



City of Madison Planning Division
215 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | Room LL.100 | P.O. Box 2985 | Madison, WI 53701-2985

Madison Landmarks Commission APPLICATION

1. LOCATION

Project Address: 1438 Rutledge St. Madison 53703 Aldermanic District: 6

2. PROJECT

Date Submitted: 2/25/14

Project Title / Description: Exterior Improvements - siding, trim, stucco, soffits + windows

This is an application for: (check all that apply)

- Alteration / Addition to a Designated Madison Landmark
- Alteration / Addition to a building adjacent to a Designated Madison Landmark
- Alteration / Addition to a building in a Local Historic District (specify):
 - Mansion Hill
 - University Heights
 - Third Lake Ridge
 - Marquette Bungalows
 - First Settlement
- New Construction in a Local Historic District (specify):
 - Mansion Hill
 - University Heights
 - Third Lake Ridge
 - Marquette Bungalows
 - First Settlement
- Demolition
- Variance from the Landmarks Ordinance
- Referral from Common Council, Plan Commission, or other referral
- Other (specify): _____

3. APPLICANT

Applicant's Name: Rob Van Nevel + Tony Jamieson Company: N/A
 Address: 1438 Rutledge St City/State: Madison / WI Zip: 53703
 Telephone: 608-335-4821 (Rob) E-mail: robvannevel@yahoo.com
 Property Owner (if not applicant): _____
 Address: _____ City/State: _____ Zip: _____

Property Owner's Signature: [Signature] Date: 2/25/14

GENERAL SUBMITTAL REQUIREMENTS

Twelve (12) collated paper copies and electronic (.pdf) files of the following: (Note the filing deadline is 4:30 PM on the filing day)

- Application
- Brief narrative description of the project
- Scaled plan set reduced to 11" x 17" or smaller pages. Please include:
 - Site plan showing all property lines and structures
 - Building elevations, plans and other drawings as needed to illustrate the project
 - Photos of existing house/building
 - Contextual information (such as photos) of surrounding properties
- Any other information that may be helpful in communicating the details of the project and how it complies with the Landmarks Ordinance, including the impacts on existing structures on the site or on nearby properties.

Questions? Please contact the
 Historic Preservation Planner:
 Amy Scanlon
 Phone: 608.266.6552
 Email: ascanlon@cityofmadison.com

NOTICE REGARDING LOBBYING ORDINANCE: If you are seeking approval of a development that has over 40,000 square feet of non-residential space, or a residential development of over 10 dwelling units, or if you are seeking assistance from the City with a value of \$10,000 (including grants, loans, TIF or similar assistance), then you likely are subject to Madison's lobbying ordinance (Sec. 2.40, MGO). You are required to register and report your lobbying. Please consult the City Clerk's Office for more information. Failure to comply with the lobbying ordinance may result in fines.

**Madison Landmarks Commission Application
Narrative Description of the Project**



**Marquette Bungalows
1438 Rutledge Street**

History & Background

Homeowners Rob Van Nevel, Tony Jamieson and their son Chance have made 1438 Rutledge Street their home since December 2007. However, the love affair with the Marquette Bungalows actually began over 25 years ago in 1990 when Rob first discovered them as an undergraduate student at UW-Madison. While bicycling around Lake Monona and passing down Rutledge Street, Rob dreamed of someday calling one of the bungalows home for himself and his future family.

Since purchasing the home, Rob and Tony have converted the residence from a two-flat rental property back to its original design as a single-family, owner-occupied home. In each and every year since, the pair has made improvements and investments as they work to restore their home to its original splendor. Among the long list of projects was a 2008 extensive remodel completed by Associated Housewrights, which received Madison Landmarks Commission Approval. Most of the improvements were visible only on the inside of the home, but did involve some minor changes to the exterior rear of the home: new replacement windows, exterior wall bump out for a gas fireplace addition, removal of a brick furnace chimney and addition of a Solatube tubular daylighting device.

Now, the homeowners would like to improve the home's exterior appearance. A fair amount of work from the decades preceding the designation of the historic district needs to be undone to reveal the true charm and beauty of the bungalow. This project entails addressing the existing siding, soffits, trim and windows. The roof was replaced with Landmarks Commission approved architectural shingles as part of the 2008 remodel and is therefore not in the scope of this project.

The scope of work proposed for this project is limited to the repair and replacement of the existing home building materials. The scope of work does not include any structural additions or changes to the existing home. As a result, a scaled plan set is not included with this narrative; rather, photo images of the existing home are included to illustrate the affected siding, trim, stucco, soffits, and windows. These photo images can be found in the Appendix.

Siding, Trim & Stucco

Aluminum siding in a 4" profile is currently in place on the home. The exterior trim is a mixture of original wood and aluminum trim. Based on the chalky, weathered appearance of the siding and trim, it is estimated to be several decades old. Photo images of the siding, trim and stucco can be found in the Appendix. The existing siding will be removed by the Contractor. Once removed, the contractor will install ½" Tuff-R insulation and tape all seams. The Contractor will install pre-finished L.P. Smart Side Lap Siding in a 3" profile to mirror the profile of original wood siding found on other Marquette Bungalows. Aluminum trim and damaged wood trim will be removed and replaced with Pre-Finished L.P. Smart Side 5/4" x 4" Trim Boards on the exterior of all window and door openings. All wood damaged wood fascia boards will be replaced by the Contractor with L.P. Smart Trim 1" x 8" & 1" x 10" Fascia Boards. Damaged crown molding on dormers will be replaced with matching wood crown molding by the Contractor. The pre-finish color for siding is planned to be sage green and the trim is planned to be a cream almond. These colors are in keeping with the neighborhood palette.

There is a portion of the street-facing front of the home with a stucco exterior. The stucco is in good condition and will be painted sage green to match the L.P. Smart Side Lap Siding. If additional original stucco is discovered when the existing aluminum siding is removed, Contractor will repair or replace this material as needed. The intent through this project is to restore the home to its original appearance to the degree reasonably possible. The original wood trim adjacent to the stucco appears to be in good condition. Contractor will replace any damaged wood trim with matching wood trim boards painted in cream almond to match the rest of the home's trim.

Soffits

The existing aluminum soffit panels will be removed by the contractor. Photo images of the soffit material can be found in the Appendix. This material is in place on all parts of the home, with the exception of the street-facing front of the home. In this area, the original wood beadboard soffits are intact. They are painted dark walnut brown. The Contractor believes original wood beadboard soffit material may be found upon removal of the aluminum soffit panels. The Contractor will assess the condition of any original wood beadboard soffit and will leave undisturbed all existing wood beadboard in good condition. The Contractor will replace any damaged material with new wood beadboard. The beadboard soffits will be painted a dark walnut brown to match the color of the original wood beadboard soffits in place at the street-facing front of the home.

Painting

As noted in preceding sections the home is planned to have a sage green primary color associated with siding and stucco. Cream almond will be the secondary color associated with trim and fascia boards. The home features a small number of wood corbels and accent pieces which will be painted a complimentary color intended to accentuate these design elements.

Upon completion of the work affecting siding, trim, stucco, soffits, and windows, the homeowners will engage a painting contractor to correct and finish all painting details on the home to insure a high quality and unified appearance. In addition, this contractor will paint the detached garage and the screen porch, which is attached to the house. Aside from painting, neither of these two structures will be affected by the other project work described herein.

Windows

Current State

With the exception of the seven replacement windows installed as part of the Landmarks Commission approved 2008 remodel, the remaining windows which number 35 appear to be original to the home. The glass in the windows shows minimal character imperfections such as wavy appearance, seeding, etc. There are three windows with a curved top on the front of the home and no leaded-glass windows on the home exterior. The remaining windows are primarily three types: double hung cottage style 2:3 ratio, double hung cottage style 2:3 ratio with full divided light colonial grill, and double hung framed windows. Photo images of all of the windows can be found in the Appendix.

Through years of use as a rental property, these windows have seen much wear and little care along the way. Most of the window sashes and muntins have been painted black on the outside of the home. The glazing putty has deteriorated over time allowing water to infiltrate and degrade the wood in some cases. All of the upstairs windows have been painted white on the inside of the home, as have a few of the first floor windows. The remaining first floor windows have seen some sun and water damage, but retain vestiges of their original stain and varnish. Various windows throughout the home are inoperable, semi-operable or fully operable. Lead paint tests have confirmed the presence of lead in paint on windows throughout the home. The windows to varying degrees are loose in their frames, drafty, and rattle when the wind blows. The weight and pulley systems in most of the windows need to be repaired to prevent the sashes from falling shut unexpectedly when they are opened. Some excessive gaps between sashes and frames need to be fixed to prevent bats from gaining access to the home at night.

The three curved windows on the second story front of the home have original corresponding wood framed storms and screens. The horizontal wood divider in the storms aligns with that of the windows so as to provide a consistent, unified appearance from inside and outside the home. All of the remaining original storm windows and screens have been lost or discarded over the years by previous property owners. Most of the remaining windows have been outfitted with a fixed replacement combination storm and screen. Based on the appearance of these replacement combinations, they are estimated to be several decades old. The frames are unpainted aluminum and the 1:1 ratio of the top to bottom sashes creates a horizontal divider in the combination unit that does not align with the original windows on the home which are of a 2:3 ratio. This creates an inconsistent and partially obstructed appearance from inside and outside the home. Because the replacement combinations are fixed in place, window cleaning is not possible. For unknown reasons, a few windows were not outfitted with a replacement combination storm and screen. They have simply gone unprotected from the elements.

Repair and Refurbish Existing Windows

After talking with Preservation Planner Amy Scanlon, the homeowners set their sights on a project to repair and refurbish the existing original wood windows, remove the existing replacement combination storms and screens, and build new custom bat-proof storms and screens for all 35 windows in the home. The homeowners have previous experience with the repair and refurbish approach which is detailed in the next paragraph.

In 2009, the homeowners engaged Larry Pinger (DBA Sashman Services) a local respected craftsman who specializes in repairing and refurbishing historic windows in Madison. At a cost of \$500 per window (\$1,500 total), the curved windows and their storms on the second story street facing front of the home were repaired and refurbished: weight and pulley system, damaged sash, cracked glass, and new glazing putty. While the quality of the repairs was good, the homeowners are not satisfied with the outcome of the repair/refurbish work which. The windows are still drafty, rattle in the wind, allow excessive condensation to build-up and have a shabby appearance. There is a continued safety concern regarding the presence of lead paint. When the sashes are raised and lowered the movement and friction creates a fine dust which likely contains lead and could easily be ingested. The homeowners have a 4-year old son and are in the process of adopting a baby.

To overcome their previous disappointing experience with the repair and refurbish approach, the homeowners engaged Associated Housewrights to prepare a bid for this project: repair and refurbish the existing original wood windows, remove the existing replacement combination storms and screens, and build new custom bat-proof storms and screens for all 35 windows in the home. Associated Housewrights appears on the Madison Trust for Historic Preservation preferred contractor list and was the company that completed the homeowner's 2010 remodel project. Associated Housewrights provided a bid for the project that resulted in a cost estimate of \$1,893.12 per window. The bid includes a disclaimer that additional cost may be incurred based on discoveries made through the project work. The homeowners believe this disclaimer to be realistic and appropriate while also recognizing the cost per window could easily climb to \$2,000 or more. In fact, the final cost of the homeowner's previous remodel project with Associated Housewrights was more than 20% higher than the original bid. If this cost overrun were applied to the project, it would mean the cost per window is closer to \$2,275. Associated Housewrights will follow lead-safe work practices but are unable to insure the containment of lead on the existing window materials even after their work. Based on the prohibitively high cost of the repair and refurbish plan and on the ongoing lead-safety concerns for the safety of their young children, the homeowners explored an alternative approach: remove and replace the existing windows with replacement window inserts.

Remove Existing Windows and Install Renewal by Anderson Replacements

The contractor will remove the existing 35 windows from the home's first, second and basement levels and install Andersen replacement inserts. Through this work, the original appearance of curved top windows on the front of the house will be retained. All replacement windows throughout the home will duplicate the original in size, configuration and appearance including true muntins. In some cases where original windows are 1:1 ratio double hung with no muntins, the homeowners plan to replace them with double hung cottage style 2:3 ratio windows with full divided light colonial grill. This improvement will enhance the interior and exterior appearance of these windows and better unify the window design throughout the house.

To complete this project, the Contractor will install 32 Renewal by Andersen Fibrex Composite framed windows throughout the house. In addition, the Contractor will install 3 Andersen Eagle Unequal Leg Arch Single Hung windows with SDL Grilles to replace the existing curve top windows on the second story, street-side front of the house.

In all cases, the size, specification and muntins configuration of the replacement window will match the existing windows with a high degree of accuracy and precision. All installations will include close spray foam insulation. The exterior of all windows will be dark brown to match the color of the beadboard soffit. Window trim will match the existing original window trim on the house. All windows will have High Performance Low-E4 Smart Sun Argon filled Double Pane

Glass. All windows will have Tru-Scene insect screens, which has the highest rating for transparency to maximize visibility of the windows themselves.

The Contractor provided a bid for the project that resulted in a cost estimate of \$1,093.75 per window. The bid includes a disclaimer that additional cost may be incurred based on discoveries made through the project work. The homeowners believe this disclaimer to be realistic and appropriate while also recognizing the cost per window will likely be more than the initial estimate. If the historic cost overruns of +20% with Associated Housewrights is applied here, it would mean the cost per window is closer to \$1,300.

Final Decision for Landmarks Commission Approval: Remove and Replace

Upon careful consideration, the homeowners believe that removing the existing windows and installing Renewal by Anderson replacements to be the better option for the following reasons:

- Lead safety concerns with young children in the household are better addressed by removing the existing lead paint windows and the contaminated dust that is generated by their moving sashes.
- The repair and refurbish approach is prohibitively expensive compared to the replacement option. The average cost to repair, refurbish, and build new storms and screens is \$799.37 and 73% more expensive per window than the replacement cost.
- Similar to the existing original windows, replacement windows also possess the charm and character of the play of light and shadow across the exterior muntins.
- The existing windows do not possess desirable imperfections like waviness and seeding, so we are not compromising the integrity of the historic district by removing them.
- Other safety concerns for our family with young children like bat-proof windows and falling sashes caused by faulty weight and pulley systems are better addressed with replacement windows.
- Drafts, wind-induced rattling sashes and condensation problems will be eliminated with replacement windows.

Closing Summary

Though this remodel project the homeowners will transform 1438 Rutledge Street into a beautiful home within the Marquette Bungalows Historic District. They will remove aluminum siding and trim and replace it with painted wood. Aluminum soffits will be removed and wood beadboard will be restored. Unpainted aluminum replacement combination storms and screens will be stripped off. In their place will be color-matched-to-soffit windows that expertly match the original window look, feel and configuration. A new coat of paint will unify all the work and make the home really shine. The investment made by the homeowners may very well motivate and inspire their neighbors to improve and protect the Marquette bungalows they call home. Thank you for your consideration and support with this project.

Appendix



1. Front of home from left angle



2. Front of home from right angle



3. Neighboring home to the left for context.



4. Neighboring home to the right for context.



5. Front door and windows – maintain existing; no changes at this time



6. 2nd Floor Front Windows – replace with matching curved Andersen windows



7. 1st Floor Front Windows - replace with matching Renewal by Andersen



8. 1st Floor Side Vestibule Windows - replace with matching Renewal by Andersen



9. 1st Floor Left Side - replace with matching Renewal by Andersen windows; replace siding with L.P. Smart Side 3" profile lap siding; replace aluminum soffit with wood beadboard soffit



10. 2nd Floor Left Side Dormer - replace with matching Renewal by Andersen windows; replace siding with L.P. Smart Side 3" profile lap siding; replace aluminum soffit with wood beadboard soffit



11. Left Side Basement Windows - replace with matching Andersen windows



12. 1st Floor Kitchen Windows – maintain existing Marvin replacement windows; replace siding with L.P. Smart Side 3” profile lap siding; replace aluminum soffit with wood beadboard soffit



13. Back of Home – maintain existing Marvin replacement windows on kitchen; replace 2nd floor windows with Renewal by Andersen cottage style 2:3 ratio with full divided light colonial grill; paint existing screened porch to match new siding color and integrate more fully into home's appearance



14. Back of Home – replace 2nd floor windows with Renewal by Andersen cottage style 2:3 ratio with full divided light colonial grill; paint existing screened porch to match new siding color; paint garage to match new siding color



15. Right Side of Home – windows, siding and soffit



16. 1st Floor Right Side Windows - replace with matching Renewal by Andersen



17. 1st Floor Right Side Windows – replace first two large (bedroom) windows with Renewal by Andersen cottage style 2:3 ratio with full divided light colonial grill; replace third large (bathroom) window with Renewal by Andersen picture window with beaded privacy glass.



18. 2nd Floor Right Side - replace with matching Renewal by Andersen windows; replace siding with L.P. Smart Side 3" profile lap siding; replace aluminum soffit with wood beadboard soffit



19. 1st Floor Right Side Kitchen – maintain existing Marvin replacement windows; paint gas fireplace vent cover to match color of siding; replace siding with L.P. Smart Side 3” profile lap siding; replace aluminum soffit with wood beadboard soffit