



Project Name/Address: 2222 East Washington Avenue – Madison East High School
Application Type: Addition to landmark site
Legistar File ID # [53356](#)
\Prepared By: William Fruhling, Acting Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: October 30, 2018

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The landmark site is located at 2222 East Washington Avenue

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.09 ALTERING OR DEMOLISHING LANDMARKS. No person may do any of the following without a certificate of appropriateness issued under Subchapter F:

- (1) Add a new structure to a landmark or landmark site.
- (2) Materially alter a landmark or the exterior of a landmark.
- (3) Demolish or relocate a landmark or any part of a landmark.
- (4) Install a sign on the exterior of a landmark or on a landmark site.
- (5) Divide any lot comprising all or part of a landmark site, or voluntarily grant any easement on that lot if doing so may impair the preservation, maintenance, exterior appearance or historic character of the landmark or landmark site.

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Applicant is proposing to construct a fieldhouse entrance addition on the rear of Madison East High School, which is a designated landmark. The submittal requests approval of both a one-story alternative and a two-story alternative. Which alternative will be constructed depends on the bids received.

A discussion of the relevant standards of 41.18 follows:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. The property will continued to be used for its original purpose (a high school) and the proposed addition will not negatively affect any of its distinctive materials, features, spaces, or spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of the property will be retained and preserved, and no distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, or spatial relationships that characterize a property will be removed.
3. Either version of the proposed addition will feature a clean, modern design that will be distinguished from the original building and any prior additions.
9. Neither version of the proposed addition will destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new addition is differentiated from the old through its modern architecture, and it will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

10. Since the new addition is at the rear of the building and not attached to any historic portions of the building, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for either alternative for a new fieldhouse entrance addition on a designated Madison landmark site (Madison East High School) are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request.