

AGENDA # VII.B.

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: December 15, 2004
TITLE: 7401 West Towne Way – Planned Commercial Site, Addition to and Remodeling of Retail Building in excess of 50,000 Square Feet	REFERRED:
	REREFERRED:
	REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED:
	POF:
DATED: December 15, 2004	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Michael Barrett, Bruce Woods, Lou Host-Jablonski, Ald. Steve Holtzman, Robert March, Lisa Geer and Todd Barnett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of December 15, 2004, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED CONSIDERATION** of an addition to the “Kohl’s” department store located at 7401 West Towne Way, an alteration to a conditional use for a Planned Commercial Site and remodeling of a retail building in excess of 50,000 square feet. Appearing on behalf of the project were Roger Phillips and Jackie Wolke of Schroeder & Holt Architects, in addition to Joseph Janus of Kohl’s Department Stores, Inc. Prior to the presentation, staff noted to the Commission that consideration of the addition to the building was a preliminary step in its consideration as a minor alteration to the existing conditional uses on the site. Staff explained to the Commission that the applicant was instructed to address the design requirements contained within the proposed Big Box Ordinance with consideration of the addition as required by the Planning Unit Director, Brad Murphy. The project provides for a 17,294 square foot, one-story addition to the existing 89,593 square foot department store. The addition to the front or east elevation of the building features the extension of an EIFS façade in alternating horizontal bands and expansion joints. On the north elevation of the building, the EIFS banding is carried around as a return on the corner with the majority of the elevation featuring alternate banding of split-faced cement block in combination with fluted split-faced cement block. The west elevation of the building features a relocated two-bay loading dock and extension of the building, also featuring alternate horizontal banding of fluted split-faced block in combination with split-faced block. The building addition effectively eliminates an existing surface parking area adjoining the property’s frontage with West Towne Way. Following the presentation, the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- The applicant’s plan to maintain existing mature trees along West Towne Way was of concern due to the addition’s proximity to the canopy and root system of the mature vegetation. Construction in close proximity to the mature tree vegetation would be a detriment to the survival of the trees. A tree protection plan is required before further consideration of the project.
- Examine incorporation of windows on both the north and east facades to provide detailing as well as day lighting.
- The higher portion of the upper facade should be extended across the full face of the addition on the east elevation.

5

- Consider adding windows within the horizontal bands on higher portions of the addition as around the entryways on the front elevation of the building and extend around the corner on the returns of the north elevation.
- The location of the corner of the addition in close proximity to the driveway and street requires that it should be pulled back and be treated architecturally with a 15' more or less step back.

ACTION:

On a motion by Geer, seconded by March, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED CONSIDERATION** of the project. The motion was passed on a vote of (9-0). The motion for referral required address of the above stated concerns. The motion to refer required that the applicant come back with an analysis by a certified arborist relative to the preservation of the mature canopy tree vegetation along West Towne Way as affected by the proximity of the proposed addition. In addition, the building elevations should be modified to integrate windows, the stepping back or cutting the corner of the building as it relates to the driveway and street, the required adjustment for the integration and preservation of landscaping as well as the provision of a lighting plan including fixture type and photometrics to be provided.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3, 4, 4, 4, 4.5, 5, 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 7401 West Towne Way

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	4	5	-	7	7	6	6
	6	4	4	3	-	5	3	4.5
	5	4	4	-	-	-	3	4
	-	3	-	-	-	-	-	3
	5	5	-	-	-	-	7	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	4	5	-	-	-	5	5	5
	3	3	4	-	-	-	4	4
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

General Comments:

- Another windowless box! What an ugly building.
- Add glass. Engage trees from inside.
- A wall this close to the street should have windows.
- Remarkably uninspired, leaving an unbroken monolithic wall hovering over the street and sidewalk.
- Good retention of existing shade trees and building over existing parking is a plus for this project. Provide a tree protection plan to preserve the existing vegetation. Add more lower elevation vegetation.
- A rather banal addition to an already-big box. Why not some windows? Landscaping? Architecture?
- Pull northeast corner of building back from street. Extend high wall for full width of addition along east elevation. Step northeast corner back similar to existing entry's wall steps.
- Building needs more articulation at the corner and some windows or glass. Tree management plan.

AGENDA # VLC

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: February 16, 2005

TITLE: 7401 West Towne Way - Planned Commercial Site, Addition to and Remodeling of Retail Building > 50,000 sq. ft.

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: William A. Fruhling, Acting Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: February 16, 2005

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Michael Barrett, Lisa Geer, Robert March, and Lou Host-Jablonski.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of February 16, 2005, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a minor alteration for a Planned Commercial Site for an addition to Kohl's Department Store at 7401 West Towne Way. John Kramp, National Survey and Engineering, stated that they clipped the northeast corner of the building, added bicycle parking, and prepared a landscaping plan that preserves existing trees. Roger Phillips, architect with Schroeder and Holt Architects, stated that the parapet was extended for the full length of the building and they incorporated EIFS and split face block to the clipped corner and piers along the northern façade. He stated that no windows were added to the north elevation because they didn't work with the interior function in this area, which is mostly storage and an employee lounge. Ald. Skidmore stated he believes the plans address all of the Commission's concerns raised at an earlier meeting and doesn't feel that windows should be required. He stated that across the street is a windowless façade for Cub Foods and it is not noticed in this context as people are arriving at or leaving the mall. The Commission discussed the need to incorporate windows in the north façade and whether they should primarily serve a daylighting or an aesthetic function. The Commission clarified that the purpose for requiring windows would be to address the architectural concerns with the north façade. Joe Janusz and David DeVos registered in support.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Barrett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** with the condition that windows be added to the north elevation and be approved by the Commission. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-1) with Geer voting no.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 5, 5, 6, 6, 6 and 6.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 7401 West Towne Way

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	3	7 - saving trees 5 - proposed	6	-	6	4	5
	7	5	9	6	-	7	6	6.5
	5	3	7	7	-	3	2	4
	-	6	7	-	-	-	5	6
	6	6	6	6	-	6	5	6
	6	5	7	-	7	6	5	6
	5	5	7	5	-	0	5	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

General Comments:

- North elevation is extremely disappointing; lounges, locker rooms, work spaces should have windows.
- Did follow through with tree protection plan. Nice integration of bike parking within entry plaza. Like addition of the panels along the north side as an architectural element.
- Windows?
- Improved concept. The applicant's staunch defense of only-artificial lighting is disturbing.
- Function rules out better design.
- Another big box made bigger. Landscape helps. Need daylighting into the interior of the building.