

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION **PRESENTED:** August 17, 2011

TITLE: 1129 South Park Street – Demolition to
Construct New Gas **REFERRED:**
Station/Convenience Store in UDD No. **REREFERRED:**
7. 13th Ald. Dist. (23443) **REPORTED BACK:**

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary **ADOPTED:** **POF:**

DATED: August 17, 2011 **ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Henry Lufler, Todd Barnett, Marsha Rummel, Richard Slayton, Dawn O’Kroley, Melissa Huggins, John Harrington and Mark Smith.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of August 17, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of plans for a new gas station/convenience store located at 1129 South Park Street. Sutton noted that changes include access from Olin Avenue has been reduced in size and made a one-way onto the site only, increase in planters, removal of the handicapped parking stall next to the building and all parking moved to the south of the pumps, the addition of one stall and an increased planting schedule. The parking count, however, is still below City requirements. Ron Shutvet spoke in opposition to this particular project but is in favor of this gas station being reconstructed because it needs it. His main concerns are the handicapped parking area being moved and causing that area to be too crowded, which will make it difficult for a wheelchair bound person to get in and out of a van. He thinks there is too much being put on this amount of square footage of property and worries about the food area causing conflicts. He stated that when this gas station has gas cheaper than anyone else in the City, this causes long lines and back-ups of traffic and worries that a restaurant will further congest this small area. Sutton suggested relocating the bicycle parking to the other side to make more room. Smith also had concerns with the layout, particularly a larger vehicle that will extend from the pump. Barnett wondered about pulling the corners of the tower inward to eliminate one band. Huggins stated this is a very good improvement to an important corner and appreciated Sutton’s taking into account the design guidelines. Slayton was concerned about some of the landscaping elements not making it in that environment, and would like to see more creativity and variation. He suggested that the City look into installing a safety island between the eastbound and westbound lanes at the intersection on Olin Avenue to eliminate u-turning activity; he saw this as a City issue and not the developer’s issue. Additional comments by the Commission were as follows:

- Eliminate the horizontal band encircling the tower element; run mullions all the way up on the tower element.
- Great job with this proposal; important corner and takes into account UDD No. 7 design guidelines.
- Sweet Woodruff and Creeping Phlox won’t survive; eliminate spirea, provide substitutes.

ACTION:

On a motion by Huggins, seconded by Lufler, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion required address of the architectural and landscape comments along with losing a stall on the easterly row of parking and re-shuffling stalls to be more functional.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 5, 5.5, 6 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1129 South Park Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	5	-	-	4	5	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5.5
	5	6	5	4	-	4	6	5
	5	5	4	-	-	5	6	6
	6	6	4	-	-	5	6	5
	6	6	6	6	6	6	7	7

General Comments:

- Site plan, parking and circulation are still problematic.
- Lose a stall to enhance circulation. TE should add ped island on Olin Avenue to prevent u-turns. New building is good and restaurant adds vitality, but congestion is an issue.
- Further develop the tower. Site is inherently awkward.
- More diversity with plant species. Concern that Phlox and Woodruff will not survive.
- Tough site – good work.

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION **PRESENTED:** August 3, 2011

TITLE: 1129 South Park Street - Demolition to
Construct New Gas **REFERRED:**
Station/Convenience Store in Urban **REREFERRED:**
Design District #7. 13th Ald. Dist. **REPORTED BACK:**
(23443)

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED: **POF:**

DATED: August 3, 2011

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Henry Lufler, Melissa Huggins, Richard Slayton, Dawn O’Kroley and Mark Smith.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of August 3, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a demolition to construct a new gas station/convenience store in UDD No. 7 located at 1129 South Park Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was John Sutton. Sutton presented plans to remove the existing Clark station and replace it with a new “C” store. The entire site would be updated, including replacement of tanks, new pumps, new bituminous paving, increasing landscaping, reusing the canopy with a facelift. This will be an independent station. Sutton feels they meet the criteria for UDD No. 7 which he will break down at the next UDC meeting. They have met with the neighborhood once and have received strong indications of what their needs are. The main building material to be concrete block; there is a strong use of block along Park Street on service and industrial-oriented buildings. For its size he is trying to create some interest by using a major fascia element on the taller roof in the back that can be tied in with the canopy material. They will be creating a two-story entry element. The plan creates an edge along Olin and Park Streets including a separation between the site and the sidewalk. The owner wants to focus on the green effect and will use all LED lighting and is looking into the possibility of sensors for regulating lighting and energy, as well as solar panels. Huggins inquired about staff’s opinion of traffic exiting on Olin Avenue; Sutton replied that the biggest concern is people turning south on Park Street. He met with Traffic Engineering and explained the two access points are necessary for fuel coming in and out. The third access point is required because they have parking with no drive-thru aisle. Neighborhood concerns have ranged from noise to worries over customers and employees. The owner has now hired security for certain times of day. Huggins asked who the restaurant tenant is slated to be; staff remarked that Matt Tucker, Zoning Administrator already has some concerns about the combination of uses in an already too tight site and how that will impact the area. Slayton suggested one of the access points to be designated “entrance only,” as well as labeling one of the stalls for mopeds and bicycle parking, in addition to pursuing one-way circulation through the site and rounding off the geometry curb treatment and islands; too sharp, need to soften. O’Kroley touched on some of the UDD No. 7 requirements for street frontage that should be addressed, including site context with adjoining properties. Smith noted the sharpness of the curb and their need to be softened. Additional comments were as follows:

- Relocate the stall to bike parking area and vice versa.
- Provide flush mounted under canopy lights.
- Primary entry needs to be oriented to street.
- Eliminate the parking stall on the right side of the Olin Avenue driveway entry to increase green area with the incorporation of a shade tree in combination with the reconfiguration of stalls to relocate the handicapped parking stall and bike parking stalls along with enhancing the pedestrian entry on the west elevation off of Park Street.
- Rethink interior triangle at the apex in front of the building and incorporate a canopy above the entry doors.
- Look at on-site traffic patterns to see how much space is left over around the pump area overhead canopy, including reconsideration of pump locations.
- Provide relative grade information.
- Signage will require future consideration.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1129 South Park Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	6	5	-	-	4/5	5	5
	5	5	-	-	-	5	6	6

General Comments:

- Vehicular circulation is the issue; study one-way in from Olin (no exit onto Olin).
- Any improvement would be welcome.

Firchow, Kevin

From: Sue Ellingson [sue@sueellingson.com]
Sent: Saturday, July 30, 2011 7:32 PM
To: Bay Creek
Cc: Ellingson, Susan
Subject: Clark Station meeting summary

On Mon 7/25, we had a neighborhood meeting about the proposed reconstruction of the Clark Station. About 25 people attended.

Architect John Sutton and owner Mohammed Ehtasham presented the plan for the reconstruction. Mr Ehtasham has gotten a grant from the DNR to replace the fuel tanks. That prompted the proposed renovation.

The plan calls for refurbishing the canopy over the pumps, replacing the fence, redoing the landscaping, demolishing the building, and putting up a 2500 sq ft environmentally-friendly building in its place. The building would include a convenience store and a tenant space that may be leased to JJ Fish, a chicken and fish takeout restaurant. Mr Ehtasham is Muslim and will not sell alcohol for religious reasons.

Neighborhood comments included:

TRAFFIC

- Many people were concerned about how hard it is to get into and out of the gas station.

> "That corner is CONSTANTLY a MESS. People take ridiculous and potentially extremely dangerous chances trying to swerve into the station. And that's not even factoring the extreme dangers to pedestrians wanting to cross Olin at Park Street."

> "The entrance to the Clark station on Olin Ave. is not very user friendly... I have witnessed many times and been the victim of road rage of drivers who are trying to enter the Clark station via this entrance."

- Mr Sutton said that the entrance on Olin must be maintained because the fuel tanker trucks are required to be able to enter and exit the station without backing up.

- Suggestions include:

> Block the Olin entrance except when the fuel truck arrives.
> Allow Olin Ave entry only by westbound traffic (a right turn) and exit only by turning right onto Olin (no left turn).

- The station will help with an improved bus stop on Park St.

PARKING

- People were concerned about customers staying longer, which seemed likely given the restaurant and increased size of the store. They were also concerned about snow blocking the parking spaces.

- Mr Ehtasham said he expects the same volume of business. Also, snow will be trucked from the site when it gets to be too much.

LITTER, TRASH

- Litter is currently a big problem for the neighbors.

- They are worried about whether trash bins will be big enough and well located.

SMELL

- Neighbors don't want to smell deep fried food all the time.

CUSTOMER BASE, NOISE

- Currently, neighbors hear loud car stereos often and even violent arguments among customers.
- Mr Ehtasham said that a bigger store with more employees can better address customer issues.
- Mr Ehtasham recently fired an employee who was selling cigarettes illegally.
- One neighbor pointed out that Mr Ehtasham has little control over his customers.
- A refurbished gas station is likely to attract a better clientele.
- Neighbors suggested increasing the price of gas at the station.

OVERALL SUPPORT

Most people expressed support for the renovation, provided concerns can be addressed.

- > "Generally a great idea to 'clean-up' that corner."
- > "I would like to see the Clark Station get updated, it is a great idea."

Mr Sutton and Mr Ehtasham will bring a revised plan back for neighborhood review after Urban Design Commission review.

If you have comments, please email me at district13@cityofmadison.com.

Thanks.

Sue

.....
 Sue Ellingson, Alder
 City of Madison, District 13
District13@CityofMadison.com
 259-1824

Firchow, Kevin

Subject: FW: Clark Station on Olin & Park

From: Gayle Worland [mailto:gworland@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, August 17, 2011 1:25 PM
To: Martin, Al
Cc: Ellingson, Susan; 321super_sonic@sbcglobal.net; gworland@yahoo.com
Subject: Fw: Clark Station on Olin & Park

Mr. Martin,

Thank you for the opportunity to weigh in about traffic concerns surrounding the Clark gas station at Olin Avenue and Park Street. Here are my main concerns from a previous email sent to Alder Sue Ellingson. I have marked my main points in bold.

Please reply so I know you received this !

Sincerely,

Gayle Worland

713 W. Olin Ave.

Madison 53715

----- Forwarded Message -----

From: Gayle Worland <gworland@yahoo.com>
To: District13@CityofMadison.com
Cc: gworland@yahoo.com; Me <gworland@madison.com>; 321super_sonic@sbcglobal.net
Sent: Tuesday, July 26, 2011 2:12 PM
Subject: Clark Station on Olin & Park

Hi, Sue -

My husband and I both attended the meeting last night on the Clark Station. I want to thank you very much for organizing the session.

I do wish to reiterate **how perilous the ingress and egress to the gas station currently is**. This morning was a prime example: I left home at 9:45 a.m. (not even rush hour) and was headed west on Olin, waiting to make a left turn on to Park. Southbound traffic on Park had a signal to turn on to Olin. Someone turned left on to Olin and then wanted to enter the gas station, and the front of their car was inches, literally inches, from my car door as I waited at the stoplight. Meanwhile, cars were backing up behind that vehicle as they tried to turn on to Olin from Park, jamming the Park/Olin intersection. The light changed and two cars were stuck in the intersection. Describing all this is difficult, but believe me, **that corner is CONSTANTLY a MESS. People take ridiculous and potentially extremely dangerous chances trying to swerve into the station.**

And that's not even factoring **the extreme dangers to pedestrians wanting to cross Olin at Park Street**. As the parent of two young children who eventually will want to cross that intersection with friends or bikes when they're older, the situation sends chills down my spine. It is scary enough now when an adult is with them. But the alternative is to cross Olin somewhere else -- **a near-impossible task as there are no well-marked crosswalks across the street** (except right across from Goodman Pool) and the amount of speed and traffic zooming up and down the hilly street (poor visibility) means that children and adults who cross Olin are always taking their lives in their hands. Try it sometime -- it's pretty terrifying.

As other neighbors said last night, **the remodeling of the Clark Station seems like a perfect time to sort out the traffic fiasco at Park Street and Olin**. But I would also like to take this opportunity to state again (as I

have in previous emails, both to you and to your predecessor Alder Kerr) that **the city also needs to deal with the excessive and illegal speeding on Olin Ave.** The small hill at Olin and Park apparently encourages people coming on to Olin to gun their motors and come down the hill at high speeds. There is a very large amount of heavy truck traffic on the street, too, and those vehicles are the worst violators of all. There is no way those trucks are keeping to the 25 mph speed limit. In fact, because **so many of the speed limit signs along Olin are obscured by trees and poorly placed, they are mostly invisible to all motorists.** An electronic sign that reminds a driver of his/her speed, such as the one on Regent St. near West High, would be a GREAT help. I would love to hear from you about the steps we would need to take to get one of these signs placed on Olin Ave.

Sue, thanks again for hearing us out yesterday evening and for inviting email feedback as well. **The Clark Station remodel is a big deal for the immediate residential area, and if done poorly could be a great detriment to our neighborhood. Done right, it could be a wonderful improvement.**

Gayle Worland
713 W. Olin Ave.