

TO: Brad Wirtz-HR Director

FROM: Mike Lipski-HR Services Manager

DATE: September 27, 2012

SUBJECT: Position Study outcomes-2011

In December, 2010, I prepared a report for the Board of Estimates which discussed the position study process and provided an analysis of position study outcomes for 2009 and 2010.¹ We had discussed at that time preparing a similar analysis annually. The initial report included a detailed explanation of the position study process, as well as an analysis of the outcomes. I am providing this memo with an analysis of the outcomes of the studies in 2011, but I am not going to include the overview of the position study process again.

The report in 2010 showed the following as it relates to position study outcomes:

Table 1—Position Study Outcomes 2009-2010

Study Outcome	Represented Position/ Classification affected	Non-Represented Position/ Classification affected	Total
Reclass of individual	13	11	24
Career Ladders	3	4	7
New classification created	3	0	3
New position created	3	12	15
New hourly classification created	2	0	2
Retitle classification/ position	1	5	6
Recreate vacant position	4	4	8
Downgrade position	1	2	3
Request denied	4	1	5
Other outcome	4	5	9
Total	39	43	82

The first three categories in the above table involved movement of employees in encumbered positions. The remaining categories did not affect encumbered positions (except for the denials).

¹ The report was published in December, 2010. At that time, there were 3 studies regarding positions in the Department of Civil Rights that were not complete. The outcome of the 3 studies are being included in this report, even though they were filed in 2010.

For this report, 55 study requests will be analyzed. The following table outlines the outcomes of the studies that were filed in 2011:

Table 2—Position Study Outcomes 2011

Study Outcome	Represented Position/ Classification affected	Non-Represented Position/ Classification affected	Total
Reclass of individual	4	7	11
Career Ladders	0	3	3
New classification created	1	4	5
New position created	1	8	9
Retitle classification/ position	1	3	4
Recreate vacant position	8	1	9
Withdrawn	4	4	8
Request denied	0	4	4
Other outcome	2	1	2 ²
Total	21	35	55

Movement of Encumbered Positions

Reclass of Individual—There is a general presumption that the result of all position studies involves employees moving to a higher salary range without having to compete. While this can be true, it is not the case in the majority of position studies submitted to Human Resources. Of the 55 position study requests received in 2011, 11 resulted in employees being reallocated to higher classifications and salary ranges without having to compete (not including career ladders or the creation of new classifications). This represents 20% of the total requests received in this period. Four of the 11 reclassifications involved represented employees.

Career Ladders—Of the 55 position study requests in 2011, 3 have been the result of individuals moving through a career ladder, and all 3 involved Engineers or a Traffic Engineer moving through the outlined progression. However, it should be noted that the represented Clerk Typist and Police Report Typist career ladders are established by Ordinance and do not require a formal position study so this number does not include those positions.

² The Other category includes an update to the City of Madison Personnel Rules, which directly affects both represented and non-represented positions so is included in both categories.

New Classifications—In certain cases, a department will determine that an existing classification no longer appropriately describes the work of the department. In 2011, 3 studies resulted in new classifications, affecting 5 study requests. In the Department of Civil Rights, the EOC Investigator/Conciliator series was recreated to include an education/outreach component, which resulted in the elimination of the EO Education and Outreach Specialist classification. The 3 affected employees were recreated into a new series of EO Investigator/Conciliator 1-3, and the incumbents were reallocated to their appropriate levels based on the training/experience levels. In Engineering, it was determined that a new level of Water Resources Specialist was required to reflect additional high-level duties the incumbent was performing. In Building Inspection, the represented Weights and Measures Inspector series was studied and a new level was created to reflect higher-level work. The incumbents were reallocated to the proper range as a result of this study.

Of the 55 position study requests in 2011, 5 resulted in the creation of new classifications and the reallocation of the incumbents to the appropriate levels within the new classification. One of these studies involved represented classifications, but that study affected 3 positions.

The previous discussion involved those position study requests that actually resulted in employees being moved to a new classification and salary range. This represents a total of 19 of the 55 study requests (35%) received in Human Resources in 2011.

Outcomes Resulting in No Change to Encumbered Positions

New Positions—Many times, a department will create a new position and then ask Human Resources to place the new position within the Classification and Compensation Plans. In other cases, the department will ask for additional FTE within existing classifications. These types of requests do not result in individuals being reclassified. Rather, these requests normally involve vacant positions and after the request has been approved, the position is posted and filled through competition. In certain cases, the new position will be posted for internal competition within a department and the underlying vacancy will be eliminated to fund the new position.

Of the 55 position study requests in 2011, 9 resulted in the creation of new positions. Of the 9, 1 study resulted in the creation of a new represented positions. Most of the non-represented study

requests involved deleting underlying vacancies so of the 8 remaining studies, only 3 actually resulted in an increase in FTE.

Retitle Classifications or Positions—In certain cases, a classification title fails to appropriately describe the work of the classification. In other cases, a position within a classification may have changed such that the position is performing the work of another classification in the same salary range. When this happens, the classification or position will be retitled to appropriately reflect the work. For instance, the 2 managerial position in Information Technology, Data Center Manager and Systems and Programming Manager, were considered out of date in the world of Information Technology. As such, they were retitled to Technical Services Manager and Applications Development Manager, respectively. A change in title does not result in a change of salary when the position or classification stays in the same salary range.

Of the 55 position study requests in 2011, 4 involved a title change without any change in compensation.

Recreate Vacant Positions—Once a position becomes vacant, the department is required to update the position description and send it along with the certification request for the purpose of recruitment. In some cases, this updating process causes the department to adjust the duties and responsibilities leading to a position study. In other cases, when Human Resources receives and reviews the cert and position description, it is determined that the position description no longer actually reflects the classification. In these cases, Human Resources will conduct a position study resulting in a change in classification. However, because the position is vacant, no employee is affected. Rather this is accomplished before the position is posted.

Of the 55 position study requests in 2011, 9 involved vacant positions being reclassified and placed in a higher salary range prior to the position being posted and filled through competition. Eight of those studies resulted in represented positions being placed in a similar or higher salary range. A number of these studies resulted in new represented classifications being created, such as the Playground Technician and Conservation Technician in Parks, or the Communication Operations Leadworker in Traffic Engineering.

Denials—As mentioned earlier, the department initiates the position study process for encumbered positions. There are times when a department believes that changed duties and

responsibilities should result in a change in classification. Other times, the supervisor does not believe a position has changed but the employee puts in the study request per the Personnel Rules. Regardless of the supervisor's position, Human Resources will conduct a study of the position based on the duties and responsibilities outlined in the position description. The duties and responsibilities are what we base our conclusions on, within the context of the criteria listed in the Personnel Rules. There are times when we receive a position study request and determine that the position remains appropriately classified regardless of the changed duties and responsibilities. In those cases, Human Resources will prepare a memo outlining our conclusions and what the conclusion is based on.

Of the 55 position study requests in 2011, 4 resulted in no change to the incumbent or classification, and all affected non-represented positions.

Other Miscellaneous Results—The preceding categories were the major results of the position studies in 2011. Certain studies did not fit neatly into the above categories and will be discussed briefly in this section.

- New Compensation Group-(1) The Library Pages voted in 2010 to be represented by AFSCME. Once the results were official, a new compensation group needed to be created to reflect their represented status. Compensation Group 31 was created for Library Page.
- Withdrawn-(8) Eight requests were withdrawn or processing was stopped for various reasons before a conclusion could be reached.
- The Personnel Rules were updated in 2011 to reflect changes as a result of the passage of Act 10/32 by the State of Wisconsin. The significant change was to update the procedure for appealing discipline/termination to include a process for raising safety concerns.

Position Study Requests by Department

Concerns have been raised in the past that certain departments receive a greater benefit from the position study process than other departments. As can be seen from the table below, 17 departments requested position studies in 2011, out of a total of 30 departments city-wide. The number of studies in a given year may vary by department depending on whether a reorganization is occurring within that department. However, all studies are evaluated based on

the factors outlined in the Personnel Rules. It is apparent that departments are aware of the position study process and have been requesting studies as situations dictate.

Table 3—Position Study Requests by Department/Division

Department/Division	2011 Study Requests
Fire	
Police	3
Public Health	
Common Council Office	
Mayor's Office	
Municipal Court	
Dept. of Civil Rights	3
City Attorney's Office	
Assessor's Office	
Clerk's Office	1
Treasurer's Office	
Finance Department	5
Information Technology	4
Human Resources	3 ³
Overture Center	1
Monona Terrace	6
Engineering	6
Parks	5
Streets	
Water Utility	1
Metro Transit	
Traffic Engineering/ Parking	4
Fleet Service	
PCED	
Office of the Director	
Planning Division	2
Building Inspection	1
Economic Development Division	
CDA/Housing	2
Community Development Division	3
Library	5
Totals	55

³ This total includes the Personnel Rules update, which actually affects all departments.

Conclusion

Much goes into the position study process and as can be seen in this report, a variety of outcomes are possible. In an average year less than 2% of the total positions in the City are impacted by the position study process (2% in 2011), and less than 1% of encumbered positions are reclassified (0.6% in 2011). In addition, the position study process is designed so that it does not have a significant impact on the City's Operating Budget. Departments are required to develop a funding plan for any salary increases that result from a position study. Finally, the studies are spread out among the various City departments/divisions.