



**Project Name & Address:** 848 Jenifer Street  
**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations  
**Legistar File ID #** [69090](#)  
**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** January 4, 2022

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Aaron Monroe, Architectural Building Arts  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject site is a Designated Madison Landmark located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.
- 41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**
- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
  - 1. Height.
  - 2. Landscape treatment.
  - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
- (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
- (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
- (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

**Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation**

- 1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
- 2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
- 4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
- 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- 6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
- 8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**Analysis and Conclusion**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the rear porch, construct new rear entry stairs and awning, replace the rear door, replace the mudroom foundation pier with a poured concrete foundation, and replace the basement stairs and door. This property was designated a Madison Landmark in 2004. Constructed in 1897, the Timothy and Katherine McCarthy residence was designed by Conover and Porter, but Timothy McCarthy, a prominent Madison building contractor, was his own builder. The property was

designated for its Queen Anne style architecture and as the work of master builder, Timothy McCarthy, in partnership with the designing architects.

The proposed work is related to an administrative Certificate of Appropriateness issued on November 15, 2021, which was for repairs and some limited remodeling on the rear of the structure. The scope of the remodel has grown, but focuses on unsympathetic alterations from the 1980s, and replacement of an existing foundation pier with a poured concrete foundation. The foundation work will involve the removal of two nonhistoric basement-level windows.

The single-story wing on the rear of the structure has the porch area on the east enclosed in the 1980s and an ornamented pergola added to the new rear stair. The 1980s enclosure will be remodeled to include a new period-appropriate wood door, concrete steps with metal railings, and a metal and glass awning. The basement access entry will also feature a period-appropriate wood door, concrete stairs with metal railings, and a metal and glass awning. The concrete stairs, metal railings, and metal awnings will all read as new alterations. While these would not be acceptable materials on the front of the landmark structure, they use a similar architectural vocabulary while being distinctively new materials.

The proposal would also remove a flared component between the basement level and the first floor. As shown on the picture below, that flared component was not original to this corner of the rear wing:



Pre-1980s-remodel photo documentation

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

**41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
  - (a) As a designated landmark, the proposed work must meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (b) N/A
  - (c) N/A
  - (d) N/A

**Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**

1. The changes to the property involve minimal changes to the building and site.
2. No historic materials are proposed for removal.
3. The 1980s remodel involved elements that created a false sense of history. This work will remove those elements, restore the areas with historic architectural features and introduce alterations that will be clearly differentiated from the historic while still using the same architectural vocabulary.
4. The 1980s alterations have not acquired historic significance in their own right.
5. N/A.
6. The repair work was already addressed in the administrative CoA issued this past November.
7. N/A.
8. N/A.
9. The exterior alterations do not destroy historic materials and will be clearly differentiated from the historic while being compatible with the character of the historic structure.
10. The new stairs can be removed in the future without impairing the integrity of the historic property.

**Recommendation**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the request as proposed.