

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: April 11, 2007
TITLE: 505-550 Midvale Boulevard, Midvale Plaza Redevelopment, PUD(GDP-SIP), Mixed-Use Development, Alterations to Previously Approved Plans. 11 th Ald. Dist. (02988)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: William Fruhling, Acting Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: April 11, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner (Chair); Richard Slayton, Ald. Noel Radomski, Michael Barrett, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett and Bruce Woods.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of April 11, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** for alterations to previously approved plans for the Midvale Plaza PUD(GDP-SIP) mixed-use development located at 505-550 Midvale Boulevard. Appearing on behalf of the project were Bruce Simonson, Joe Krupp and Peter Fortlage. Simonson reviewed the changes:

1. The terrace area at the east end of the library has been eliminated and the bioretention area redesigned;
2. The special paving at the corner of Midvale Boulevard and Tokay Boulevard has been reduced to reflect City Engineering's requirement for continuous City sidewalks;
3. The scored, colored concrete areas in the parking lot have been removed;
4. Some building changes have been included;
5. Some brick detailing has been eliminated;
6. The amount of pavers leading to the edge of the second floor Tokay terrace has been reduced; and
7. Several chimneys have been eliminated.

He said the changes were the result of value engineering. Brandon Casto registered in support and requested City Engineering review of stormwater changes. Tom Talerico registered in support. Anna Strenski neither supports nor opposes. Ald. Tim Gruber supports the changes, but feels reducing the special paving at the corner needs to be revisited. The Commission discussed the landscaping near the bioretention area, the maintenance required, and whether it would adequately screen the mechanical equipment. There was also considerable discussion about reducing the special paving at the Midvale/Tokay corner and the Commission felt very strongly that this is an important civic space, especially with the library.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barrett, seconded by Host-Jablonski, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** for alterations to previously approved plans for the Midvale Plaza PUD(GDP-SIP) mixed-use

development located at 505-550 Midvale Boulevard, except for removing the special paving at the corner of Midvale Boulevard and Tokay Boulevard, and asked that the cultivar of arborvitae be changed to a more diminutive size to screen the mechanical equipment near the bioretention area. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (7-0).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 6, 6, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 505-550 Midvale Boulevard

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	6	6	-	-	6	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	6	-	-	6	-	-
	-	-	-	-	-	-	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	6	6	6/7	5	6	5	6	6
	5	-	5	-	-	6	6	6

General Comments:

- The City Engineering Department needs to be more respectful of urban community space. If they are not familiar with how this might be accomplished, we can help them with that.
- City Engineering – please reconsider your decisions to remove the sidewalk element on the corner. It is a civic location and deserves “special treatment.”
- Most of the changes are minor and are just fine. The corner paving treatment, however, is non-negotiable. City Engineering needs to do its part in creating special urban places. Color paving is the least they could do. Another disappointment: the windows that go all the way to the ground significantly detracts from the solidity of the architecture – it is now a very mall-like treatment.
- Leave pavement at corner as originally designed.
- Concerned about available root zone for lindens at end islands.
- Pavement pattern at corner of Midvale & Tokay should be all the way to the corner, not cut off at sidewalk.