TOF MAD SO

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Name/Address: 953 Williamson Street

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in an historic district

Legistar File ID # 34088

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Richard Steffes

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior

alterations in a historic district.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

33.19(11)(i) <u>Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned</u> for Residential Use.

- 1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.19(11)(g).
- 2. Alteration of the surface material, pattern and texture in the facade(s) of any existing structures shall be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
- 3. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain or be compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
- 4. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain the existing historical landscape plan or shall develop a new plan which is compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
- 5. Alteration of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

33.19(11)(g) <u>Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.</u>

- 1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
- 2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
- 3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- 4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

The property owner received orders from Building Inspection to repair the front porch structures. The repair work will involve the removal and reconstruction of the porches.

The scope of the work is discussed in an analysis of Section 33.19(11)(i) below:

- 1. See analysis of Sec. 33.19(11)(g below).
- 2. The reconstruction of the porch structure will alter the existing materials. The existing porch is finished (painted or opaque stained) and the replacement porch structure is proposed to be constructed in pressure treated lumber which is not historically appropriate.
- 3. The reconstruction of the porch will not affect the existing and original rhythm of masses and spaces.
- 4. The reconstruction of the porch will not affect the existing historical landscape plan.
- 5. The reconstruction of the porch will not affect the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

The analysis of 33.19(11)(g) follows:

- 1. The reconstruction of the porch will not affect the height.
- 2. The reconstruction of the porch will not affect the historical rhythm of solids and voids.
- 3. The reconstruction of the porch structure will alter the existing materials. The existing porch is finished (painted or opaque stained) and the replacement porch structure is proposed to be constructed in pressure treated lumber which is not historically appropriate. In addition, the construction details of the handrail/guardrail are not historically appropriate.
- 4. The reconstruction of the porch will not affect the roof appearance.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness may be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

- 1. The pressure treated material shall be painted or opaque stained within 12 months of construction.
- The Applicant shall modify the construction details of the handrails/guardrails to use historically appropriate details including a top rail and bottom rail with balusters between those elements (see attached drawing). The sample photo included in the submission materials is not appropriate.
- 3. The submission materials note that the second porch would be similar to the first porch, but more information about the construction is needed for review. The applicant shall provide information about the size of the posts and related newels at the upper level. The handrail/guardrails shall run between the posts and newels.
- 4. The lower area below the first level porch shall be covered with lattice panels that are finished (painted or opaque stained).
- 5. The Applicant shall confirm that the post to concrete foundation connections will occur above grade and that the post anchor fasteners will be covered by baseboard or lattice panel.