



Project Name & Address: 1332 Rutledge Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition and new construction in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Legistar File ID # [67230](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: September 14, 2021

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Tom Lamberson, American Garage Builders

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of an existing garage structure and construction of a new garage structure.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.
 - (2) Demolition or Removal. In determining whether to approve a certificate of appropriateness for any demolition or removal of any landmark or structure within a historic district, the Landmarks

Commission shall consider all of the following, and may give decisive weight to any or all of the following:

- (a) Whether the structure is of such architectural or historic significance that its demolition or removal would be detrimental to the public interest and contrary to the general welfare of the people of the City and the State.
- (b) Whether a landmark's designation has been rescinded.
- (c) Whether the structure, although not itself a landmark structure, contributes to the distinctive architectural or historic character of the historic district as a whole and therefore should be preserved for the benefit of the people of the City and the State.
- (d) Whether demolition or removal of the subject property would be contrary to the policy and purpose of this ordinance and/or to the objectives of the historic preservation plan for the applicable historic district as duly adopted by the Common Council.
- (e) Whether the structure is of such old and unusual or uncommon design, method of construction, or material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.
- (f) Whether retention of the structure would promote the general welfare of the people of the City and the State by encouraging study of American history, architecture and design or by developing an understanding of American culture and heritage.
- (g) The condition of the property, provided that any deterioration of the property which is self-created or which is the result of a failure to maintain the property as required by this chapter cannot qualify as a basis for the issuance of a certificate of appropriateness for demolition or removal.
- (h) Whether any new structure proposed to be constructed or change in use proposed to be made is compatible with the historic resources of the historic district in which the subject property is located, or if outside a historic district, compatible with the mass and scale of buildings within two hundred (200) feet of the boundary of the landmark site.

Prior to approving a certificate of appropriateness for demolition, the Landmarks Commission may require the applicant to provide documentation of the structure. Documentation shall be in the form required by the Commission.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
 - (a) Gross Volume.
 - (b) Height.
 - (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
 - (d) Materials used in the street facades.
 - (e) The design of the roof.
 - (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses.
 - (g) Directional expression.
 - (h) Materials, patterns and textures.
 - (i) Landscape treatment.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing detached garage structure and construct a new detached garage structure. The house on the property was constructed in 1928 and the garage followed in 1929. Both structures were constructed by carpenter Andrew Kjervik, who built a couple of houses on this block.

The existing garage has deteriorated over time and is not dimensioned for current vehicle sizes. The replacement garage will largely replicate the appearance of the current garage. The building will be clad in smooth-surfaced vinyl siding that will replicate a 4-inch reveal clapboard siding. The pedestrian and vehicle doors are typical for accessory structures in the district. The single-hung window replicates the form of windows found on the principal structure. The gable-front structure is a simple, functional design that is common for garages in the vicinity.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (2) Demolition or Removal. In determining whether to approve a certificate of appropriateness for any demolition or removal of any landmark or structure within a historic district, the Landmarks Commission shall consider all of the following, and may give decisive weight to any or all of the following:
 - (a) The garage is not historically significant.
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) While the garage is typical of styles in the district, this prevalent form is not an endangered resource.
 - (d) The removal of this structurally failed garage for a new garage that accommodates current vehicles is not contrary to the policy and purpose of this ordinance.
 - (e) This garage is not of a particularly old or unusual design.
 - (f) Retention of the structure would not promote the general welfare of the people of the City and the State by encouraging study of American history, architecture and design or by developing an understanding of American culture and heritage.
 - (g) The deterioration of the garage is due to age and original method of construction, not a failure to maintain the structure.
 - (h) The new structure will replicate the appearance of the existing garage while adapting the design to accommodate current vehicle sizes.

Staff does not recommend additional photographic documentation beyond what was provided in the application.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
 - (a) The new garage is of a similar gross volume to other garages within 200 feet.
 - (b) The garage is of a similar height to other historic resources in the vicinity.
 - (c) The street façade of the garage is minimally visible from the street, but it follows the pattern of rhythm of solids and voids with the vehicle door occupying the majority of the front façade.
 - (d) The siding will replicate the appearance of wood clapboard and the vehicle door will replicate the appearance of the existing garage door, which is typical of historic resources in the vicinity.
 - (e) The gable front roof design is typical of garages within 200 feet.
 - (f) The new garage will be located behind the principal structure, which is the typical siting of accessory structures in the district.
 - (g) The garage replicates the traditional directional expression of accessory structures.
 - (h) The new garage will replicate traditional materials, patterns and textures.
 - (i) N/A

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.