

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: March 18, 2009
TITLE: 600 Block East Johnson Street – PUD-SIP for Deconstruction and Construction of New Residential Buildings. 2 nd Ald. Dist. (13146)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: March 18, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Mark Smith, Dawn Weber, Ron Luskin, Jay Ferm, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett and Bruce Woods.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of March 18, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of a PUD-SIP in the 600 Block of East Johnson Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Richard Linster and Patrick McDonnell, both representing the Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Association; J. Randy Bruce, representing Stone House Development; Abbie Moilien, representing Renaissance Property Group; Joe Lusson, Jonathan Coleman and Michael Matty. The project as presented by Bruce featured the following:

- The current version is a modified approach in regards to density with new residential development to be developed by Stone House Development on the southerly portion of the site with 85 units of affordable housing featuring a drop in density from a previously proposed 114 dwelling units.
- The project still provides for the preservation of existing housing along the property's Gorham Street frontage and provides for the demolition of the remainder of the residential units on the site on southerly portions of the site.
- A previously proposed center townhouse building has now been eliminated with a three component residential building on the Johnson Street frontage of the site that overlays a contiguous lower level parking deck providing parking for all buildings including those buildings to be maintained on Gorham Street.
- The overall building material palette features the use of fiber cement board and masonry.
- All units will have individual entries and porches, in addition to the overall building as a whole having public entry points.

A review of the landscape plan emphasizing the creation of a central public space at mid-block connected by pedestrian routes, bulked up plantings on the roof deck, as well as provisions for public garden plots.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Provide accessible apartments.
- Provide direct access to accessible gardens.
- Identify windows and skylights on the loft level.

Testimony from the public was as follows:

Joe Lusson spoke in opposition, spoke to problems with the bulk of the building still being too massive; need for Stone House to work out remaining issues with the neighborhood, underlying the need for referral of the project and the following:

- Opposition to the demolition of eleven buildings as well as the location of the new structure within 10-feet of the back lot line.
- He noted his appreciation for the number of units but non-support for the overall bulk of the building which remains unchanged. He further noted the building should be pulled back and reduced in height. He noted the existence of many mature trees along the southerly lot's back lot line, requesting their preservation with a 20-25 foot building setback from the rear lot line.
- He further noted the need to reduce the amount of underground parking and reduce the size of the combined buildings, in addition to maintaining parking entries and pads on Gorham Street to offset the minimum level of available on-street parking.
- In response to questions from the Commission Lusson further noted that the buildings that could be saved would be 508 Blair Street and the easterly building on Johnson Street.

Following Lusson's testimony Pat McDonnell, president of the Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Association spoke to a memo distributed at the meeting in support of the project. McDonnell noted the following:

- Like design, moving in the right direction but needs address of issues contained in memo.
- Like Urban Design Commission feedback on issues but request referral.

McDonnell, in response to questions by the Commission noted the following:

- Project needs to address the mass and lot line issues.
- The buildings are noted as 3-stories but really 4; need roofline brought down, eliminate the "hat."
- The architectural vernacular appropriate to neighborhood but building is too tall with use of lofts.

Jon Coleman spoke in regards to the project, noting the need to maintain some of the buildings to be deconstructed, one on Blair and a storefront along Johnson Street. Coleman further noted the need to incorporate a storefront on Johnson Street within the new construction. He further noted concern with driveway conflicts with bikes on sidewalks, the driveway to underground parking should be on Blair Street. He requested consideration for more historic architectural features such as a "witches' cap" along with the incorporation of alternative energy sources such as wind and the preservation of one single-family home on Johnson Street. Michael Matty, developer spoke in favor of the project. He noted support at a recent meeting of the Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Association and Kitty Rankin, former Preservation Planner for the proposed demolitions.

Following testimony Bruce noted that grade issues presented providing an entry on Blair Street to the lower level underground parking, as well as any adjustments relevant to the setback issue to the proposed footprint of the building would require that the building actually be increased to a full four-stories where building height is already an issue. Continued discussion by the Commission noted the following:

- Provide at least one stairway connection from parking to the street (one or both).
- Need to see independent report on housing to be demolished.
- Be nice if the green building could be moved.

- Look at providing wheelchair accessibility to the greenspace behind the Gorham houses to be maintained.

ACTION:

On a motion by Rummel, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of the project to address the above stated concerns, including providing a report on the houses to be demolished and deconstructed, as well as a report from Kitty Rankin relevant to the demolition of the buildings, as well as providing additional context for the proposed building in juxtaposition to adjacent residential development and existing residential development to be maintained. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-1) with Luskin voting no.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 600 Block East Johnson Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	7	7	7	8	-	7	6	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	6	7	7	7	-	6	8	7
	6.5	6.5	-	-	-	6.5	7	7

General Comments:

- Connection from garage to street, please.
- Partnership with Stone House allows new direction in design and density. Interested in results of historic structure report and report of preservation planner.
- Much better than first iteration. Building heights are acceptable. Explore wheelchair accessible amenities. Continue to explore ways to bring life to Johnson Street, including exit from parking garage.
- Walk-ups with porches, a very appropriate architectural response. Interior of block is also successful and will be useful to block residents. I'm OK with the density.
- Study public entry, elevate entry façades. Review existing trees and if reducing parking would allow saving trees of value.