



Project Name & Address: 123 E Doty Street
Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition
Legistar File ID # [75246](#)
Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: January 4 2022

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Stephen Mar-Pohl, InSite Consulting Architects
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to make alterations and restorations to the street façade.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is a Designated Madison Landmark.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to repair several elements on the exterior of the structure at 123 E Doty, a designated landmark. Much of the exterior was reworked in the 1970s as part of rehabilitating the vacant property at the time. After the remodel — which included gutting the interior, sandblasting the exterior brick, and replacing the “old” windows — the property was proposed for landmark designation. This property is an excellent case study of the evolution of the understanding of good preservation practice.

The proposal is to replace the existing windows to replicate their historic appearance based upon the existing windows and historic photos. The new windows will be an aluminum/wood composite. The proposal is also to repoint masonry, using a Type N mortar, and sealing joints at appropriate locations. Additionally, the decorative ironwork on the façade will be cleaned, primed, and repainted. Fascia and cornice will be repaired to match historic, as will the foundation masonry and stairs. The side of the building will have a hydraulic lime stucco recoat, excluding the extant ghost sign, which will be preserved in situ.

The subject property was constructed in 1854 and was known as the Fess Hotel. In 1901 a major remodel was completed by architects Gordon and Paunack. It was designated a Madison Landmark in 1975 due to the historical value it played in the development of Madison’s downtown. The Fess hotel was owned and operated by the Fess family from the 1850s until the 1970s.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) The proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) The proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) N/A
 - (d) N/A

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. No proposed change in use.
2. The proposal will not remove exterior materials. Largely the work will repair historic materials and replicate historic materials in the replacement of nonhistoric elements. The historic ghost sign will be preserved by remaining untouched as part of recoating the stucco of the side wall of the structure.
3. No conjectural features are proposed.
4. As this is largely a repair, there are no proposed changes to any of the features.
5. The proposal will repair historic finishes where possible and replicate features where necessary.
6. Again, mostly the proposal is to repair deteriorated historic features. The windows on the building were replaced as part of the 1970s remodel. The proposal is to replace the wood windows with units that will be aluminum on the exterior and a wood composite on the interior. There is no detail about the divided lights, which should be either simulated divided lights with a spacer bar or true divided lights.
7. Much of the front façade on this structure was previously sandblasted. The proposal will clean and repoint the masonry, stabilizing or replacing failed masonry units. Care will be taken to maintain the damaged historic materials to the extent possible.
8. N/A
9. The exterior repairs will not destroy historic materials. The replacement elements will be complimentary to the original character of the structure.
10. N/A

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following condition:

1. Provide final window specifications to staff showing that multi-light windows are either simulated divided lights with a spacer bar or true divided lights.