



Project Name & Address: 1123 Williamson Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Legistar File ID # [67970](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: November 9, 2021

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Daniel Scott, Scott Brothers Remodeling

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a dormer and reroofing.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
 - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to constructed a 12-foot wide dormer on the east side of the single-story structure. While the overall footprint of the structure is 30 feet deep, the section of roof for the “dormer” is only 22.5 feet long, making the proposed dormer more than 50% of the wall plane for that section of the structure. The dormer would contain a bay of 4 windows.

Staff has advised the applicant that this is not in compliance with the Third Lake Ridge standards, which require maintaining the historic roof appearance and that is it not in keeping with previous Landmarks Commission precedent of approving small dormers that accommodating the space for a single window, significantly stepped back from the front elevation.

As precedent, the applicant is citing a cross-gabled roof at 1114 Williamson St. The structure proposed for alteration always had a front-facing gable roof, however. There are similar roofs on structures within 200 feet and the few with dormers feature 3-4 foot wide dormers, located midway on the roof. See attached correspondence for the difference in these two resources.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. N/A
 - 2. N/A
 - 3. The addition of the intersecting gable on this simple, single-story structure rather than a small dormer will change the overall mass of the existing structure.
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) N/A

- (d) The introduction of a side gable will alter the roof form from a front-facing gabled structure to a cross-gabled structure. This dramatically changes the appearance of the structure where a small dormer would maintain the historic form of the roof appearance.
- (e) N/A

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission refer the project to a future meeting to allow the applicant to redesign for a 4-foot wide dormer or 4-foot wide dormers on each side of the roof.