



Project Name/Address: 514 N Carroll St/103 Langdon St

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations on a landmarks site in a historic district

Legistar File ID # [57086](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: August 21, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Laura Stoller

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for an exterior alteration to a landmark site in the Mansion Hill historic district involving the installation of a fence.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located on a landmark site in the Mansion Hill historic district.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Historic Preservation Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

41.22 MANSION HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (4) Standards for Review of Development in the Mansion Hill Historic District.
 - (a) Any new structure located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 1. Height.
 2. Gross Volume.
 3. In the street elevation(s) of a structure, the proportion of width to height in the facade(s).
 4. The proportions and relationships of width to height of the doors and windows in street facade(s).
 5. The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.
 - (b) All street facades shall blend with other structures via directional expression. When adjacent structures have a dominant vertical or horizontal expression, this expression should be carried over and reflected.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the historic front fence with a different design. The Delta Gamma Sorority has two properties that serve as their campus: 514 N Carroll and 103 Langdon St. While both are located within the Mansion Hill Historic District, the building at 514 N Carroll is individually listed as a landmark as a Claude & Stark Prairie-style house.

As part of previously approved work on 103 Langdon St., the property owners removed the privacy fence that connected to both principal structures. In reviewing historic photos, it appears that this fence was in place as early as 1971, and was constructed in the style of the landmark at 514 N Carroll, but primarily sited on the parcel for 103 Langdon. As it was located as part of what functioned as the front yard space for 514 N Carroll, the design reflected the Prairie style landmark. The applicant would like to construct a new fence between the two buildings, but do so in the style of the building at 103 Langdon. While the fence is partly located on the parcel of 514 N Carroll, the vast majority of the fence is located on the parcel for 103 Langdon. The fence they are proposing is a white picket fence, which is largely in the style of the privacy fence that serves as the front fence for 103 Langdon.

The fence appears to meet the standards for the Mansion Hill Historic District, which is required for exterior alterations at 103 Langdon. The question is if the proposed alteration meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, as required for exterior alterations at 514 N Carroll.

The Landmarks Commission does not typically review fences. But as the fence in question is located along the front wall plane of landmark at 514 N Carroll, is a structure of distinct character, and has been in place for approximately 50 years, this is a unique circumstance.

A discussion of the relevant standards follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) Exterior alterations at 514 N Carroll must comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) N/A.
 - (c) Exterior alterations at 103 Langdon must comply with the Mansion Hill Historic District standards
 - (d) While the fence in question has been in place for approximately 50 years, it is unlikely to be an original Claude & Stark design as it is primarily located on the adjacent parcel.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. There are no changes proposed for the use at 514 N Carroll. The applicant wants to change the style of the privacy fence that has minimal attachment to this building.
2. The ca. 1971 fence utilizes motifs from the landmark building at 514 N Carroll. While a different style fence would remove materials that characterize the property, the fence is not original and only a small portion is located on the parcel for the landmark.
3. Assuming that the fence is not original, its construction in 1971 would have created a false sense of history as that space was not a part of the front yard for 514 N Carroll. A change to a fence that characterizes the building at 103 Langdon would better identify the parcel boundaries of each property.
4. As the previous fence was located on the properties for approximately 50 years, the question is whether this has acquired historic significance in its own right. As only a very small portion of the fence is located on the landmark property, it is difficult to make an argument that the segment on the parcel for 514 N Carroll is significant in its own right. A new fence in the style of the parcel on which is it largely sited will eliminate confusion as to which elements on the property for 514 N Carroll are historic and associated with the period of significance of the landmark.
5. While the 1971 fence was constructed to utilize features distinctive to the landmark at 514 N Carroll, it is not likely to be original or part of the significance of the property.
6. The fence is severely deteriorated and repair is not feasible. The applicant would like to replace it with a fence that matches the character of 103 Langdon.
7. No proposed chemical treatments are proposed.

8. No archaeological resources are likely to be impacted.
9. The new fence would be compatible with the property at 103 Langdon as it is primarily located on that parcel. Its style and design would differentiate it as being a new fence, and it would allow that fence to read as being a part of the Langdon parcel rather than the Carroll parcel.
10. As a fence with exterior attachment to the adjacent structures, it can easily be removed in the future.

41.22 MANSION HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (4) Standards for Review of Development in the Mansion Hill Historic District.
 - (a) Any new structure located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 1. The height of the fence is in keeping with the height of other fences on the property and in the district.
 2. The fence does not have a great deal of volume and is in keeping with the character of front yard and side yard fences in the district.
 3. While the fence is attached to the street elevation of 514 N Carroll and the side street elevation of 103 Langdon, a fence is not a structure with a façade and it will not impact the street facades of the principal structures at either property.
 4. Again, the fence does not have a façade, but the gate will be in keeping with the style of the fence and with gate entries on fences in the vicinity.
 5. The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.
 - (b) The fence does not have a façade, but its direction expression is in keeping with the character of other fences in the vicinity.

Recommendation

Staff believes the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for 514 N Carroll St/103 Langdon St are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.