

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: September 19, 2007
TITLE: 1022 West Johnson Street – Demolish Two Houses for PUD(GDP-SIP) for a 14-Story, 165-Unit Apartment Building. 8 th Ald. Dist.	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: September 19, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Jay Ferm, Richard Slayton, Bruce Woods, and Marsha Rummel, Lou Host-Jablonski and Todd Barnett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 19, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 1022 West Johnson Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Randy Bruce, Rebecca Flood, Gary Brown, and Ledell Zellers. The modified plans as presented by Bruce featured the following:

- The overall building mass has been modified to create a building setback above the fourth story level on the West Johnson and Mills Street building elevations.
- The building still features a setback at the top of the 12th story with an additional two stories above (14 stories total) and elevator penthouse.
- A corner plaza has been created with an overall building setback at the apex of Mills and West Johnson Streets.
- The new design is a departure from the “wedding cake tiered” approach and eliminates the pitched roof/mansard roof elements as previously proposed with the corner façade featuring a tower like element to the ground at the plaza space on the corner.
- The interior floor plan adjacent to the corner plaza place will feature community space.

Following the presentation Ledell Zellers spoke in opposition and distributed photos of the existing Conklin House at 309 North Mills Street, as well as the house at 1022 West Johnson Street, both proposed to be demolished as part of the redevelopment of the combined sites. Zellers noted the Capitol Neighborhoods, Inc. opposition to the demolition of the Conklin House, which was built in 1887 and reflects a design by Claude and Stark. She recommended the Commission turn down or require a suitable place be found to relocate the home. Gary Brown, speaking as a representative of the Lutheran Memorial Church spoke in support of the project, noting the church’s previous concern with the height of the building and its relationship with the church tower, where with the current design the concerns have been satisfied. He also noted his affiliation with the Lutheran Campus Center, also in support of the project. Brown noted that the house was out of place with adjacent institutional uses. Staff noted to the Commission that the demolition of the Conklin House, as well as the adjacent house on Johnson Street would require consideration by the Landmarks Commission due to the Conklin House’s potential as a landmark, as well as the adjacent church. Staff noted that projects that require both Urban Design Commission and Landmarks approval have a protocol which requires Landmarks approval

of the project prior to any consideration by the Commission. Ald. Rummel noted that resolution of the Conklin House issue, as well as any landmark and relocation issues were critical to her support for any consideration on the redevelopment proposal. The following was further noted by the Commission:

- The design solution is far superior, creative, makes the corner work.
- How area has evolved doesn't make it appropriate if house stays, but needs to be resolved.
- Fantastic job on development/architectural issues.
- Like architecture, corner treatment successful, but the stair to Johnson Street needs work, discern corner treatment trees from streetscape, widen stairs, decrease decorative planters.
- Concern with the lack of services in the commercial area internally and externally. Need business to draw and activate space and bring people there.
- Bike racks far from the main entrance, presents security issues.
- Like direction of project, especially the plaza, the shape, landscaping and other features needs more work to be more fluid.
- Consider a more pronounced stair as an open corner feature, i.e. "Spanish steps."
- Area of Johnson on the plaza a good location for bikes, at the same time also will open up the corner.
- Make sure to provide adequate space for mopeds.
- Upon further consideration of the project, need a statement on the amount of impervious area before and after the site's redevelopment.
- Provide additional information and comment on the design and use of roof spaces.

Following the presentation the Commission generally noted its concern with the proposed demolition of the Conklin House and the need to resolve landmarks issues, especially its relocation to another site.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 7, 8 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1022 West Johnson Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings								info
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	info only 8
	5	6	-	-	-	5	5	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	8	8	-	-	-	8	9	8
	7	7	-	-	-	7	7	7

General Comments:

- Conklin House is worth preserving and relocating. Let's try to make this a win – win for your interesting infill project & the preservation of our city's history. Move previous surfaces.
- Great improvements, and fine awareness of the urban design issues of this corner. Please move the house!
- Without services (retail), wonderful plaza will not realize its potential.
- Great transformation from original concept.