



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

*Consider: Who benefits? Who is burdened?
Who does not have a voice at the table?
How can policymakers mitigate unintended consequences?*

Wednesday, November 30, 2022

4:30 PM

Virtual

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Present: 5 - Lois H. Braun-Oddo; Cliff Goodhart; Shane A. Bernau; Christian J. Harper and Amanda T. Arnold
Excused: 4 - Juliana R. Bennett; Jessica Klehr; Rafeeq D. Asad and Russell S. Knudson

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Braun-Oddo, seconded by Bernau, to Approve the Minutes of November 9, 2022. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC COMMENT

1. [61804](#) Public Comment
None.

DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS

Arnold disclosed that she previously worked at JSD in 2020. Goodhart disclosed that he is retired from Eppstein Uhen Architects.

AGENDA OVERVIEW

Jessica Vaughn gave an overview of the projects.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

ROLL CALL

Present: 6 - Juliana R. Bennett; Lois H. Braun-Oddo; Cliff Goodhart; Shane A. Bernau; Christian J. Harper and Amanda T. Arnold
Excused: 3 - Jessica Klehr; Rafeeq D. Asad and Russell S. Knudson

2. [73342](#) 415 N Lake Street - Planned Development (PD) and Public Building for the New Lake Street Public Parking Ramp and Mixed-Use Building. 2nd Ald. Dist.

The Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of the public building with the following conditions:

- That more detail be provided at the pedestrian level both along Hawthorne Court and Lake Street with regard to building design, materials and renderings, refinement of the finish

treatment of the columns, including materials selection. An amendment to the motion by Bernau to add refinement of the level of design/articulation at the built corners and north/south elevations along Hawthorne Court and the exposed garage walls was accepted.

The UDC **RECOMMENDS** that the Plan Commission approve the private portion of the development and phasing as presented. The UDC further recommends the following:

- To incorporate more substantial plantings along Lake Street.
- Review the Hawthorne Court traffic counts relative to traffic circulation and pedestrian safety, and bus entrances and exits.

An amendment to the recommendation was made by Harper, noting that the UDC is not uniformly on board with routine exceptions for overruns and would prefer to see them minimized to the greatest extent possible. Exceptions in special circumstances, including where amenities that add value to the development, would be acceptable.

The motion and recommendation both passed on a unanimous vote of (5-0).

A motion was made by Braun-Oddo, seconded by Arnold, to Grant Initial Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

3. [72979](#) 330 W. Mifflin Street - Alteration of a Planned Development (PD), Renovation of the Madison Senior Center Courtyard into a Public Park. 4th Ald. Dist.

The Urban Design Commission made an advisory recommendation to the Plan Commission for **FINAL APPROVAL with the condition of adding a second pet waste station.**

A motion was made by Braun-Oddo, seconded by Bennett, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

4. [74667](#) 414 E. Washington Avenue - Comprehensive Design Review of Signage (CDR) Located in Urban Design District (UDD) 4. 2nd Ald. Dist.

The motion noted the following findings with regard to CDR criteria #2:

It is unfortunate that the designers didn't look at precedent for where memorial signs would be appropriately located, but in this condition, considering the detailing of the building and the materiality, the duplicated memorial signage on the front of the building is acceptable.

A motion was made by Braun-Oddo, seconded by Arnold, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

5. [68727](#) 1802-1902 Pankratz Street - Addition to Existing Building for Isthmus Montessori Academy Located in Urban Design District (UDD) No. 4. 12th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Arnold, seconded by Braun-Oddo, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

6. [71120](#) 3841 E. Washington Avenue - Renovation of a Former Hotel Building to Residential Located in Urban Design District (UDD) No. 5. 3rd Ald. Dist.

The motion passed with the following conditions:

- Adding stairs by the ramp to allow someone to travel a straight line towards E Washington Avenue,
- Changing the muntins on the windows in the option revision,
- changing out some of the plant species outlined above, and
- Switching out the evergreen shrubs or paying attention to salt usage.

A motion was made by Braun-Oddo, seconded by Bernau, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

7. [73564](#)

2007 Roth Street Lot 1 of the Proposed CSM - Alder Referral, Multi-Family, Senior Housing Residential Building. 12th Ald. Dist.

The Urban Design Commission made an **ADVISORY RECOMMENDATION to not approve** the development as proposed with the following comments:

- That the Plan Commission request a redesign that responds to the neighborhood plans and includes an architectural design that carries forward traditional neighborhood design principles, and a site plan that responds to street activation in a more urban format and that is less suburban.
- Traditional neighborhood design is architecturally more of a pedestrian scale at the ground level in materiality, and also mass and void articulation that activates the street, specifically along Huxley.

A motion was made by Bernau, seconded by Braun-Oddo, to Recommend Non-Approval to the Plan Commission. The motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes: 4 - Lois H. Braun-Oddo; Shane A. Bernau; Christian J. Harper and Amanda T. Arnold

Noes: 1 - Juliana R. Bennett

Excused: 3 - Jessica Klehr; Rafeeq D. Asad and Russell S. Knudson

Non Voting: 1 - Cliff Goodhart

8. [73565](#)

2007 Roth Street Lot 2 of the Proposed CSM - Alder Referral, Multi-Family Residential Building. 12th Ald. Dist.

The Urban Design Commission made an advisory **RECOMMENDATION to the Plan Commission to approve** the multi-family development, including the following:

- The UDC finds that the project meets the design goals of street activation and the general building mass is acceptable, and overall building height related to the elevator towers.
- The UDC requests consideration of including community garden planting beds in areas that are accessible and well lit.
- The developer minimizes the appearance and effect of the rooftop parking to the greatest extend possible, including utilizing cutoff lights with shades, minimize protrusions and unsightly infrastructure for the parking deck.

A motion was made by Bennett, seconded by Harper, to Recommend Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

9. [67494](#)

804 Felland Road - Residential Building Complex. 3rd Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Arnold, seconded by Braun-Oddo, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

NEW BUSINESS

10. [74229](#)

6604 Odana Road - Planned Multi-Use Site. 19th Ald. Dist.

As part of the Commission's motion for referral, the Commission requested the following:

- Renderings of the proposed building,
- Renderings of the proposed buildings within the context (i.e. including the adjacent development),
- A comprehensive site plan for the whole existing planned multi-use site,
- If known, any future planned development master plan. If there is not a future master plan, it is acceptable to note that. If that is the case, the suggestion of overlaying the proposed site plan on the Odana Road Area Plan could be beneficial, and
- A shadow analysis (which specifically addresses conditional use standards related to the evaluation of requests for additional height).

A motion was made by Braun-Oddo, seconded by Bernau, to Refer to the URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION meeting of December 14, 2022. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

SECRETARY'S REPORT

BUSINESS BY MEMBERS

11. [64940](#) Announcements, Questions and/or Consideration Items for Future Agendas (No Other Action To Be Taken Under This Item)

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was Adjourned at 9:39 p.m. by unanimous consent.