

Regarding: **110 West Gilman Street – Mansion Hill Historic District  
Consideration of Issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness –  
Exterior alteration involving window replacement  
(Legistar #20327)**

Date: October 28, 2010  
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon

General Information:

The Applicant is proposing to remove existing and possibly original casement windows and replace them with new double hung windows that are similar to the windows on the second floor. The upper sash would be divided with glass proportion to closely resemble the proportion of the existing glass. The windows on the second floor are nine lights over one light double hung units and it is possible that they are not original.

Applicable Landmarks Ordinance sections:

33.19(6)(d)3. The guideline criteria for construction of and alterations and additions to buildings and structures in historic districts are designed to provide an understandable set of standards to ensure that alterations to the exterior of existing buildings and the creation of new buildings will be done in a manner sensitive to the character of each historic district. It is not the intent of this ordinance to discourage contemporary architectural expression that is visually compatible with its environment and otherwise meets the standards in the ordinance, to encourage the rote emulation of existing building styles or to prevent the prior lawful conforming use of buildings that are reconstructed following destruction by fire or other natural disaster. A sensitively designed building in a contemporary style may better preserve and enhance the inherent characteristics of a historic district than a mediocre adaptation of a more traditional style. (Cr. by Ord. 8690, 10-10-85 & 11-14-85; Am. by Ord. 13,001, 2-8-02)

33.19(10)(d) Regulation of Construction, Reconstruction, Exterior Alteration and Demolition.

The Commission shall act in these matters specifically as they regard the Mansion Hill Historic District in the manner specified by Madison General Ordinance, Sections 33.19(5)(b) and (c). (*included below*)

33.19(5)(b) Regulation Of Construction, Reconstruction and Exterior Alteration.

2. No owner or person in charge of a landmark, landmark site or structure within an Historic District shall reconstruct or alter all or any part of the exterior of such property or construct any improvement upon such designated property or properties within an Historic District or cause or permit any such work to be performed upon such property unless a Certificate of Appropriateness has been

granted by the Landmarks Commission or its designee(s) as hereinafter provided. The Landmarks Commission may appoint a designee or designees to approve certain projects that will have little effect on the appearance of the exterior of such properties, provided that the Landmarks Commission shall first adopt a written policy on the types of projects which can be approved by its designee(s). Unless such certificate has been granted by the commission or its designee(s), the Director of the Building Inspection Division shall not issue a permit for any such work. (Am. by Ord. 8081, 7-29-83; ORD-08-00109, 10-7-08)

4. Upon filing of any application with the Landmarks Commission, the Landmarks Commission shall determine:
  - a. Whether, in the case of a designated landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would detrimentally change, destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which said work is to be done; and
  - b. Whether, in the case of the construction of a new improvement upon a landmark site, the exterior of such improvement would adversely affect or not harmonize with the external appearance of other neighboring improvements on such site; and
  - c. Whether, in the case of any property located in an Historic District designated pursuant to the terms of Subsection (6)(d) hereunder, the proposed construction, reconstruction or exterior alteration does not conform to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for said district as duly adopted by the Common Council. (Sec. 33.01(4)(b)3. Renumbered to 4. by Ord. 11,070, 12-6-94)

---

Staff Comments:



Photo A



Photo B

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alterations can be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions:

- The only windows to be considered for this proposal request are the three openings on the first floor that have banks of paired casement window units. One

opening on the front has a bank of six existing casement windows and there are two openings on the side that have four existing casement window units. These openings are shown in Photo A above. The Applicant must address the window configuration and condition for all other windows on the first floor as shown to the right in Photo B.

- Staff recommends the installation of wood windows or fiberglass windows instead of vinyl windows as proposed.
- The existing banks of casement windows are composed of vertical elements (tall casement windows paired around mullions). The proposed windows change the character of the architectural elevation. Staff recommends that the new windows have the appearance of the existing paired windows and mullion by incorporating a wide vertical muntin on the top sash and bottom sash to simulate the mullion and vertical character.