

## AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	<b>PRESENTED:</b> August 3, 2011
TITLE: 677 South Segoe Road - PUD(GDP-SIP) for a Three-Story Residential Building with 60 Apartments. 20 <sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist. (19952)	<b>REFERRED:</b> <b>REREFERRED:</b> <b>REPORTED BACK:</b>
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	<b>ADOPTED:</b> <b>POF:</b>
DATED: August 3, 2011	<b>ID NUMBER:</b>

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Henry Lufler, Melissa Huggins, Marsha Rummel, Richard Slayton\*, Dawn O’Kroley and Mark Smith.

\*Slayton recused himself from this item.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of August 3, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 677 South Segoe Road. Appearing on behalf of the project was John Bieno, representing TJK Design Build. Registered and speaking in opposition was Mike Scott. Bieno presented the Commission with changes to previous plans including underground parking in the second building, a required loading bay, a sectioned off area by having the walkway go to the entry. They have alleviated some traffic pressure by pulling the second entry into the second part of the building. They also agreed to do a traffic study, which is not required. Some flipping of the building has been done to accommodate moving the loading bay to the end which created a nice big greenspace. Stepped planters will be used at entry points.

Mike Scott spoke to the Commission in opposition of the project. He referenced a letter he submitted to the Commission that was in the Commission packet. He cited concerns with density, traffic circulation, mass and neighborhood compatibility. Wagner mentioned that the Commission had received the Minutes for the Midvale Heights Community Association and had that information. He also noted that the Urban Design Commission is charged with design issues; these issues are more for the Plan Commission. Bieno stated they have had neighborhood meetings with little to no issues mentioned. Huggins stated it has come a long way and looks great.

### **ACTION:**

On a motion by Huggins, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (4-0-1) with Smith abstaining and Slayton recused.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 7, 7 and 7.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 677 South Segoe Road**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	6	6	7	-	-	6	7	7
	7	7	7	7	-	6	7	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7

General Comments:

- Significantly improved project.
- Very nice project.
- Study creating a double height entry with common space on third floor. Three-story volume proportion on the interior is quite tall. Activate main façade with public activity.
- Architecture, scale, site plan all vastly improved. Attractive façade at Segoe and Odana. Issues of density concern neighborhood but not UDC jurisdiction.

Dear UDC members,

I am writing you as the new alder for District 20 in support of item #7 on tonight's agenda. Due to another meeting I will not be able to attend the meeting but wanted to let you all know how I feel about the matter. I believe the proposed development at 677 S. Segoe Rd is a sound project that deserves the City's approval.

I recognize that this has been a long and sometimes contentious process between the development team, the neighborhood association and city staff. However, from my perspective, all sides have been working in good faith to create a proposal that fits the neighborhood, the City's plans and makes sense economically. The project, as proposed, is much different today than it was at the beginning of this process. Two of the most contentious issues were height and density. Both have been addressed by the developers and now you see a building that is three stories rather than four and less dense. The Midvale Heights Community Association has done its due diligence to require that the development meet its guidelines as enumerated in their neighborhood plan. For their part, the development team has done their best to meet those demands, if not as completely as some of the neighbors would want.

The fact that no one seems to be completely happy about where we are at today, probably says all you need to know. As you know all too well, the development process is about compromises made between the stakeholders. That has happened with this project to the point that we now have a proposal that has gotten approval from the neighborhood association and is supported by the alder.

On top of that, this project will fit nicely as the area is revitalized. It is the neighborhood and City's intention to see the Westgate Mall upgraded and I believe this new apartment building will help assist in an economic turnaround in the area. The building will also act as a buffer between the enhanced Westgate Mall and the entrance to the neighborhood. Of course, a new development will also provide temporary jobs and increase the city's tax base; nothing to sneeze at in these times.

Again, I am in full support of this proposed development and urge the Commission to grant approval when the time comes. If you have any questions or concerns, please don't hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Ald. Matt Phair

[district20@cityofmadison.com](mailto:district20@cityofmadison.com)

298-7602 home

772-1187 cell

## Midvale Heights Community Association Area Director's meeting

The MHCA Directors meet from 6:45 PM to 8:45 PM on the fourth Tuesday of each month, except in December and July (in 2009 we added meeting in August).

The meetings are held at the Sequoia Public Library, 4340 Tokay Boulevard.

The meetings are free and open to the public.

The date of the next meeting is: **June 28, 2011**

### MAY 2011 AREA DIRECTORS' MEETING MINUTES

*Published by Charies Bunge at Thursday, 06/02/11 08:36pm*

#### Midvale Heights Community Association

#### Board of Directors Meeting

**May 24, 2011**

#### *Minutes*

**Present:** C. Kreimendahl, G. Poulson, J. Sweet, M. Silbernagel, D. Lamb (presiding), P. Haskew, C. Bunge, T. Jarvis, R. Rotter, F. Stautz, J. Gary, K. Reuter-Krohn

**Also present:** Cathy Rotter, Matt Phair, Greg Fischer, Wes Meixelsperger, Jim Batt, Dorothy Batt, Mike Scott, Julie Furset, Patrick Doran, Larry Mosely, Leo Goebel, Pauline Goebel, Shana Feuling Weber, John Walsh, Timothy Kritter, John McCormick.

**1. Call to order and introductions:** D. Lamb opened the meeting, and Board members present introduced themselves.

**2) 677 S. Segoe Rd. parcel:** D. Lamb briefly recapped a meeting held between the development group and neighborhood residents May 16, in which the developers reported that they had changed the development plans to include three stories, 60 apartments, and 100 bedrooms, as well as other changes to respond to comments from Board members and others at the MHCA Board meeting of April 26.

D. Lamb invited comments from those attending the meeting, after which she invited Board members to express their views. Points made by speakers with concerns about the proposed development included the following: 1) The number of units and bedrooms proposed far exceeds the guidelines in the neighborhood plan and would bring too much density to the parcel. 2) This would result in too much added traffic at intersections that are already problematic. 3) The proposed building would be too large and would not fit in with other buildings and the general character of the neighborhood. 4) For the neighborhood association to approve a development with density so far beyond that outlined in the neighborhood plan would set a bad precedent and would weaken the usefulness of the plan to

guide development in other parts of the neighborhood. 5) The developers have not provided enough detailed information, especially accurate visual representations and renderings, for neighbors to make informed decisions.

Points made by Board members and Alder Matt Phair in support of the proposed development included the following: 1) The proposed development has features that would make it an asset to the neighborhood as a whole, especially when compared to other possible uses of the parcel. 2) A traffic study could provide City officials with information that could help them address traffic problems in the area, including those associated with the proposed development. 3) Odana Rd. and Segoe Rd. are both arterial streets, making the density and increased traffic permissible, especially in view of the fact that the density guidelines in the neighborhood plan might be too conservative, given current economic conditions.

In response to questions, representatives of the developers said that they felt that they had made a good faith effort to respond to concerns raised at the Board meeting of April 26. They confirmed their commitment to reducing the height of the project from four to three stories, reducing the number of units to from 68 to 60, reducing the number of bedrooms from 108 to 100, funding a traffic study, and using building materials and architectural features that would make the project an attractive "gateway" building for the neighborhood.

A motion was made and seconded: That the Board of Directors of the Midvale Heights Community Association supports the proposed development of 677 S. Segoe Rd., as presented by the development group at this meeting and the May 16 neighborhood meeting. An amendment was moved and seconded to add the phrase, "with serious reservations regarding the number of units and bedrooms proposed. The motion to amend passed. The motion, as amended, passed on a voice vote.

**2. Minutes:** The minutes of the April 26, 2011 meetings were approved as distributed.

**3. Treasurer's report:** R. Rotter reported that he had been out of town and had not been able to prepare a treasurer's report.

**4. Membership drive:** P. Haskew and Greg Fischer reported that some 20 businesses had signed up to participate in the member discount card. R. Rotter reported that completed membership cards were coming in and asked who should get the forms and who should deposit checks. P. Haskew and R. Rotter agreed to meet and work out details of these matters and others.

**5. Annual picnic:** D. Lamb announced that Christine Sveom had indicated that a postcard invitation to the picnic would be mailed soon. The Association will provide the main course. There will be some information booths and entertainment.

**6. Garage sale:** D. Lamb reported that Jill Carlson would coordinate the annual neighborhood garage sale and that she had recruited another volunteer to help.

**7. Alder report:** Matt Phair made a brief report about City matters. The Mayor anticipates a large budget deficit for next year and intends to gain the participation of city residents in addressing the problem.


**8. Alder redistricting:** Matt Phair, D. Lamb, and G. Poulson reported that the proposed redistricting maps that have the most potential for being adopted would split the Midvale Heights neighborhood between two districts. Alder Phair would no longer represent the neighborhood.

**9. Green Team:** J. Gary reported some difficulties with getting the Bison Prairie Gateway area mowed and clipped. She said that she would continue working on the matter.

**10. Announcements:** In response to a question, D. Lamb indicated that the neighborhood watch committee was inactive and that, to her knowledge, no meetings or activities were planned. G. Poulson announced that he would appear before the Madison Public Library Board to request that Sunday hours at the Sequoya Branch Library be extended to include September and May. The friends group would pay the costs.

**11. Adjournment:** Motion was made, seconded, and passed that the meeting adjourn.

Charles Bunge, Secretary

 [Permalink](#)

See all Area Director's meeting minutes.

*Created by Tom Jarvis. Last Modification: Tuesday 27 of July, 2010 04:32:33 pm by Tom Jarvis.*