

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: February 18, 2009
TITLE: 425 West Washington Avenue – PUD(GDP-SIP) to Construct a Mixed-Use Development. 4 th Ald. Dist. (13147)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: William A. Fruhling, Acting Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: February 18, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods; Chair, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, Dawn Weber, Mark Smith, Jay Ferm, Ald. Marsha Rummel and John Harrington.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of February 18, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) for a mixed-use development at 425 West Washington Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project were David Ferch, Erik Minton, and Bill White. Ferch stated that the neighborhood steering committee for this project has met since the last Commission meeting, but a bigger neighborhood meeting is scheduled for February 19. The revised plans include an updated landscaping plan, the removal of the balcony above the health club entry, and a study for treatment of the fifth floor sun screen. Ferch noted that he has not yet revisited the first floor windows on the south and east facades or the railing designs as requested by the Commission, but did look at locating more bicycle parking on the first floor and decided it wasn't necessary. White spoke to the neighborhood process, noting that they are requesting initial approval and that changes may be made based on comments from the neighborhood, staff, and others. Minton stated that he has already delayed the Plan Commission review and would like initial approval to allow the project to be reviewed at the next Plan Commission meeting.

Ald. Mike Verveer and Jonathan Cooper (representing the Bassett Neighborhood Steering Committee for this project) requested referral of the project to allow for a larger neighborhood meeting that is scheduled for the next day.

The Commission discussion focused on the following issues:

- Whether the scale and massing of the building comply with the recommendations of the adopted *Bassett Neighborhood Master Plan* and the *Comprehensive Plan*. A focus of this discussion was whether the fifth floor was consistent with these plans.
- Whether this request should be referred until the next meeting to allow for the scheduled meeting of the larger neighborhood.

Registering in support were: Tom Geier, Chet Droessler, Robert Bergeman, Aaron Abplanalo, Judy Karofsky, Rosemary Lee, and Sheridan Glen. Registering in opposition was: Peter Ostlind. Registering in neither support nor opposition was: Ledell Zellers.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Smith, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) for a mixed-use development at 425 West Washington Avenue.

The motion passed on a vote of (4-3-1) with Rummel, Harrington and Ferm voting no, and Woods abstaining. (Wagner and Luskin were absent for this case.)

Note: Prior to the prevailing (substitute) motion, a motion was made by Rummel, seconded by Ferm, to refer the request.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6.5, 7, 7, 7, 7 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 425 West Washington Avenue

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	7	7	7	-	-	-	8	8
	-	7	-	-	-	-	7	7
	7	7	7	6	-	6	6	7
	-	7	7	-	-	5	8	7
	7	7	7	-	-	-	7	7
	6	6.5	5	6	6	6	7	6.5
	-	6.5	-	-	-	-	-	5

General Comments:

- The building fits the neighborhood character both in aesthetics and in use.
- Feel massing is within the spirit of the neighborhood plan.
- View developed.
- Public process needs to be respected. UDC has sent a message to neighborhood that their input is not important. It's unfortunate that a great project is marred by poor process.
- The funny hat on the corner is not needed. This is a fine infill building and will prove to be a real benefit and a positive for the Bassett neighborhood.
- This is a transitional street, with several historic buildings which forms the basis for the Bassett Plan and Comprehensive Plan recommendations, not what is on West Main Street or the 300 Block of West Washington, etc. Find a way to comply with four stories.