



**Project Name & Address:** 719 Jenifer Street  
**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition and exterior alterations  
**Legistar File ID #** [77463](#)  
**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** June 21, 2023

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Bradley Servin, Architectural Design Consultants Inc.  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition and exterior alterations.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject property is in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

#### 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
  - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
  - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

#### 41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
  - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
  - (b) Materials and Features
    1. Alterations shall be in keeping with the original design and character of the building.

2. The removal of historic features on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
- (c) Replacement
  1. Existing features shall be replaced in-kind if they are too deteriorated to repair.
- (3) Exterior Walls
  - (b) Wood
    1. Replacement siding shall imitate the original siding within one inch of historic exposure/reveal.
    3. All trim must project beyond the face of the siding to the same extent it did with the historic siding.
    4. Wrapping of trim and ornament is prohibited.
- (4) Roofs
  - (a) General
    1. Alterations to a roof shall include a roof style that is compatible with the existing roof.
    3. The removal of decorative and functional features visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited, except to restore the building to its historic appearance.
  - (b) Materials.
    1. A roof feature may be replaced in kind if it is too deteriorated to repair.
    2. Replacement materials shall replicate the appearance of historic roofing materials found on the structure or be compatible with roofing found on historic resources in the district.
- (5). Windows and Doors
  - (a) Openings
    1. A limited number of openings in walls above the foundation not visible from the developed public right-of-way may be filled in a manner that retains the original opening pattern and size, and is similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the surrounding wall.
    2. New window openings may be added to elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
    3. The new openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.
  - (b) Sill and Head Height
    1. Infilling at the head or jambs is prohibited.
    2. The new or reconfigured openings shall have similar appearance to the historic windows or doors of the structure.
    3. The sills of historic window openings on elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way may be raised to serve bathrooms and kitchens.
  - (c) Windows
    2. Only when original windows are too deteriorated or hazardous to repair may they be replaced with new windows that replicate all design details.
    3. Replacement multi-light windows shall use true divided lights or simulated divided lights with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.
  - (d) Pedestrian Doors
    2. Doors shall not have a textured fake wood grain.
    3. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view, wood or aluminum, and shall be compatible with the entrance door and the overall design of the building.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
  - (a) Replacement

1. An entire entrance or porch that is too deteriorated to repair shall be replaced using any available physical evidence or historic documentation as a model to reproduce the porch features.
- (b) Porch Elements
  1. Where physical evidence of the overall historic form and detailing are not evident, porch elements shall be of a simple design found on similar historic resources within the district.
  3. Spaces beneath porches and stairs shall be enclosed with a framed lattice of crisscross design, narrow vertical boards, masonry, or other approved openwork design to allow ventilation.
  4. All wood on exterior porches shall be painted or opaquely stained.
- (7) Building Systems
  - (a) Mechanical Systems
    1. Mechanical and service equipment shall be installed so that it is as unobtrusive as possible and does not damage or obscure character-defining historic features.
    2. Grilles, vents, equipment, meters, and other equipment attached to the building shall be finished or painted to match the building.
    3. Installing mechanical equipment on the roof that is highly visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
  - (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
    1. Decorative light fixtures shall replicate the original in style and placement.
    2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible and do not damage or obscure character-defining historic features.
    3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
    4. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the developed

#### 41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
  - (a) General
    2. A new addition shall be designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
    3. The addition shall be visually separated from the principal building.
    4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition shall be similar to those of the historic building.
  - (b) Materials and Features
    1. A new addition shall be constructed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.
    2. New additions that destroy significant historic materials or character-defining features are prohibited.
- (2) Building Site
  - (a) General
    1. Exterior additions to historic buildings shall be designed to be compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district.
- (3) Exterior Walls
  - (a) General

1. Materials used for exterior walls of the addition shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as historic or original to the building.
- (b) Wood
  1. Products that replicate wood shall have a smooth surface without textured faux wood grain.
- (4) Roofs
  - (a) General
    1. The form and pitch of the addition roof shall be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.
  - (b) Materials
    1. Visible roof materials shall be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.
  - (e) Vents
    1. Roof vents shall be minimally visible and as unobtrusive as possible.
- (5) Windows and Doors
  - (a) General
    1. Openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
    2. The new openings shall have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.
  - (b) Windows and Storm Windows
    1. Simulated divided lights are permitted with window grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The Landmarks Commission reviewed the proposal to add a gabled addition to the rear of the existing structure, repair the front porch and windows, repair the basement access door, and reconstruct a rear stoop at its June 5, 2023 meeting. The Commission had concerns about the sparse information on how the work would be completed and that the work completed thus far included changing the historic profile of the windows on the sides of the structure. While the Certificate of Appropriateness from 2021 required that the historic profiles of the windows and associated trim replicate the historic, those details were all removed and there is a simple framing around the windows, which does not replicate the historic profiles and has removed the projecting sills.

The updated application materials now denotes what work has already been completed and provides details on what work will be completed as part of this next phase. The applicant states that they were not required to replicate the historic profiles of the windows they had previously replaced, but staff has shared the specific requirement from the previous CoA that did indeed require this.

With the updated materials, staff would recommend that the repair for the front porch include replacing the existing wood shingles with materials in-kind. The new historic district standards require a full-light screen door, which was not a requirement during the previous application. The proposed windows will have a metal-clad exterior and divided lights with spacers, which is what was previously approved for the other window replacements. Again, though, the profiles of the window frames should replicate the historic not new construction. The applicant will need to replicate historic profiles, which they have photographic evidence of prior to the work completed in 2021 and still in place on the front of the building.

The addition area is covered in the Standards for Additions below and separate from the rest of the work on the building, which falls in the Standards for Alterations.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

**41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.**

- (1) General
  - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
  - (b) Materials and Features
    - 1. The proposed alterations to the front and back of the building as proposed would be in keeping with the original design and character of the building.
    - 2. The project proposes to retain the side-gabled projection of the original rear wing as part of the alteration, which will retain this historic feature. Additionally, the historic corbels on the front and all elements on the front porch are proposed to be repaired rather than replaced in order to retain those features.
  - (c) Replacement
    - 1. If any of the elements on the building end up being too deteriorated to repair, the applicant just submit for a new Certificate of Appropriateness with details showing how they will replicate the historic features that need to be replaced..
- (3) Exterior Walls
  - (b) Wood
    - 1. The continuation of the siding replacement replicates the historic reveal of the clapboard siding. The replacement of failed trim is supposed to be with smooth-textured materials that replicate the historic profiles.
    - 3. All trim must project beyond the face of the siding to the same extent it did with the historic siding.
    - 4. Wrapping of trim and ornament is prohibited.
- (4) Roofs
  - (a) General
    - 1. The addition will remove the side-gabled portion of the structure that faced towards the back of the structure, but the forensic evidence of that previous roofline will be retained on the sides of the building.
    - 3. The projection of the side gable will remain on the sides of the structure and will continue to be visible from the developed public right-of-way.
  - (b) Materials.
    - 1. The wood shingles on the front porch roof are deteriorated and should be replaced.
    - 2. The roofing of the main structure is proposed to be replaced and that material needs to meet the historic district standards. The wood shingles on the front porch roof should be replaced with wood shingles of similar profile and reveal.
- (5). Windows and Doors
  - (a) Openings
    - 3. The first floor on the rear of the structure will have new windows and openings that replicate the historic windows on the structure.
  - (b) Sill and Head Height
    - 2. The new or reconfigured openings shall have similar appearance to the historic windows or doors of the structure. This includes the historic sill and frame profiles.
  - (c) Windows
    - 2. The original windows on the sides and back of the building were previously found to be too deteriorated to repair and the Landmarks Commission required that the replacements replicate all design details. The execution of those replacements did not replicate the design details of the window frame, head, or sill decorative details.

The original front windows were determined to be repairable and that they needed to be repaired.

3. The replacement windows will have divided lights with exterior metal cladding, replicating historic profiles.

(d) Pedestrian Doors

2. There is only information on a proposed storm door, so the details on the new rear door still need to be finalized and it must not have fake wood grain. The existing Bilco door on the back will be removed, the concrete repaired, and then the Bilco door will be reinstalled, flashed, and made weather-tight with an application of sealant.
3. The storm door included in this application is for a half light door and the new standards require a full light door. It is unclear if this storm is for both the front and back doors.

(6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks

(a) Replacement

1. The rear stoop must be replaced. The applicant is proposing a simple design with a composite railing. All of it must either be painted or replicate a painted appearance.

(b) Porch Elements

1. The rear stoop is a simple design and in keeping with those found on other historic resources in the district.
3. The space beneath the rear stoop is proposed to be enclosed with a lattice.
4. All wood on exterior porches shall be painted or opaquely stained.

(7) Building Systems

(a) Mechanical Systems

1. There are no details on exterior mechanicals. That will require a future Certificate of Appropriateness if work will be completed that involves new or relocated mechanicals. Mechanical and service equipment shall be installed so that it is as unobtrusive as possible and does not damage or obscure character-defining historic features.
2. Grilles, vents, equipment, meters, and other equipment attached to the building shall be finished or painted to match the building.
3. Installing mechanical equipment on the roof that is highly visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.

(c) Lighting and Electrical Systems

1. There is no information on electrical. Any new or repaired electrical will need a Certificate of Appropriateness. Decorative light fixtures shall replicate the original in style and placement.
2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible and do not damage or obscure character-defining historic features.
3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
4. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the developed

**41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.**

(1) General

(a) General

2. The new addition is on the rear and is subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.

3. The addition is visually separated from the principal building due to the retention of the side-gabled projection.
  4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition are similar to those of the historic building.
- (b) Materials and Features
1. The addition is being constructed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.
  2. The addition is retaining the significant architectural detail of the side-facing gable of the original rear wing.
- (2) Building Site
- (a) General
1. The addition appears to be compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district.
- (3) Exterior Walls
- (a) General
1. The addition will include the materials being used on the rest of the building as part of its larger rehabilitation.
- (b) Wood
1. The proposed cladding is a smooth-surfaced LP Smartside clapboard.
- (4) Roofs
- (a) General
1. The form and pitch of the addition roof will replicate that of the historic front-facing gabled roof.
- (b) Materials
1. The applicant needs to supply product specifications for the proposed type of roofing product.
- (e) Vents
1. Roof vents shall be minimally visible and as unobtrusive as possible. There are no details on venting.
- (5) Windows and Doors
- (a) General
1. The two new openings on the rear of the structure that are a part of the addition and the windows in them are compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
  2. The new openings shall have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure. This includes replicating the historic framing profiles and projecting sill.
- (b) Windows and Storm Windows
1. The proposed windows will replicate the other replacement windows on the building with simulated divided lights with spacer bars.

## Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Final roof shingle, rear door, and storm door specifications be approved administratively by staff.
2. Repair of the side windows to replicate the historic framing profiles and projecting window sills.

3. The original wood windows on the front of the house and the original front entry door will be repaired, not replaced, with this noted on the updated plans.
4. Any exterior lighting or mechanicals proposed as part of this project scope will need a Certificate of Appropriateness, which can be submitted separately and approved administratively.