



**Project Name & Address:** 1315 Spaight Street  
**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in a historic district  
**Legistar File ID #** [53600](#)  
**Prepared By:** William Fruhling, Acting Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** December 10, 2018

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Fred Schumacher – A-Team Construction  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to rebuild the front porch and install new siding, trim, gutters, windows and doors.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The site is located at 1315 Spaight Street in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - (i) Height
    - (ii) Landscape treatment
    - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
  - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
  - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
  - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
  - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to rebuild the front porch and install new siding, trim, gutters, windows and doors. Staff has worked with the applicant for several months to provide the necessary information to support the request. One part of the project is to rebuild the deteriorated front porch. Documentation of the current porch, with key measurements, is provided in the application to ensure that new elements will match the existing. Staff earlier worked with the applicant to secure the porch and allow the pouring of a new footing and foundation and temporary supports on the condition that a Certificate of Appropriateness be acquired for the reconstruction.

The request also seeks approval for:

- replacing the current rolled asphalt siding with a double 4" lap vinyl siding
- replacing all windows with new vinyl windows
- replacing the front and rear doors
- installing new gutters and downspouts

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) N/A
  - b) N/A
  - c) The front porch is proposed to be reconstructed to exactly match the current, original front porch in design and materials. The current rolled asphalt siding material is not original and the application states that it is over another (unspecified) style of siding. Presumably the underlying siding is wood clapboard. While the proposed vinyl siding (with faux wood grain) may more closely match the appearance of the original siding, it is clearly not the "original historic materials" cited in this standard. As part of the residing, the applicant is also proposing to wrap the trim in metal to mimic the original

profiles of these elements. Although difficult to determine definitively from the submitted photos, the inventory submitted for the four windows on the front façade (#'s 2, 3, 13, 14) indicate that all do have some amount of sash rot. Aluminum storm windows were added in the 1960s. The front and rear doors proposed to be replaced are non-original metal doors. The gutters are also non-original. Although the entire structure is proposed to be resided and have new windows and gutters installed, only the above description applies only to the street façade per this standard.

- d) N/A
- e) The door and window openings on the street façade are not proposed to be altered, therefore the existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes will be retained.

## **Recommendation**

Staff believe that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alteration may be met and recommend that the Landmarks Commission approve this request subject to the following conditions:

- 1) Siding shall be smooth faced with no faux wood grain.
- 2) The front porch shall be rebuilt to exactly match the existing porch in all details and materials, reusing existing elements as feasible, and when not feasible elements shall be replicated in kind.