

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: October 18, 2006
TITLE: 4801 Tradewinds Parkway – Modifications to Previously Approved Plans, New Construction in Urban Design District No. 1, Multi-Tenant Office/Production Facility. 16 th Ald. Dist. (02884)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: October 18, 2006	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Lou Host-Jablonski, Lisa Geer, Todd Barnett, Michael Barrett, Robert March, Ald. Noel Radomski and Bruce Woods.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 18, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration to modifications to previously approved plans for new multi-tenant office/production facility in Urban Design District No. 1 located at 4801 Tradewinds Parkway. Appearing on behalf of the project were John Cain and Dennis Bauer. Prior to the presentation, staff noted to the Commission that the modifications to the previously approved plans under consideration were follow-up to the Commission's approval of the project at its March 8, 2006 meeting, in addition to subsequent minor elevational and material changes approved administratively by staff. The current level of modifications to the project combined with those previously administratively approved by staff, were considered to be more appropriately dealt with formally by the Commission. Cain provided an overview of the various modifications to the exterior building elevations, as well as its interior court as follows:

- Elimination of a glass curtain wall on the north elevation in favor of punched window openings, combined with an extended roof overhang and angle brackets at the second level, in addition to the use of two different brick colors.
- On the west elevation, extended the use of face brick across the entire elevation with the elimination of tilt-up concrete while maintaining the split face block masonry base.
- In the interior courtyard area, the originally proposed precast with masonry base is now EIFS with a split face block base.

Following the presentation, the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- Wrap corner from the west elevation to the south elevation with masonry to return where it meets EIFS.
- The new design loses common attributes between various building components.
- Consider switching the location of dark brick versus light brick to give more of a feel of depth; place dark brick in recesses with light brick in projections.
- Prefer original scheme; a lot bolder and liked vocabulary. As currently proposed it loses vocabulary between the different elevations, and doesn't read as one project.
- The two colors make it look like other commercial buildings, prefer dark brick, prefer roof without brackets, as well as the previously proposed glass curtain wall and entry treatment. Suggest return of the

glass curtain wall combined with the use of spandrel panels at the second floor level for the screening of desks.

- The extended porch/balcony ties better with the original glass curtain wall design.
- Provide a roof overhang on all elevations to match the front façade. The extended balcony appears to be tacked on.
- Prefer front elevation without the brackets but need detail to tie into building architecture.
- OK on EIFS above grade on backside.

ACTION:

On a motion by Host-Jablonski, seconded by Barrett, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (8-0). The motion to refer cited the preference for the new option which needed further study and more work. The motion required address of the above stated requirements and the following:

- Resolving the issue with the deck/balcony on the north elevation, including the restudy of the brackets and roof overhang.
- The provision of a roof overhang on the west elevation, as well as tower elements to provide more height and prominence or consideration of alternatives.
- Determine if the switch in masonry colors is possible based on available quantity.
- Consideration of roof overhangs on one story portions of the building on all building elevations.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 6, 6, 6, 6.5 and 6.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 4801 Tradewinds Parkway

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	7	6	-	-	-	-	6	6
	-	5	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	6	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	6	-	-	-	-	6	6
	-	6	-	-	-	-	7	6.5
	-	6.5	-	-	-	-	-	6.5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Great changes, needs a little bit of work to bring it all together.
- The revised design doesn't really jell yet.
- Proposed façade much more attractive with the additional architectural details and brick. Switch brick colors to darker in recess and lighter on protruding walls to increase the appearance of depth.
- Revise per our comments.
- On the whole, improved but needs tweaking.
- Prefer previous design; look at roof overhangs, brackets, balcony overhang.