/24/2008

File Name: SUBSTITUTE Establishing rules and procedures for Common Council deliberation on the City of Madison's 2009 Capital and Operating Budgets.

Final Action: 07/15/2008

Title: AMENDED SUBSTITUTE - Establishing rules and procedures for Common Council deliberation on the City of Madison's 2009 Capital and Operating Budgets.

Notes:

Sponsors: Tim Bruer, Mark Clear, David J. Cieslewicz, Zachariah Brandon, Satya V. Rhodes Conway, Brenda K. Konkel, Michael Schumacher, Michael E. Verveer and Judy Compton

Enactment Date: 07/15/2008

Attachments: Cal-09-RES.pdf ,Original Resolution 11091

Enactment Number: RES-08-00723

Author: Dean Brassler

Hearing Date:

Entered by:

Published Date:

History of Legislative File

Ver- sion:	Acting Body:	Date:	Action:	Sent To:	Due Date:	Return Date:	Result:
1	Comptroller's Office	06/24/2008	Referred for Introduction				
	Action Text:		This Resolution was Referred for Introduction				
	Notes:		Board of Estimates				
1	COMMON COUNCIL	07/01/2008	Refer	BOARD OF ESTIMATES		07/07/2008	
	Action Text:		This Resolution was Refer to the BOARD OF ESTIMATES				
	Notes:						
1	BOARD OF ESTIMATES	07/07/2008	RECOMMEND TO COUNCIL TO ADOPT - REPORT OF OFFICER				Pass
	Action Text:		A motion was made by Bruer, seconded by Verveer, to RECOMMEND TO COUNCIL TO ADOPT - REPORT OF OFFICER. The motion passed by voice vote/other. At the Council meeting, the sponsor will present additional language to document the recommendations from the Common Council President's Work Group on Improvements to the Budget Process.				
	Notes:		At the Council meeting, the sponsor will present additional language to document the recommendations from the Common Council President's Work Group on Improvements to the Budget Process.				

3 COMMON COUNCIL 07/15/2008 Adopt With Amendment(s) Pass

Action Text: A motion was made by Ald. Clear, seconded by Ald. Verveer, to Adopt With Amendment(s) as follow: strike "Snacks and other incentives will be provided." in the second WHEREAS clause. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

Notes:

Text of Legislative File 11091

Fiscal Note

No appropriation required.

Title

AMENDED SUBSTITUTE - Establishing rules and procedures for Common Council deliberation on the City of Madison's 2009 Capital and Operating Budgets.

Body

WHEREAS, The President's Workgroup on budget process improvement met three times between May and July 2008 and its recommendations have been categorized into two groups; a set of short-term solutions that can be implemented in time for this year's (2009) budgeting cycle, and longer-term objectives for next year and beyond; and

WHEREAS, The recommendations for this year are:

* A better working room environment for Board of Estimates budget hearings. This includes issues such as ensuring enough space for the public, Board of Estimates members and for other Alders and ensuring a good PA system is available so that everyone can hear. Ideally the meetings will be held in the Council Chambers if available.

* Encouraging all Alders to attend and utilize the Board of Estimates meetings and process. This includes the presentations by department heads and the amendment deliberations. The idea is to operate the meetings somewhat like a committee of the whole, though they will still legally operate as Board of Estimates. ~~Snacks and other incentives will be provided.~~

* Providing information on agency requests to Alders earlier. (This has already begun with the capital budget.)

* Moving up the amendment due dates to Thursday instead of Friday. That will give Board of Estimates members and all Alders an additional day to study and digest them before votes are taken, and;

WHEREAS, Some of the recommendations to be considered for future years include:

* Increasing public involvement with the budget process

* Moving up introduction dates in order to give everyone more time to study. (This could have negative consequences, as not all information needed to create an

accurate budget may be available in time.)

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Common Council hereby establishes the following rules and procedures for the deliberation of the 2009 Executive Operating and Capital Budgets as amended by the Board of Estimates:

- 1) All proposed amendments to be reviewed and distributed in advance of the Common Council meeting must be submitted to the Comptroller's Office (Room 406 City-County Building) no later than 12:00 noon on Tuesday, November 4, 2008. The Comptroller's Office staff will prepare fiscal notes and distribute a list of the proposed amendments by Thursday, November 6, 2008 at 12:00 noon.
- 2) In the case of amendments from the floor of the Council, members may consider an amendment to a proposed amendment as well as other amendments that are written and distributed to Council members.
- 3) Proposed amendments must have two sponsors to be considered by the Council.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the above rules shall be in effect for the deliberation of the 2009 Capital and Operating Budgets on Tuesday, November 11, 2008, and on November 12 and 13, if meetings are held.

BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED, that any rules or procedures that are inconsistent with the above rules are suspended for these meetings pursuant to the provisions of Section 2.34 of the Madison General Ordinances.

EDITOR'S NOTE: The attached 2009 Budget Calendar identifies the proposed schedule for consideration of the 2009 Budget, including the dates for Public Hearings before the Common Council.