AGENDA # <u>2</u>

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION		PRESENTED: March 26, 2008	
TITLE:	4802 Tradewinds Parkway – New Hotel in Urban Design District No. 1. 16 th Ald. Dist. (09118)	REFERRED:	
		REREFERRED:	
		REPORTED BACK:	
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary		ADOPTED:	POF:
DATED: March 26, 2008		ID NUMBER:	

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Marsha Rummel, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Bonnie Cosgrove and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of March 26, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** for a new hotel in Urban Design District No. 1 located at 4802 Tradewinds Parkway. Appearing on behalf of the project were Fred Campbell; Melissa Ernst and Arlen Ostreng, representing Edge Consulting Engineers; Kevin G. Wilson, representing Beltline Hotel Partners II, LLC; Jim Gersich, Dennis Bauer, Ald. Judy Compton, and Phillip Bower, representing the Dane County Humane Society. In response to the Commission's review of the project the following modifications were noted:

- A detailed review of the building elevations noted the use of a brick, stucco, and hardy plank material pallet.
- Attempt to address issues to address issues with the "blankness" of the building façade and building elevation facing Tradewinds Parkway, a roof element had been added above the entry on the south elevation.
- A restudy of the rooftop cupola provides that signage is now limited to only its west and east elevations with signage eliminated on the south and north elevations in favor of the incorporation of clear story windows to provide light into the interior of the upper elevations.

Following presentation, the Commission noted the following:

• Following the presentation Ald. Judy Compton, spoke in favor of the project, emphasized to the Commission that concerns to focus the orientation of the building as it relates to Tradewinds Parkway could not diminish the building's focus toward the adjacent Highway 12 and 18 (East Beltline Highway) façade. Philip Bower, representing the Dane County Humane Society spoke neither in support of opposition, noted concerns with stormwater runoff in the general area affecting the Humane Society site. Details presented by the projects engineer, part of the presentation appeared to resolve concerns relevant to stormwater runoff issues. Continued discussion by the Commission on the project were as follows:

- Relative to the south elevation, consider bumping out doorways to within the corridor in individual units abutting the south elevation to provide for more windows in addition to consideration to moving the pool street side to enhance the street side elevation.
- Adjust the two-way traffic aisle to be tighter by narrowing down its current 24-foot wide width.
- Extend the sidewalk to the patio area just to the north of the porte cochere canopied entry to connect to the patio area adjacent to the pool building.
- Adjust stalls along the west side of the building to incorporate a 16-foot stall length with a 2-foot overhang as provided along the easterly surface parking area.
- Appreciate the windows in the cupola.
- Eliminate the semi-circular design of the patio area adjacent to the pool by squaring it off to relate and connect to the requested sidewalk extension.
- The drop-off area at the porte cochere appears awkward, provides striping for the drop-off area or differential pavement to identify for its identity.
- The windows within the pool addition appear undersize and do not communicate its use. The street side (Tradewinds Parkway) façade is uninviting. Consider flipping the building to place pool toward the street side to enhance its function and appearance.
- Bump out exterior entry into individual units adjacent to the building's south elevation in order to move the unit entry out to allow for a flipping of the floor plan to allow for windows on the building's south elevation.
- The pool, if maintained, abutting the property's East Beltline orientation; doesn't look like much. Needs more from an architectural end.
- Needs more activity on the south elevation to complement the future development and activity on Tradewinds Parkway.
- If the pool is retained on the north side, needs to change architecture to get bigger windows.

Following discussion by the Commission Ald. Compton noted her preference for the building's Beltline orientation and view versus internal views into adjacent industrial areas abutting Tradewinds Parkway.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (7-0). The motion noted favorable acceptance of the site plan and general building massing with issues relevant to the location of the pool, the need to look at façade development and Beltline orientation versus Tradewinds Parkway as well as the detailing of the nonpool end elevation as well as comments relevant to delineation of the drop-off of the porte cochere and issues with the 24-foot wide drive aisle yet requiring further resolution with further consideration of the project.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 5, 5.5, 6 and 6.

Site Circulation Landscape Amenities. Urban Overall Site Plan Architecture Signs (Pedestrian, Plan Lighting, Context Rating Vehicular) Etc. 5.5 5 5 5 5 5 6 6 _ 6 5 6 6 5 5 _ _ 5 5 5 6 5 6 _ _ **Member Ratings** 5 5 6 6 6 6 _ _ 6

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 4802 Tradewinds Parkway

General Comments:

- Street side façade needs to be more welcoming.
- Getting there looking forward to how you address issue of Tradewinds vitality. Consider 2-story glass pool element to punch up architecture.
- Urban edges need study.
- Consider options for making both pool and Tradewinds elevations more inviting.
- Nice response to auto circulation. Landscape improved but open mulch beds area a weakness. Strengthen south façade.
- Drive-thru canopy creates poor traffic circulation.
- Rather average building design.