

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 6/4/18

TITLE: 1424 Rutledge Street - Exterior Alteration
in the Marquette Bungalows Hist.
Dist.; 6th Ald. Dist.

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Amy Scanlon, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 6/8/18

ID NUMBER: 51826

Members present were: Stuart Levitan, Chair; Anna V. Andrzejewski, Vice Chair; David WJ McLean, Richard Arnesen, Marsha A. Rummel, and Katie Kaliszewski. Excused was Lon Hill.

SUMMARY:

Linda Puls, registering in support and available to answer questions.

Staff noted that the project is straightforward and was close to meeting the ordinance standards and being administratively approved, with the only question about ordinance 41.18(1)(d) regarding whether it frustrates the public interest.

Puls described the current windows as very drafty with wood that is falling apart, and stated her belief that the replacement windows they have selected keep with the character of the house. She said that the porch is rotting and is not level, so there is no question about whether that needs to be repaired.

Kaliszewski asked if all windows on the home are being replaced. Multiple Commission members indicated that four front windows are being replaced. Andrzejewski noted that the ordinance does not allow replacement of leaded glass and non-rectangular windows, and requested confirmation that only wood sash windows are being replaced. Puls confirmed this and stated that she has never replaced the leaded glass windows.

McLean asked if these would be the only new windows on the house. Puls stated that eight windows would be replaced: four on the front, three on the side, and one on the back of the house. She noted that they had an upper dormer window rebuilt several years ago and replaced some windows on the side of the house as well.

McLean asked if the previous replacement windows were clad as well. Puls confirmed, and said that she felt the contractor did a good job of sealing them and making the new windows look like the front windows. Puls stated there are currently aluminum storms and screens. Arnesen asked for clarification on how many total windows are being replaced, and staff confirmed there are eight total.

Arnesen asked if the bar is lower for window replacement in Marquette Bungalows than in other historic districts. Andrzejewski and staff confirmed this is true, and staff indicated it is the reason she had the Commission review the request rather than administratively approving it.

Andrzejewski noted that if this were in a different historic district, it would not be approved so easily. She explained that the Commission determines whether a proposed project meets the relevant ordinances, and in

this case the project does; however, they would be having a long discussion about replacing windows if it were in any other historic district.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Arnesen and seconded by McLean to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion passed by voice vote.