

AGENDA #10

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: June 16, 2010
TITLE: 517-523 East Main Street – PUD(GDP-SIP), Demolition for a 21-Unit Building. 6 th Ald. Dist. (18842)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: June 16, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, R. Richard Wagner, Mark Smith and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of June 16, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 517-523 East Main Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Lance McGrath, Bruce Simonson and Bert Stitt. McGrath presented details of the proposal, including building elevations. The project will be 3-stories of apartments over one level of parking; 7-units per floor for a total of 21 units in a mix of 1 and 2-bedroom. The underground parking will have space for 25 cars and bike parking. There is 12-feet of grade change going from Blair Street around the corner to Main Street. The existing Water Utility building on the site is a zero lot line. This project will create setbacks of approximately 8-feet. McGrath further stated they have had meetings with the neighborhood and have future meetings scheduled. Simonson then spoke specific building details, including the entrance on Main Street and handicapped accessibility to the building. Access into the site off Blair Street will lead to the underground parking garage. Brick building materials will be consistent on all four sides. Window boxes are being considered on the front along the Blair Street elevation to liven up the building appearance. Comments from the Commission were as follows:

- I like it. Right off the bat you're doing a nice job.
- The door next to the garage needs to be a pedestrian door; door should have opening to get light in.
- What is your concern with having some outdoor space to this building? Will you consider a green roof instead?
 - Would rather have a more discreet area for the residents rather than a large congregating area.
- Provide context with neighborhood.
- Blair Street door is underwhelming.
- Main Street porch in the middle disrupts the pattern of all the others.
- Really nice project. Like the asymmetrical elevations a lot.
- Consider different finishes on ramp/stair at the Main Street entry beyond concrete. Consider facing stairs in cut stone.
- There's something about the cornice right now that's not right. Bring in another option or two. Doesn't seem to have the depth that the building does at the top. EIFS would be a showstopper.

- Scale, rhythm and brick work are all great.
- The scale of the cornice bothers me; expectation of character; consider metal with details and patina.
- Cornice appears visually short.
- This will be a wonderful addition to the neighborhood.
- Consider making roof of utility addition a deck for adjacent unit or make it a two-story element to add additional living area to the adjacent unit.

Stitt read a memorandum from the First Settlement Steering Committee and their views on the project.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 517-523 East Main Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	5	5	-	-	-	6	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7

General Comments:

- Great start but no EIFS.
- Blair Street façade needs work; excellent start.