

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

October 28, 2019

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 1244 Rutledge Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Legistar File ID # [57815](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: October 21, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Kurt Hartjes – Waunakee Remodeling

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace 9 windows. The windows date from a variety of periods as this building has evolved significantly over time. According to Assessor records, the original date of construction for the home is 1860, but there have been several additions over time. The most recent alterations were re-siding with 3" exposure vinyl siding in 1991 (which included wrapping trim) and a rear sunroom addition in 1993, all approved by the Landmarks Commission.

Staff has reviewed the pictures provided in the application and most of the windows appear to be more recent replacements. This determination is due to the style of muntins on the windows, the appearance of the wood, the types of hardware on the windows, and the condition of the paint. The one exception are the three Arts-and-Crafts windows (202, 205, & 206). While the interior hand grips may not be original, the rest of the window components appear to date the windows as being late 19th to early 20th Century windows, which would place them in the period of significance for the Third Lake Ridge Historic District (1850-1929). The principal failing of those windows appear to be failed aluminum tracks in the window jambs, which could be replaced, and any damage to the wood windows be repaired. It is unclear why window #201 cannot have the glazing putty replaced rather than replacing the entire window. The midcentury windows (from the 1950s remodel) would be constructed of newer growth wood, which is often a challenge to preserve, but the appearance of windows 103, 203, and 204 seem to show relatively intact windows in need of maintenance due to failed tracks in the window jambs. Windows 101 and 102 appear to be more recent replacement windows located in historic openings.

In reviewing the application, staff noted that the window key provided in the application had a building footprint and identified window locations that did not seem to relate to the existing conditions. Please see the attached corrected window key supplied by staff. The application narrative discusses that the various windows will have similar dimensions, but as a comparison of the dimensions of each window and its components is missing from the pages discussing each window, it remains unclear if the proposed replacements will replicate the existing conditions.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) N/A
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) See discussion of Third Lake Ridge Historic District below.
 - (d) Removing character-defining windows that are repairable will frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. Please see the attached memo from the City Attorney's office.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
 - a) No proposed changes to height, landscape treatment, or rhythm of mass and spaces.
 - b) Only one of the windows proposed for replacement is located on the street façade. The proposal would not change the proportion or rhythm of solids and voids.
 - c) Windows 205 and 206 face the street and are two of the windows that appear to date to the period of significance. This standard requires retention of existing historical materials on the street façade.
 - d) No proposed alterations to the roof.
 - e) Without a specific identification of the window component dimensions and how they compare between the existing vs. the proposed replacements, it is unclear if the windows within the existing window openings will have different proportions of the windows.

Recommendation

Staff believes that it is unclear if the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness have been met and recommends the Landmarks Commission refer the item to a future meeting and request the applicant supply information on if the existing windows (particularly windows 202, 205, & 206) can be repaired, how the cost of repair compares to the cost of replacement, and information on the measurements of each window, including the window components, and how those measurements compare to the proposed replacements.