



Project Name/Address: 29 N Spooner Street

Application Type: PUBLIC HEARING Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in historic district

Legistar File ID # [42152](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: March 18, 2016

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Michael Webster, Associated Housewrights

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations involving the construction of a two story rear addition in the University Heights Historic District

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the University Heights Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

41.24 UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (5) Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs in TR-C2, TR-C3, and TR-C4, Zoning Districts.
- (a) Height. No alterations shall be higher than the existing structure; however, if the existing structure is already a nonconforming one, alteration shall be made thereto except in accordance with Section 28.192 of the Madison General Ordinances. Roof alterations resulting in an increased structure volume are prohibited unless they meet the requirements in sec. 41.24(4)(a)5. and are permitted under Chapter 28 of the Madison general ordinances, or approved as a variance pursuant to sec. 28.184 or approved as a conditional use or as part of a planned residential development.
 - (b) Second Exit Platforms and Fire Escapes. Second exit platforms and fire escapes shall be invisible from the street, wherever possible, and shall be of a plain and unobtrusive design in all cases. In instances where an automatic combustion products detection and alarm system is permitted as an alternative to second exits, use of such a system shall be mandatory.
 - (c) Repairs. Materials used in exterior repairs shall duplicate the original building materials in texture and appearance, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the existing building materials where the existing building materials differ from the original. Repairs using materials that exactly duplicate the original in composition are encouraged.
 - (d) Restoration. Projects that will restore the appearance of a structure to its original appearance are encouraged and will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if such projects are documented by photographs, architectural or archeological research or other suitable evidence.
 - (e) Re-Siding. Re-siding with aluminum or vinyl that replaces or covers clapboards or nonoriginal siding on structures originally sided with clapboards will be approved by the Landmarks Commission provided that the new siding imitates the width of the original clapboard siding to within one (1) inch and provided further that all architectural details including, but not limited

to, window trim, wood cornices and ornament either remain uncovered or are duplicated exactly in appearance. Where more than one layer of siding exists on the structure, all layers except the first must be removed before new siding is applied. If insulation is applied under the new siding, all trim must be built up so that it projects from the new siding to the same extent it did with the original siding.

- (f) Alterations Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. Alterations visible from the street, including alterations to the top of structures, and alterations to street facades shall be compatible with the existing structure in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion and rhythm of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials used in such alterations shall duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details used therein shall duplicate in design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the existing structure or of other structures in University Heights of similar materials, age and architectural style, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the texture and appearance of materials and the design of architectural details used in the existing structure where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side alterations shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade.
- (g) Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. Additions and exterior alterations that are not visible from any streets contiguous to the lot lines upon which the structure is located will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if their design is compatible with the scale of the existing structure and, further, if the materials used are compatible with the existing materials in texture, color and architectural details. Additions and alterations shall harmonize with the architectural design of the structure rather than contrast with it.
- (h) Roof Shape. The roof shape of the front of a structure shall not be altered except to restore it to the original documentable appearance or to add a dormer or dormers in a location and shape compatible with the architectural design of the structure and similar in location and shape to original dormers on structures of the same vintage and style within the district. Alterations of the roof shape of the sides or back of a structure shall be visually compatible with the architectural design of the existing structure.
- (i) Roof Material.
1. If the existing roof is tile, slate or other material that is original to the structure and/or contributes to its historic character, all repairs thereto shall be made using the same materials. In addition, in all cases any such roof must be repaired rather than replaced, unless the documented cost of repair exceeds the documented cost of re-roofing with a substitute material that approximates the appearance of the original roofing material as closely as possible, in which case re-roofing with a material that approximates the appearance of the original roofing material as closely as possible will be approved by the Landmarks Commission.
 2. If the existing roofing material is asphalt shingles, sawn wood shingles or a nonhistoric material such as fiberglass, all repairs shall match in appearance the existing roof material; however, if any such roof is covered or replaced, re-roofing must be done using rectangular sawn wood shingles or rectangular shingles that are similar in width, thickness and apparent length to sawn wood shingles, for example, 3-in-1 tab asphalt shingles. Modern style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, dutch lap, french method and interlock shingles, that are incompatible with the historic character of the district are prohibited.
 3. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the ground.

Analysis and Conclusion

A brief discussion of the related sections of 41.24(5) follows:

- (a) Height. The proposed addition will not be higher than the existing ridge.
- (b) Second Exit Platforms and Fire Escapes. N/A
- (c) Repairs. N/A
- (d) Restoration. N/A
- (e) Re-Siding. N/A
- (f) Alterations Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. The proposed addition is visible from the street along one side, but is mostly not visible from the street. The addition is compatible with the existing structure in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion and rhythm of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. The proportion of the proposed windows on the north elevation has a vertical orientation and does not match the proportion and orientation of the existing windows on the north elevation. The drawings indicate that the proposed materials will match the existing materials as closely as possible and duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details those materials used on the existing building. The proposed rear addition is being located in a place that is common for expansion and will not destroy significant architectural features.
- (g) Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. The proposed addition is visible from the street along one side, but is mostly not visible from the street. The remaining portion of the addition has a design that is compatible with the scale of the existing structure and the materials are compatible with the existing materials in texture, color and architectural details. The proposed rear addition harmonizes with the architectural design of the structure. The rear porch roof and bracket are shown very high on the wall.
- (h) Roof Shape. The roof shape on the front of the existing building is not being altered. The roof shape on the proposed addition is visually compatible with the existing building.
- (i) Roof Material. The addition roof material will be asphalt shingles to match in appearance the existing adjacent roof material.

Recommendation

Staff believes the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed addition are met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

1. The proportion of the proposed windows on the north elevation shall have a glass proportion and vertical or square orientation that matches the existing windows on the north elevation.
2. The applicant shall describe the finish of the foundation wall. The south elevation does not show the foundation material and the siding.
3. The applicant shall confirm that the window adjacent to the fireplace will remain visible from the exterior. The elevation drawing does not show it.
4. The rear porch roof and bracket are shown very high on the wall and should be lowered to have a more appropriate relationship to the exterior door. This shift will require that the adjacent windows be moved to the east.