

## Madison Landmarks Commission

---

University Heights Historic District  
Criteria for the review of additions, exterior alterations and repairs  
Parcels zoned R2 and R4A

---

Address: 113 Bascom Place  
Date: May 21, 2009  
Form Prepared By: R. Cnare and B. Fruhling

---

Does the project meet the following guideline criteria?  
(For the complete text of the criteria, please see Madison General Ordinances Sec. 33.01(12)(d), available on the web at [www.cityofmadison.com](http://www.cityofmadison.com))

Yes	<u>n/a</u>	No	<u>          </u>	1.	Height.
Yes	<u>n/a</u>	No	<u>          </u>	2.	Second exit platforms and fire escapes.
Yes	<u>n/a</u>	No	<u>          </u>	3.	Solar apparatus.
Yes	<u>n/a</u>	No	<u>          </u>	4.	Repairs.
Yes	<u>n/a</u>	No	<u>          </u>	5.	Restoration.
Yes	<u>n/a</u>	No	<u>          </u>	6.	Re-siding.
Yes	<u>n/a</u>	No	<u>          </u>	7.	Additions visible from the street and alterations to street façades.
Yes	<u>n/a</u>	No	<u>          </u>	8.	Additions and exterior alterations not visible from the street.
Yes	<u>n/a</u>	No	<u>          </u>	9.	Roof shape.
Yes	<u>?</u>	No	<u>          </u>	10.	Roof material.
Yes	<u>n/a</u>	No	<u>          </u>	11.	Parking lots.

---

### Explanation:

The owner is proposing to replace the roof with a new eco friendly roofing material. The existing roof appears to be normal flat asphalt shingles. Since staff has not had any experience with this new product, and has no precedent from which to administratively approve the roofing material, we have asked the Commission to consider the request. The owner's representative will bring a sample of the material to the meeting for the Commission to consider.

According to the proprietor's website, the eco-shakes are made from "100% recycled materials, reinforced vinyl and cellulose fiber material" and are "designed to resemble and replace wood shake shingles." The material has a 50-year warranty, and has solid color throughout.

According to the University Heights Historic District Criteria, if the existing roofing material is asphalt shingles, then any roof replacement "must be done using rectangular sawn wood shingles, or rectangular shingles that are similar in width, thickness and apparent length to sawn wood shingles, for example 3-in-1 tab asphalt shingles. Modern style shingle, such as thick wood shakes, dutch lap, french method and interlock shingles that are incompatible with the historic character of the district are prohibited"

---

X Please see continuation sheet

While staff is uncertain of the durability, potential fading and appearance of this material, the Commission should consider new technologies as building materials become available. Depending upon the Commission's finding, allowing this material could set a precedent for future replacements of asphalt shingled roofs.

Respectfully Submitted,  
Rebecca Cnare and Bill Fruhling  
May 21, 2009